

MINUTES
SAN DIEGO COUNTY PLANNING COMMISSION
Regular Meeting – March 19, 2010
DPLU Hearing Room, 9:00 a.m.

The meeting convened at 9:05 a.m., recessed at 10:37 a.m., reconvened at 11:04 a.m., recessed at 12:33 p.m., reconvened at 1:06 p.m. and adjourned at 2:50 p.m.

A. ROLL CALL

Commissioners Present: Beck, Brooks, Day, Norby, Pallinger, Riess, Woods (out at 2:38 p.m.)

Commissioners Absent: None

Advisors Present: Mead, Taylor (OCC); Brazell, Goralka, Lantis, Ortiz (DPW)

Staff Present: Aquino, Baca, Blackson, Gibson, Giffen, Griffith, Grunow, Murphy, Muto, Ramaiya, Real, Sibbet, Steinhoff, Jones (recording secretary)

B. Statement of Planning Commission's Proceedings and Approval Planning Commission Minutes of February 5, February 19 and March 5, 2010

Trailed.

C. Public Communication: Opportunity for members of the public to speak to the Commission on any subject matter within the Commission's jurisdiction but not an item on today's Agenda.

None.

D. Announcement of Handout Materials Related to Today's Agenda Items

E. Requests for Continuance

F. Formation of Consent Calendar: Items 1 (P70-212W², Consent Continuance), 2 (P08-007) and 3 (P08-034)

G. Director's Report:

None provided.

P70-212W², Agenda Item 1:

1. Champagne Lakes RV Resort Expansion, Major Use Permit P70-212W², Valley Center Community Plan Area (continued from January 8, 2010)

Requested Modification of an existing Major Use Permit for a recreational vehicle (RV) park. The entitlements previously granted consist of 135 recreational vehicle spaces with utility hookups, five (5) mobilehome spaces, and other park ancillary structures. The Modification consists of rearranging and developing all 140 of the previously approved RV spaces and mobilehome spaces with full hookup capacity (septic, water, and electricity). Additionally, the applicant requests that 25% of the spaces within the park be reserved for a 90-day occupancy within a twelve-month period, and the remaining 75% to have no occupancy limitation. The occupancy limitations imposed in condition D.6 and Section 6456.d of the Zoning Ordinance would be modified. Section 18865.2 of California Health and Safety Code mandates that local jurisdictions imposing such time limitations for occupancy of spaces within a special occupancy park shall grant an exemption to those limitations depending upon substantial findings within Statute 18865.2. The project site is located at 8310 Nelson Way in the Valley Center Community Plan Area. The site is subject to the General Plan Regional Category Estate Development Area (EDA), Land Use Designation Estate Residential (17). Zoning for the site is A70 Limited Agriculture, with a "B" special area designator and a maximum density of 0.5 dwelling unit per acre.

Staff Presentation: Brown

Proponents: 2; Opponents: 0

Discussion:

Due to the length of today's Agenda, it is recommended that consideration of this Item be postponed.

Action: Riess - Brooks

Continue consideration of Major Use Permit Modification P70-212W² to the meeting of April 2, 2010.

Ayes:	7 -	Beck, Brooks, Day, Norby, Pallinger, Riess, Woods
Noes:	0 -	None
Abstain:	0 -	None
Absent:	0 -	None

P08-007, Agenda Item 2:

2. Guild Residence Wireless Telecommunication Facility, Major Use Permit P08-007, Valley Center Community Plan Area

Proposed Major Use Permit to allow construction and operation of an unmanned wireless telecommunication facility at 33780 Double Canyon Road, within the Valley Center Community Planning Area. The facility would include a 50' tall mono-palm tree onto which six antennas would be mounted. Associated equipment, consisting of one telco cabinet, three equipment cabinets, a power cabinet and a generator receptacle would be surrounded by a 7' tall concrete block wall and a roof. The project is subject to General Plan Regional Category Estate Development Area (EDA), Land Use Designation (18) Multiple Rural Use and is zoned is A70 (Limited Agricultural).

Staff Presentation: Chan

Proponents: 3; Opponents: 0

This Item is approved on consent.

Action: Riess - Woods

Grant Major Use Permit P08-007, and make the Findings and impose the requirements and Conditions as set forth in the Form of Decision.

Ayes: 7 - Beck, Brooks, Day, Norby, Pallinger, Riess, Woods
Noes: 0 - None
Abstain: 0 - None
Absent: 0 - None

P08-007, Agenda Item 2:**3. Gordon Hill Wireless Telecommunication Facility, Major Use Permit P08-034, Valley Center Community Plan Area**

Proposed Major Use Permit to allow construction and operation of an unmanned wireless telecommunication facility at 28407 Gordon Hill Road in the Valley Center Community Plan Area. The facility would include a 35' tall mono-broadleaf tree onto which 12 panel antennas would be mounted. A 7'4" tall, concrete block wall would surround associated equipment, consisting of six equipment cabinets. The project is subject to General Plan Regional Category Estate Development Area (EDA), Land Use Designation (17) Estate Residential, and is zoned A70 (Limited Agricultural).

Staff Presentation: Chan

Proponents: 2; **Opponents:** 1

Discussion:

Staff informs the Planning Commission that the project site contains a single-family residence, an avocado grove and a T-Mobile wireless telecommunications facility. The proposed AT&T wireless telecommunications facility will be located within an existing avocado grove and adjacent to an existing T-Mobile facility. Staff explains that the applicant is required to provide an adequate number of native fire-resistant evergreen broadleaf trees onsite, in the event that the existing avocado grove currently used for buffering and screening is abandoned or cleared. Staff has determined that the project complies with the requirements of the General Plan and all County zoning regulations.

A neighboring property owner voices concerns about the existing T-Mobile facility, and fears that approval of today's project will ultimately create an antenna farm on the site. The applicant's representative clarifies that the neighboring property owner is more concerned about the visual impacts created by the existing T-Mobile facility, and explains that if the T-Mobile monopole must comply with the County's Telecommunications Ordinance by 2013 or co-locate to the facility that will be constructed if the Major Use Permit being discussed today is approved.

P08-007, Agenda Item 2:

Action: Day - Riess

Grant Major Use Permit P08-034, and make the Findings and impose the requirements and Conditions as set forth in the Form of Decision.

Ayes: 7 - Beck, Brooks, Day, Norby, Pallinger, Riess, Woods

Noes: 0 - None

Abstain: 0 - None

Absent: 0 - None

P08-007, Agenda Item 2:

4. Outdoor World Wireless Telecommunication Facility, Major Use Permit P08-014, Boulevard Community Plan Area

Requested Major Use Permit to allow construction and operation of an unmanned wireless telecommunication facility at 37113 Highway 94 in the Boulevard Community Plan Area. The proposed facility would consist of mounting 12 panel antennas and 1 microwave dish antenna inside of a new 30' tall RF transparent faux water tank, which is 16' in diameter. Supporting equipment would be enclosed within a 20' x 11'6" x 10' pre-fabricated equipment enclosure with 2 air conditioning units. The proposed faux water tank and equipment enclosure would be surrounded by an 8' tall CMU wall. The project is subject to the 1.6 Environmentally Constrained Areas (ECA) and the 1.4 Rural Development Area (RDA) General Plan Regional Categories, the (18) Multiple Rural Use Land Use Designation, and is zoned S92 (General Rural).

Staff Presentation: Lubich

Proponents: 3; Opponents: 0

This Item is approved on consent.

Action: Riess - Woods

Grant Major Use Permit P08-014, and make the Findings and impose the requirements and Conditions as set forth in the Form of Decision.

Ayes:	7 -	Beck, Brooks, Day, Norby, Pallinger, Riess, Woods
Noes:	0 -	None
Abstain:	0 -	None
Absent:	0 -	None

P08-007, Agenda Item 2:

5. San Diego Filipino-American Seventh Day Adventist Church, Major Use Permit P69-154W⁴, Sweetwater Community Plan Area

Requested Major Use Permit Modification to allow the demolition of three existing structures and construction of a new 20,600 square-foot, two-story church building. The building would contain a sanctuary with a maximum capacity of 360 persons, multi-purpose hall (gymnasium and church events), classrooms and kitchen. The proposed design includes associated landscaping and 90 parking spaces. The project site is located at 3602 Bonita Road in the Sweetwater Community Plan Area.

Staff Presentation: Griffith

Proponents: 3; Opponents: 0

Discussion:

Staff discusses the Montessori School adjacent to the project site, and explains the need to provide access across the project site. The applicant has agreed that the buildings closest to the school ***. The applicant will continue working with the school representatives in an effort to meet their mass grading and demolition deadlines, but believes the school's requirements are too restrictive.

Action: Woods - Day

Grant Major Use Permit Modification P69-154W⁴, and make the Findings and impose the requirements and Conditions as set forth in the Form of Decision. The Planning Commission also recommends that construction should occur during the summer months and holiday periods to the extent possible, as determined by the applicant. This recommendation does not constitute a condition of approval.

Ayes:	7 -	Beck, Brooks, Day, Norby, Pallinger, Riess, Woods
Noes:	0 -	None
Abstain:	0 -	None
Absent:	0 -	None

P70-379W², Agenda Item 6:**6. Salvation Army, Major Use Permit P70-379W²; Ramona Community Plan Area**

Proposed Major Use Permit Modification to expand an existing camp/retreat on a 578-acre property located at 14488 Mussey Grade Road in the Ramona Community Plan Area. The expansion is planned over the next 20 years and will be contained on a 184-acre area in the central and eastern portion of the property. The proposed new facilities include a cabin camp, a nature/educational camp, staff housing, maintenance facilities, administrative support facilities, a retreat center, recreation areas, trails, open space, parking and improved utilities. The existing camp includes 23 different buildings totaling 33,570 square feet with typical summer occupancy of approximately 200 children. At build-out, the project would include 54 buildings totaling 207,620 square feet with a maximum occupancy of 615 persons.

Staff Presentation: Sibbet, Blackson, Steinhoff

Proponents: 76; **Opponents:** 71

Discussion:

Commissioner Woods informs Staff that he visited the project site to assess project access/egress, and impacts on Mussey Grade Road and Highway 67. Staff reviews the concerns raised by community residents and neighboring property owners. These concerns include land-use compatibility, fire safety, traffic circulation, and secondary access provisions. Staff believes the proposed 20-year expansion of the existing facilities addresses all concerns raised by project opponents. The applicant will incorporate several protection measures to address any wildfires that might occur. These include emergency relocation of all persons onsite if timely notification is received, construction of a shelter-in-place zone for use when early evacuation is not an option, regular brush management, use of ignition-resistant building materials, new fire hydrants, a 650,000-gallon water tank and 24-hour onsite fire safety coordinators. The Planning Commission is reminded that the existing Special Use Permit contains neither maximum occupancy limits nor conditions of approval.

P08-007, Agenda Item 2:

Staff explains that Mussey Grade Road will continue to operate at a safe level of service, and any circulation impacts will be avoided by scheduling facility arrival and departure times during off-peak hours. In addition, the applicant will contribute to the County's Traffic Impact Fee fund. The Planning Commission is reminded that the Ramona Fire District, the Fire Marshall and County Staff have concluded that secondary access is neither feasible nor necessary for this site. Staff also believes the project, located on this 578-acre site, is compatible with surrounding uses, and explains that the proposed structures will not be visible from any vantage point offsite. Staff reminds the Planning Commission that the camp has been in use for decades.

Staff reminds the Planning Commission that the project site is currently zoned to allow 57 residences, which would significantly increase environmental impacts, particularly with respect to traffic. In addition, the applicant proposes to preserve 68% of the site in open space, is avoiding impacts to wildlife corridors, and traffic will only increase by 60 trips per day at build-out. Staff further clarifies that the current fire-safe zone is on Dye Road, which is 25 minutes (round trip) from the facility. Staff explains that the camp will be reviewed annually by the Fire Marshal to ensure code compliance. Emergency communication has improved significantly since 2007, and all facility users will be registered on the reverse 911 system. In addition, all users and visitors are mandated to attend fire safety training provided by the applicant, and the applicant will ensure that an information call center is manned during emergencies.

The Ramona Community Planning Group members, representatives of several other community groups and several community residents are greatly opposed to this project. They believe it is incompatible with surrounding uses and is too large. They also believe the proposed septic system could result in groundwater contamination. They have no faith in the proposed fire protection plans, especially the shelter-in-place component, and point out that the entire southern end of Mussey Grade Road burned in 2003.

Project supporters urge the Planning Commission to approve this project. They believe it is a necessary resource for underprivileged campers, children and senior citizens, and other Salvation Army groups, and will actually benefit the community by improving fire safety in the area. Other users of the facilities will include churches, colleges, universities and service organizations. Project supporters believe the applicant has worked diligently with community representatives and residents in an effort to resolve their concerns. They clarify that the proposal is not a commercial endeavor, as has been alleged by those opposed to the project.

P08-007, Agenda Item 2:

Commissioner Riess questions the rationale of not requiring a secondary access road for this project while requiring it for others, and the applicant clarifies that the proposal is for transient use, not permanent residents. Commissioner Day seeks clarification as whether State law or County regulations allow developments on dead-end roads, and Staff clarifies that both the State and the County fire codes allow development when there are significant land constraints that make secondary access impossible or infeasible, provided certain findings can be made. Staff also clarifies that the County's Consolidated Fire Code is actually stricter than the State's fire code.

Commissioner Woods recommends closure of the children's camp during high-fire season (mid-September through mid-November), and that during the high-fire season, no more than four busloads of renters can be at the facility at one time, and the facility needs to have enough (four) buses to evacuate the renters in one trip. In addition, Commissioner Woods recommends that onsite fire safety coordinators must be approved by the Ramona Fire Chief, and DPLU Staff is to work with the Office of Emergency Services representatives to request Sheriff's Department facilitation of the evacuation of Mussey Grade Road during wildfires. Commissioner Brooks supports these recommendations, and also recommends that Staff meet with Department of Public Works representatives to investigate the feasibility of locating a fire apparatus turn-around facility at or near the terminus of Mussey Grade Road and report back to the Planning Commission.

Commissioner Pallinger recommends support of the project. He applauds the measures taken by the applicant to ensure safety in the event of fires, which appears to be the major concern regarding the project, and notes that he would be comfortable allowing his own grandchildren to attend the camp. Commissioner Norby believes the proposed use is consistent with the surrounding areas, and is less impactful than 57 residences would be. He notes that the Fire Marshal has determined that this project will improve circulation on Mussey Grade Road. Commissioner Norby cautions that this facility might someday become a refuge for residents in this area. However, he would need assurance that enough vehicles are available for evacuation during the 8-10 week period when fire risk is high.

Commissioner Riess believes the proposed three-hour emergency evacuation warning is grossly inadequate. Persons on the project site must be evacuated on the first run. He recommends that Staff obtain an unbiased fire marshal's determination as to whether this project is reasonable without a secondary access. Commissioner Day does not support this recommendation.

P08-007, Agenda Item 2:

Chairman Beck does not believe he can make the findings necessary to approve this project. He notes that the proposed expansion is a significant Modification of the original Special Use Permit. He notes that the uses onsite will change, the scale and bulk of the proposed project is greatly increased, and the project will be a revenue-generating use 10 months of the year.

Action: Day - Norby

Adopt the environmental findings and Grant Major Use Permit P70-379W², which imposes the appropriate requirements and conditions. The applicant is to ensure that enough buses are available during the high-fire period (September to November) to evacuate persons onsite in one trip.

Ayes: 4 - Brooks, Day, Norby, Pallinger
Noes: 2 - Beck, Riess
Abstain: 0 - None
Absent: 1 - Woods

Administrative:

Prior to adjournment of today's hearing, each of the Planning Commissioners thank County Counsel William Taylor for his years of service, dedication and guidance to the Planning Commission.

H. Report on actions of Planning Commission's Subcommittees:

No reports.

I. Upcoming Board of Supervisors Agenda items and Designation of member to represent Commission at Board of Supervisors

March 24th BOS Hearing:

Merriam Mountains Master Planned Community/GPA 04-06/SP04-006/R04-013/VTM5381RPL4/STP 04-035/ER04-08-028/Statement of Reasons /RPO Amendment

Board Resolution for Caltrans Planning Grant Applications

I. Designation of member to represent the Planning Commission at Board of Supervisors meeting(s):

Commissioner Pallinger will represent the Planning Commission at the March 24, 2010 Board of Supervisors meeting.

J. Discussion of correspondence received by the Planning Commission:

There was none.

K. Scheduled Meetings

April 2, 2010	Regular Meeting, 9:00 a.m., DPLU Hearing Room
April 16, 2010	Regular Meeting, 9:00 a.m., DPLU Hearing Room
April 30, 2010	Planning Commission Workshop, 9:00 a.m., DPLU Hearing Room
May 14, 2010	Regular Meeting, 9:00 a.m., DPLU Hearing Room
May 28, 2010	Regular Meeting, 9:00 a.m., DPLU Hearing Room

P08-007, Agenda Item 2:

June 11, 2010	Regular Meeting, 9:00 a.m., DPLU Hearing Room
June 25, 2010	Regular Meeting, 9:00 a.m., DPLU Hearing Room
July 9, 2010	Regular Meeting, 9:00 a.m., DPLU Hearing Room
July 23, 2010	Regular Meeting, 9:00 a.m., DPLU Hearing Room
August 6, 2010	Regular Meeting, 9:00 a.m., DPLU Hearing Room
August 20, 2010	Regular Meeting, 9:00 a.m., DPLU Hearing Room
September 10, 2010	Regular Meeting, 9:00 a.m., DPLU Hearing Room
September 24, 2010	Regular Meeting, 9:00 a.m., DPLU Hearing Room
October 8, 2010	Regular Meeting, 9:00 a.m., DPLU Hearing Room
October 22, 2010	Regular Meeting, 9:00 a.m., DPLU Hearing Room
November 5, 2010	Regular Meeting, 9:00 a.m., DPLU Hearing Room
November 19, 2010	Regular Meeting, 9:00 a.m., DPLU Hearing Room
December 3, 2010	Regular Meeting, 9:00 a.m., DPLU Hearing Room
December 17, 2010	Regular Meeting, 9:00 a.m., DPLU Hearing Room

There being no further business to be considered at this time, the Chairman adjourned the meeting at 2:50 p.m. to 9:00 a.m. on April 2, 2010 in the DPLU Hearing Room, 5201 Ruffin Road, Suite B, San Diego, California.