

**MINUTES
CITIZENS' LAW ENFORCEMENT REVIEW BOARD MEETING
April 12, 2022**

Attachment A

- Roll Call**
- The meeting was held via the Zoom Platform and was called to order at 5:30 p.m. All Board members were present except Bonnie Kenk.
- Public Comments**
- Karen Reimus addressed the CLERB.
 - Lynn Owens addressed the CLERB.
 - Dr. R. Lee Brown addressed the CLERB.
 - Ilka Weston addressed the CLERB.
 - Dr. Darwin Fishman addressed the CLERB.
 - Reverend Shane Harris addressed the CLERB.
 - Yusef Miller addressed the CLERB.
 - Francine Maxwell addressed the CLERB.
 - Debbie Cortell addressed the CLERB.
 - Joanna Smith Stravinski addressed the CLERB.
 - Dave Myers addressed the CLERB.
 - Mary Best addressed the CLERB.
 - Tom Packard addressed the CLERB.
 - Robin Sales addressed the CLERB.
 - Natalie Neshat submitted written comments to the CLERB.
- Minutes Approval**
- Gary Wilson made a motion to approve the March 2022 (March 8th, 10th, and 22nd) meeting minutes. The motion was seconded by Nadia Kean-Ayub. The motion carried with a vote of seven; with one abstention.
- Presentation/Training**
- San Diego County Department of General Services Role in San Diego County Detention Facility Camera Maintenance and Repair by Department of General Services Assistant Director Nicole Alejandre, Deputy Director of General Services Michael Curtis, and Facilities Support Manager Ken Frederiksen
 - Sergeant Daniel Dennis presented on behalf of the Sheriff's Department (40:20).
 - Ken Frederiksen presented on behalf of the Department of General Services (43:15).
 - Dave Myers addressed the CLERB regarding the presentation.
 - The following Board Members addressed the presenters: Mary Anne Pintar, Nadia Kean-Ayub, Tim Ware, Gary Wilson, Buki Domingos, and Chair Youngflesh.
 - The following community members addressed the presenters: Debbie Cortell and Dr. R. Lee Brown.
- Executive Officer's Report**
- Overview of Activities of CLERB Executive Officer (EO) and Staff
 - On March 9, 16, and 18, 2022, Paul Parker was a panelist for the Group Program Manager at the newly created County Office of Labor Standards and Enforcement.
 - On March 16, Parker attended the Leon L. Williams Human Relations Commission Policies and Procedures Subcommittee. He provided information about CLERB and answered all questions posed.
 - On March 22, 2022, CLERB hosted its second virtual Town Hall, which pertained to the California State Auditor's (CSA) Report on the San Diego Sheriff's Department, CLERB, and in-custody deaths. The Town Hall was well-attended and informative. Most importantly, it provided community members a forum in which to express their concerns and ideas and enter into some dialogue about this critical topic.
 - On March 28, 2022, Parker met with representatives from Pillars of the Community and discussed CLERB and its practices.
 - On March 29, 2022, Parker attended Board of Supervisors Chair Nathan Fletcher's State of the County address.
 - On April 7, 2022, Parker attended, as a community member, the San Diego Racial Justice Coalition's Town Hall pertaining to the CSA Report.
 - On April 8, 2022, Parker met with Andrea St. Julian from San Diegans for Justice (SDJ) and provided an update to CLERB's actions re: the SDJ report pertaining to CLERB
 - CLERB Member Vacancy Updates
 - District 1 (D1) personnel are still reviewing applications for its vacancy.

- Chair Youngflesh’s term has expired, and interviews are in process for a new District 2 (D2) CLERB member. Chair Youngflesh will continue to serve until a replacement is appointed. A nomination to the Chief Administrative Officer is expected this month.
 - District 3 (D3) personnel are still conducting interviews for its vacancy.
 - Investigative Workload and Classification Report for March 2022 (*Attachment B*)
 - There were 22 new cases (as compared to 12 for March 2021).
 - There are 10 cases on tonight’s agenda, to include four death cases, two great bodily injury cases, and 14 total policy recommendations.
 - At the end of March there were 87 active cases (10 in “lodged” status and 77 open and active).
 - There were 32 open death cases.
 - CLERB had documents for 16 cases and was awaiting documents on the remaining 16.
 - Four are on tonight’s agenda.
 - There were four new SDSD death cases in March, one related to San Diego Central Jail and one deputy-involved shooting in Little Italy involving Courts.
 - There were 13 open uses of force resulting in great bodily injury without a complaint.
 - Four were reported in March.
 - Two are on tonight’s agenda.
 - There were three open discharges of firearm without a complaint.
 - There was one use of force at protest or First Amendment protected events without a complaint.
 - Case Progress and Status Reports (*Attachment C*)
 - Parker discussed the two reports: “CLERB Reports by Due Date” and “CLERB Reports Due by Case Number.”
 - Executive Officer Correspondence to Full CLERB (*Attachment D*)
 - One media article compilation containing six articles was sent to CLERB.
 - Policy Recommendation Pending Responses
 - 20-113 / Alvarez (Death) – SDSD
 - 21-004 / Moreno (Death) – SDSD
 - 21-060 / Meadows – SDSD
 - CLERB Staff Response to Death Scenes – Probation
 - Policy Recommendation Response
 - None
 - Sustained Finding Pending Responses
 - 20-104 / Chon (Death) – SDSD
 - Sustained Finding Response
 - None
 - Ware and Wilson commented on the Executive Officer’s report.
 - Tasha Williamson commented on the Executive Officer’s report.

Board Chair’s Report

- Board Chair Susan Youngflesh thanked the liaisons for their support of CLERB.
- Youngflesh thanked the presenters for their presentation regarding the detention facility cameras.
- Youngflesh thanked the community for their public comments and thanked the Board Members for their participation in the Town Hall.

New Business

- Authorization of Teleconferencing Meeting Option Pursuant to Government Code Section 54953(e)
 - Kean-Ayub made a motion to continue the virtual CLERB meetings for the upcoming Board Meeting. Pastor Robert Spriggs seconded the motion. The vote was unanimous; the motion carried.
- Recognition of James Sandler, CLERB’s Retiring Outside Counsel
 - Wilson made a motion to continue this item at the next regular CLERB meeting. The motion was seconded by Pintar. The vote was unanimous; the motion carried.
- Introduction of Duane Bennett, CLERB’s New Outside Counsel
 - Parker read a brief bio to introduce Duane Bennett.
 - Bennett briefly discussed his background which led him down the civil rights path.
 - Francine Maxwell, Yusef Miller, and Dr. Brown addressed Bennett and the CLERB.
 - Board Members Ware, Wilson, and Spriggs addressed Bennett.

- Policy Recommendations to SDDS: Minimize Racially Disparate Policing Practices (1:51:56)
 - Parker provided background information about this agenda item. ([Attach E](#))
 - Wilson made a motion to move forward with the policy recommendation as written. The motion was seconded by Kean-Ayub.
- 60-Day Update to Recommendations in California State Auditor Report 2021-109
- CLERB Independent In-Custody Death Data Report by Analytica Consulting
- Finalize CLERB Town Hall: CLERB Independent In-Custody Death Data Report by Analytica Consulting
- Policy Recommendations to SDDS: Use of Technology to Monitor Health and Safety of Inmates
- Policy Recommendations to San Diego County Probation Department: Use of Technology to Monitor Health and Safety of Inmates
- Policy Recommendation to Expand the SDDS Family Liaison Protocol
- Vote to Continue or Terminate Investigation of CLERB Case 20-050/Bils (Death) Pursuant to CLERB Rules and Regulations Section 5.8

Unfinished Business

- Authority for the Executive Officer to Work with County Staff to Pursue Legislation and/or to Add a Policy to the County Legislative Program in Support of Increased Transparency in Civilian Oversight of Peace Officers and Custodial Officers
 - No movement since last month.
- Authority for the Executive Officer to Work with County Staff to Request that the County Board of Supervisors Expand CLERB's Jurisdiction to Include Personnel Involved in Providing Medical Care in County Detention Facilities
 - No movement since last month.
- San Diegans for Justice CLERB Report Subcommittee Update
 - Parker informed the Board that the subcommittee delegated to him the compilation of the areas for improvement and present them at a future meeting.

Board Comments

- None

Sheriff/Probation Liaison Query

- None

The Board entered closed session at 9:09 p.m.

Closed Session

- a) PUBLIC EMPLOYEE DISCIPLINE/DISMISSAL/RELEASE
- Discussion & Consideration of Complaints & Reports:** Pursuant to Government code Section 54957 to hear complaints or charges brought against Sheriff or Probation employees by a citizen (unless the employee requests a public session). Notice to government Code Section 54957 for deliberations regarding consideration of subject officer discipline recommendation (if applicable).

| CASE NO. | LAST NAME | CASE NO. | LAST NAME |
|-----------------|------------------|-----------------|------------------|
| 21-014 | Calhoun | 21-058 | Sawyer |
| 21-038 | Whitlock | 21-078 | Blakeney |
| 21-044 | Gold | 21-079 | Beshirs |
| 21-051 | Marroquin | 21-106 | Morris |
| 21-054 | Barnes | 21-112 | Osawa |

The meeting was adjourned at 9:31 p.m.

Minutes prepared by Valerie Zagal-Garcia, Administrative Secretary III



PAUL R. PARKER III
Executive Officer



ROBERT SPRIGGS, JR.
Secretary to the Board