

MINUTES
SAN DIEGO COUNTY PLANNING COMMISSION
Regular Meeting – January 11, 2008
DPLU Hearing Room, 9:00 a.m.

The meeting convened at 9:03 a.m., recessed at 9:55 a.m., reconvened at 10:05 a.m., recessed at 10:30 a.m., reconvened at 10:50 a.m. and adjourned at 12:31 p.m.

A. ROLL CALL

Commissioners Present: Beck, Day, Kreitzer, Riess, Woods (out at 12:05 p.m.)

Commissioners Absent: Brooks, Pallinger

Advisors Present: Sinsay (DPW); Taylor (OCC)

Staff Present: Baca, Beddow, Farace, Gibson, Giffen, Gretler, Hughes, Johnson, Johnston, Maxson, Miller, Murphy, Ramaiya, Steinhoff, Jones (recording secretary)

B. Statement of Planning Commission's Proceedings, Approval of Minutes for the Meeting of November 2, November 16 and December 14, 2007.

Action: Beck - Riess

Approve the Minutes of November 2, November 16 and December 14, 2007, with clarification that "the barbed-wire is to be removed from the project perimeter where deer or other wildlife could be entangled" in Agenda Item 4 of the December 14, 2007 Minutes. Staff is also to provide a report to the Commission on the results of the Codes Enforcement actions with respect to the un-permitted tennis court.

Ayes: 5 - Beck, Day, Kreitzer, Riess, Woods

Noes: 0 - None

Abstain: 0 - None

Absent: 2 - Brooks, Pallinger

C. Public Communication: Opportunity for members of the public to speak to the Commission on any subject matter within the Commission's jurisdiction but not an item on today's Agenda.

None.

D. Formation of Consent Calendar: Items 6 (continuance), 3, 5, 7

P04-008, Agenda Item 1:

1. **T-Mobile/Spitzfaden Telecommunications Facility, Major Use Permit P04-008, North County Metropolitan Subregional Plan Area (continued from November 16, 2007)**

Request for Major Use Permit P04-008 to allow installation and operation of a T-Mobile Wireless Telecommunication Facility at 2141 Esplendido Avenue. The proposed facility consists of a faux monopine tree 40 feet in height with antennas and an associated equipment shelter. The proposed faux tree will carry a total of 12 panel antennas at a maximum height of 37'. The proposed equipment shelter measures 12' X 18.8' X 6.8' and would be located near the base of the proposed faux tree. Additional shrubs and trees would be used to screen the proposed project. An existing entrance driveway would provide access to the site from Esplendido Avenue. The subject property is 3.6 acres in size and is improved with a single-family residence. The applicant is also requesting an exception to the height limit for the mono-tree, from 35' to 40'.

Staff Presentation: Ramaiya

Proponents: 2; **Opponents:** 4

Discussion:

This Major Use Permit was continued from the meeting of November 16, 2007, to allow development of a redesigned project that would relocate the proposed facility closer to the center of the project site. The applicant has done so, and found the new location is visually less intrusive. The original location can be screened to lessen visual impacts by installing additional trees. Relocating the facility, as recommended by the Planning Commission at their November 16, 2007 meeting, has no impact on the coverage footprint. The proposed relocation merely moved the facility further away from the property line.

Project opponents insist that the facility isn't necessary and that there are 12 to 16 such facilities within a two-mile radius of the project site. They remain concerned about visual and noise impacts, as well as health-related impacts and possible decreases in property values due to the proximity of the proposed facility. Project opponents request that the Planning Commission direct that the facility be placed at a higher elevation if it is to be approved.

P04-008, Agenda Item 1:

During his rebuttal, the applicant's representative acknowledges that there are 12-16 existing facilities near the project site, but clarifies that they are owned by four or other five carriers, not T-Mobile.

Action: Day - Riess

Continue consideration of Major Use Permit P04-008 to the meeting of January 25, 2008. Staff is to return on that date with area coverage analyses/maps, as well as evidence that there is a need for the proposed facility at the proposed location, and with evidence that co-location will not allow that need to be met. The Commission also requests that Staff return with information detailing whether the various carriers establish roaming agreements with other carriers.

Commissioner Woods advises neighboring property owners who have been reluctant to grant access to their property so tests can be conducted to reconsider and allow that access.

Ayes: 5 - Beck, Day, Kreitzer, Riess, Woods
Noes: 0 - None
Abstain: 0 - None
Absent: 2 - Brooks, Pallinger

P04-028, Agenda Item 21:

2. T-Mobile – McMillin Water Tank Telecommunications Facility, Major Use Permit P04-028, Sweetwater Community Plan Area (continued August 24, September 21, October 19, and November 30, 2007)

Request for a Major Use Permit to allow development of a T-Mobile wireless telecommunication facility. The proposed facility consists of 10 antennas attached to an existing 26.7' tall steel water tank. Four Base Transceiver Station (BTS) equipment cabinets, one electric meter panel, and one telephone interface will be located within a 28' X 10' X 10.6' equipment area, enclosed within a 6.8' tall chain link fence with green slats. The subject property is 0.4 acres in size and is located at 5968 Steeplechase Road. The property is subject to the General Plan (3) Residential Use Regulations and is zoned RV2-Residential Variable.

Staff Presentation: Johnston

Proponents: 1; Opponents: 4

Discussion:

The Planning Commission is informed that the applicant voluntarily re-approached the Sweetwater Authority with a design that would relocate the proposed antenna to a less visible spot on water tank, but the SWA representatives denied that proposal due to concerns about added long-term stress on the tank.

Project opponents remain concerned about the visual impacts, and remind the Commission that the existing water tank is already visually intrusive. They believe the proposed facility will only add to that impact and could result in lower property values. Project opponents are also concerned about potential health impacts that may be associated with residing so near the facility. The applicant points out that his proposal will actually improve visual quality by screening the water tank.

Commissioner Day explains to project opponents that the Planning Commission is prohibited from making decisions based on radio frequency concerns. He believes the applicant has been diligent in responding to the Commission's and neighbors' concerns. Commissioner Day reminds project opponents that the screening the applicant is proposing will actually provide a better-looking environment.

P04-028, Agenda Item 2:

Action: Day – Woods

Grant Major Use Permit P04-028, which makes the appropriate Findings and includes those requirements and Conditions necessary to ensure that the project is implemented in a manner consistent with the Zoning Ordinance and State law.

Discussion of the Action:

Commissioner Beck agrees that Staff and the Commission have done all they can to resolve project opponents' concerns. He also requests that Sweetwater Authority representatives allow the water tank to be painted a more natural color.

Ayes: 5 - Beck, Day, Kreitzer, Riess, Woods
Noes: 0 - None
Abstain: 0 - None
Absent: 2 - Brooks, Pallinger

P07-003, Agenda Item 3:

3. T-Mobile/Challenger Court/SD07010, Major Use Permit P07-003, Spring Valley Community Plan Area

Request for a Major Use Permit to authorize the construction and operation of an unmanned wireless facility within the right-of-way of Pointe Parkway at Challenger Court in the Spring Valley Community Plan Area. The facility includes a 30' tall light pole to which three antennas will be mounted. Associated equipment includes four Ericsson 2206 Cabinets and one T-Mobile battery rack that will be placed within an underground vault measuring 11.1' X 7.2' located in the right-of-way of Pointe Parkway. Additional equipment will include two above ground vents measuring 2.8' tall and one meter pedestal measuring 1.4' X 3.4' X 4.5'. The project will occupy approximately 158 square-feet of the .6-acre parcel. The site is subject to the "P" (Planned Development Area) Special Area Use Regulation, indicating that the project is located within a Specific Plan.

Staff Presentation: Johnson

Proponents: 0 Opponents: 0

This Item is approved on consent.

Action: Day – Riess

Grant Major Use Permit P07-003, which makes the appropriate Findings and includes those requirements and Conditions necessary to ensure that the project is implemented in a manner consistent with the Zoning Ordinance and State law.

Ayes: 5 - Beck, Day, Kreitzer, Riess, Woods
Noes: 0 - None
Abstain: 0 - None
Absent: 2 - Brooks, Pallinger

P05-006, Agenda Item 4:

4. Winter Gardens, Major Use Permit P05-006, Lakeside Community Plan Area

Request for a Major Use Permit to authorize the construction and operation of an unmanned wireless telecommunications facility consisting of nine panel antennas within three arrays, attached to an existing 38' tall water tank and an associated equipment shelter. Associated equipment will include three Compact Metrocell Outdoor (CMO) equipment cabinets, one electric meter panel, and one telephone interface. The project will occupy 336 square feet of the 0.78-acre parcel. The project site located at 8602 Sky Rim Drive in the Lakeside Community Plan Area.

Staff Presentation: Johnston

Proponents: 1; Opponents: 3

Discussion:

Staff explains that though the applicant proposed placing the equipment on the south side of the existing tank to eliminate the Planning Group's concerns about additional visual impacts, neighboring property owners remain opposed to this project. They are unhappy with the location of the proposed facility and its nearness to their residences and are concerned about potential impacts on property values. Neighboring property owners inform the Planning Commission that another water tank exists ½ mile from the proposed project site, and may be a more suitable location. They also insist that many other neighbors weren't notified of today's hearing.

Following public testimony, the Planning Commission decides to postpone further consideration of this Item to await receipt of information similar to that requested for Item 1 on today's Agenda.

Action: Beck – Day

Continue consideration of Major Use Permit P05-006 to the meeting of February 8, 2008. Staff is to return at that time with area coverage analyses/maps, evidence that there is a need for the proposed facility at the proposed location, and evidence that co-location will not fulfill that need. The Commission also requests that Staff return with information detailing whether the various carriers establish roaming agreements with other carriers.

Ayes: 5 - Beck, Day, Kreitzer, Riess, Woods
 Noes: 0 - None
 Abstain: 0 - None
 Absent: 2 - Brooks, Pallinger

P06-066, Agenda Item 5:

5. Sprint/Nextel – West Lilac; Major Use Permit P06-066, Valley Center Community Planning Area

Request for a Major Use Permit to authorize the construction and operation of an unmanned wireless facility at 29843 Red Mountain Drive within the Valley Center Community Plan Area. The facility includes a 35' tall faux mono-broadleaf to which fifteen (15) panel antennas will be mounted. Associated equipment will consist of two ground-mounted HVAC units and a 10.7' X 21.6' X 13' equipment enclosure. The project will occupy 210 square-feet of the 3.77-acre parcel.

Staff Presentation: Tondro

Proponents: 0; Opponents: 0

This Item is approved on consent.

Action: Day – Riess

Grant Major Use Permit P06-066, which makes the appropriate Findings and includes those requirements and Conditions necessary to ensure that the project is implemented in a manner consistent with the Zoning Ordinance and State law.

Ayes: 5 - Beck, Day, Kreitzer, Riess, Woods
Noes: 0 - None
Abstain: 0 - None
Absent: 2 - Brooks, Pallinger

P03-134, Agenda Item 6:

6. SD960 Williams, Major Use Permit P03-134, Bonsall Community Plan Area

Proposed construction and operation of unmanned telecommunications facility consisting of three antenna sectors of four antennas each (a total of 12 antennas), mounted on a new 40' tall broadleaf mono-tree located directly east of an existing on-site two-story residence. Four BTS outdoor equipment cabinets will be located in new 11.4' X 17.4' X 10' concrete block equipment shelter situated approximately 20' south of the proposed broadleaf mono-tree. The project site is located at 5240 San Jacinto Circle within the Bonsall Community Plan area.

Staff Presentation: Hughes

Proponents: 1; Opponents: 0

Consideration of this Item is postponed at the request of Bonsall Sponsor Group representatives, whose representatives are unable to attend today's hearing.

Action: Day – Riess

Continue consideration of Major Use Permit P03-134 to the meeting of January 25, 2008.

Ayes:	5 -	Beck, Day, Kreitzer, Riess, Woods
Noes:	0 -	None
Abstain:	0 -	None
Absent:	2 -	Brooks, Pallinger

P05-014, Agenda Item 7:

7. El Sendero Major Use Permit Cell, Major Use Permit P05-014, Pala-Pauma Subregional Plan Area

Proposed Major Use Permit to authorize the construction and operation of an unmanned wireless telecommunications facility at 14111 West Fork Road in the Pala-Pauma Subregional Plan Area. The facility will consist of six, 4' tall antennas, mounted onto two 6' tall metal frames (a total height of 10 feet); two (2) Global Positioning System (GPS) units; and a single Concrete Masonry Unit (CMU) equipment shelter with dimensions 20.11' X 6.10'. Two air conditioning units will be located directly adjacent to the equipment shelter at the east end, and surrounded by an L-shaped, 6' tall CMU block wall for noise attenuation.

Staff Presentation: Hughes

Proponents: 1; Opponents: 0

This Item is approved on consent.

Action: Day – Riess

Grant Major Use Permit P05-014, which makes the appropriate Findings and includes those requirements and Conditions necessary to ensure that the project is implemented in a manner consistent with the Zoning Ordinance and State law.

Ayes: 5 - Beck, Day, Kreitzer, Riess, Woods
Noes: 0 - None
Abstain: 0 - None
Absent: 2 - Brooks, Pallinger

GPA 06-006/R06-009, Agenda Item 8:

8. Highway Los Coches, General Plan Amendment GPA 06-006 and Zone Reclassification R06-009, Lakeside Community Planning Area

Proposed General Plan Amendment (GPA) for property located at 8445 Los Coches Road in the Lakeside Community Plan Area. Approval of the GPA will change the underlying Land Use Designation from (8) Residential to (13) Commercial. The proposed Zone Reclassification will change the existing RS7 zoning to C36 (General Commercial), bring an existing non-conforming use (a gas station) into compliance, and allow for future commercial uses on the site. The Zone Reclassification includes a "B" Designator, which requires future uses on the site to obtain Site Plan approval.

Staff Presentation: Passon

Proponents: 3; Opponents: 0

Discussion:

This Item is approved on consent following verification that the issues regarding the truck rental business have been resolved. The applicant is now required to obtain Site Plan review prior to re-establishing that use.

Action: Day – Beck

Recommend that the Board of Supervisors adopt the Resolutions approving GPA 06-006 and R06-009.

Ayes: 5 - Beck, Day, Kreitzer, Riess, Woods
Noes: 0 - None
Abstain: 0 - None
Absent: 2 - Brooks, Pallinger

Administrative:

E. Director's Report:

- **2007 Wildfire – DPLU Response and Recovery (Murphy/Gretler/Miller/Steinhoff)**

Staff provides a brief oral and visual presentation on the efforts undertaken to assist residents during and after the October 2007 fires, as well as reduce the possibility of loss of life and property when/if future firestorms occur.

- **County Operations Center (COC) Development Plan (Gibson/Murphy)**

Postponed to 01/25/08.

- **PC Chair Rotation Discussion and Presentation of Staff Alternative (Farace/Gibson)**

- **Results from Board of Supervisors' Hearing(s) of Items Previously Considered by the Planning Commission (Gibson)**

The COC Development Plan and the Discussion of the Planning Commission Chairmanship Rotation were continued to the January 25, 2008 meeting. There were no discussions of recent Board of Supervisors meetings.

F. Report on actions of Planning Commission's Subcommittees:

None.

G. Designation of member to represent the Planning Commission at Board of Supervisors meeting(s):

None.

H. Discussion of correspondence received by the Planning Commission:

None.

Department Report

Administrative:

I. Scheduled Meetings:

January 25, 2008	Regular Meeting, 9:00 a.m., DPLU Hearing Room
February 8, 2008	Regular Meeting, 9:00 a.m., DPLU Hearing Room
February 22, 2008	Regular Meeting, 9:00 a.m., DPLU Hearing Room
March 7, 2008	Regular Meeting, 9:00 a.m., DPLU Hearing Room
March 21, 2008	Regular Meeting, 9:00 a.m., DPLU Hearing Room
April 4, 2008	Regular Meeting, 9:00 a.m., DPLU Hearing Room
April 18, 2008	Regular Meeting, 9:00 a.m., DPLU Hearing Room
May 2	Regular Meeting, 9:00 a.m., DPLU Hearing Room
May 16	Regular Meeting, 9:00 a.m., DPLU Hearing Room
May 30, 2008	Planning Commission Workshop, 9:00 a.m., DPLU Hearing Room
June 13, 2008	Regular Meeting, 9:00 a.m., DPLU Hearing Room
June 27, 2008	Regular Meeting, 9:00 a.m., DPLU Hearing Room
July 11, 2008	Regular Meeting, 9:00 a.m., DPLU Hearing Room
July 25, 2008	Regular Meeting, 9:00 a.m., DPLU Hearing Room
August 8, 2008	Regular Meeting, 9:00 a.m., DPLU Hearing Room

There being no further business to be considered at this time, the Chairman adjourned the meeting at 12:31 p.m. to 9:00 a.m. on January 25, 2008 in the DPLU Hearing Room, 5201 Ruffin Road, Suite B, San Diego, California.