



COUNTY OF SAN DIEGO

Leon L. Williams San Diego County Human Relations Commission

Meeting Minutes

October 11, 2023, 5:30 PM – 7:30 PM

1) Call to Order

- Meeting called to order at 5:49pm

2) Roll Call & Introductions

- **Present:**
Cinnamon Clark, Sarah Farouq, David Garcias, Taha Hassane, Adeem Ismaeil, George Khoury, Nicole Murray Ramirez, Ellen Nash, Fabienne Perlov
- **Late:**
Angela Elliot-Santos, Eleanor Evans
- **Excused Absences:**
Kate Clark, Estela De Los Rios, Rodney Fowler, Jordan Harrison, Gina Roberts, Joseph Allen Ruanto-Ramirez, Milan Shah, David Vance
- **Departed Early:**
Nicole Murray Ramirez

3) Land Acknowledgement

- Mr. Strong read a script recognizing and acknowledging Indigenous people that called (what is now) San Diego County home for a millennia.

4) Public Comment: Opportunity for members of the public to speak to the Commission on any subject matter within the Commission's jurisdiction, but not an item on today's agenda.

- Francine Maxwell spoke to Commissioners regarding the reason why the HRC came about and suggested removing Leon L. Williams from the HRC name.
- Chair Nash condemns the innocent loss of lives in the Middle East. Reminds everyone to focus on the nominations for the remainder of the meeting.

5) Nominate and Appoint Commission Nominated Seats

a) Commission will consider applications and make motions to appoint members for up to 3 open HRC Nominated Seats.

- Mr. Strong read out the nomination process as outlined in the HRC Memo (attached), public comment, then discussion.
- Applications were sent to the Commission on September 27, 2023.

- Chair Nash thanks all applicants for applying and coming to today's meeting.
- Public Comment:
 - Adele Fassano spoke regarding her application.
 - Rabbi Devorah Marcus spoke regarding her application.
 - Darwin Fishman spoke regarding his application.
 - Smith Sirisakorn spoke regarding her application.
- Chair Nash advised the commission about current Bylaws requirements.
 - Mr. Strong: Requirements – Majority vote for each nominee that has been brought forward by a Motion.
 - 3 vacant seats
- Commissioner Perlov motions for Rabbi Marcus, seconded by Commissioner Murray Ramirez.
 - Vice-Chair Evans is in favor of Rabbi Marcus.
 - Commissioner C. Clark is in favor of Rabbi Marcus.
 - Commissioner Hassane will every candidate be motioned and discussed?
 - Chair Nash: Yes, let's be consistent.
 - Chair Nash is in favor of Rabbi Marcus.
 - Commissioner Garcias asks Rabbi Marcus about her interfaith experience?
 - Rabbi Marcus: Shared background of interfaith working from when she lived in New York.
 - Commissioner Farouq asks have you worked with the Palestinian community?
 - Rabbi Marcus: In what context? I have lived and worked in Israel and have friends that are Palestinian. My friend group is very diverse that included an array of Palestinians who identify as Israeli-Palestinian and others that do not.
 - Commissioner Farouq comment: There is a genocide currently happening.
 - Chair Nash calls Commissioner Farouq out of order.
 - Chair Nash calls the Vote.
 - Vote:
 - Clark, C – Aye
 - Clark, K – Absent
 - De Los Rios - Absent
 - Elliot-Santos – Aye
 - Evans – Aye
 - Farouq – Abstain
 - Fowler Sr. – Absent
 - Garcias – Aye
 - Harrison - Absent
 - Hassane – Abstain
 - Hodges – Abstain
 - Ismaeil – Abstain
 - Khoury – Abstain
 - Murray Ramirez – Aye
 - Nash – Aye
 - Perlov - Aye
 - Roberts – Absent
 - Ruanto-Ramirez – Absent
 - Shah - Absent
 - Vance – Absent

- Ayes: 7
- Nays: 0
- Abstain: 5

- Motion Fails.

- Commissioner Murray Ramirez: Asian Pacific Islander community is also missing representation in the HRC. We need to focus on Jewish and Asian Pacific Islander community on this board.
- Commissioner Evans asks for clarification on number of votes necessary to pass a motion.
 - Mr. Strong: 11 votes needed. Based on total number of commissioners on HRC, and not commissioners present in today's meeting.
- Commissioner Hassane motions for Darwin Fishman, seconded by Commissioner Khoury.
 - Commissioner C. Clark is in favor of Darwin Fishman.
 - Commissioner Khoury is in favor of Darwin Fishman.
 - Vice-Chair has concerns of Darwin Fishman's previous writings and not wanting to be a subject of future writings.
 - Commissioner Hassane is in favor of Darwin Fishman.
 - Commissioner Perlov asks Commissioner Hassane if Mr. Fishman is a member of *indiscernible*.
 - Commissioner Hassane: Unsure, but he is a member of the San Diego Racial Justice or something similar.
 - Darwin Fishman: His publications are about Black Youth and Civil Engagement, he's never written about HRC, only worked with HRC's. Is not a member of Progressive Jewish/ Jewish Voices. Is a co-founder of the Racial Justice Coalition of San Diego, a member of the NAACP and BAPAC.
 - Commissioner Farouq is in favor of Darwin Fishman.
 - Commissioner Perlov mentions the prioritization of the Israeli/Palestinian conflict. It is problematic.
 - Chair Nash calls Commissioner Perlov comments off topic.
 - Chair Nash calls the Vote.
 - Vote:
 - Clark, C – Aye
 - Clark, K – Absent
 - De Los Rios - Absent
 - Elliot-Santos – Aye
 - Evans – Nay
 - Farouq – Aye
 - Fowler Sr. – Absent
 - Garcias – Aye
 - Harrison - Absent
 - Hassane – Aye
 - Hodges – Aye
 - Ismaeil – Aye
 - Khoury – Aye
 - Murray Ramirez – Left
 - Nash – Nay
 - Perlov - Nay
 - Roberts – Absent

- Ruanto-Ramirez – Absent
- Shah - Absent
- Vance – Absent

- Ayes: 8
- Nays: 3
- Abstain: 0

- Motion Fails

- Commissioner Khoury asks if Amina Idoui could fit in the Youth category (16-24)? If so motions for Amina Idoui, seconded by Commissioner Hassane.
 - Amina Idoui introduced herself (previously had technical difficulties and unable to do so in Public Comment section).
 - Chair Nash calls the Vote.
 - Vote:
 - Clark, C – Aye
 - Clark, K – Absent
 - De Los Rios - Absent
 - Elliot-Santos – Aye
 - Evans – Nay
 - Farouq – Aye
 - Fowler Sr. – Absent
 - Garcias – Aye
 - Harrison - Absent
 - Hassane – Aye
 - Hodges – Aye
 - Ismaeil – Aye
 - Khoury – Aye
 - Murray Ramirez – Absent
 - Nash – Aye
 - Perlov - Nay
 - Roberts – Absent
 - Ruanto-Ramirez – Absent
 - Shah - Absent
 - Vance – Absent

 - Ayes: 9
 - Nays: 2
 - Abstain: 0

- Motion Fails.

- Vice-Chair Evans suggests all applicants be present during voting discussions. Asks how long applications are kept.
 - Mr. Strong: Clerk of the Board keeps applications for 1 year, then they expire.

Break – 5 min

- Commissioner Khoury nominates Adele Fassano, seconded by Commissioner Elliot-Santos.

- Commissioner Farouq asks Adele Fassano if she can explain the work she did with CBP and what she is most proud of?
 - Adele Fassano informs commission that she has been retired from CBP for 2 years and primarily focused on major field operations. Most proud of high standards and integrity. Shared more of what she did while working for CBP.
- Commissioner Evans what does CBP mean?
 - Adele Fassano: Customs and Border Protection formerly Immigration.
 - Q: Evans - How long were these people detained?
 - A: Fassano - A long time.
 - Q: Evans – How does your background fold into what we are doing here if you are kind of on the opposite side?
 - A: Fassano – Through coalitions and outreach, has been nominated to serve on the Community Policing Advisory Board. Believes in solving problems together. Passionate about human rights.
- Commissioner Hassane are you aware of the Friendship Park at the US/Mexico border? What do you think about it?
 - Adele Fassano: Is aware, does not agree with the closure. Would be a good resource on working with CBP to reopen park.
- Chair Nash calls the Vote.
 - Vote:
 - Clark, C – Aye
 - Clark, K – Absent
 - De Los Rios - Absent
 - Elliot-Santos – Aye
 - Evans – Nay
 - Farouq – Nay
 - Fowler Sr. – Absent
 - Garcias – Aye
 - Harrison - Absent
 - Hassane – Aye
 - Hodges – Aye
 - Ismaeil – Aye
 - Khoury – Aye
 - Murray Ramirez – Absent
 - Nash – Aye
 - Perlov - Abstain
 - Roberts – Absent
 - Ruanto-Ramirez – Absent
 - Shah - Absent
 - Vance – Absent
 - Ayes: 8
 - Nays: 2
 - Abstain: 1
- Motion Fails.
- Commissioner Elliot-Santos motions to table item 5, seconded by Commissioner Khoury.
 - Vice-Chair will the people we vote on have an option to be voted on again?

- A: Mr. Strong – Yes.
- Chair Nash application period is still open.
 - Mr. Strong as long as it is at least 2 weeks prior to our meeting date to allow for review.
- Chair Nash are we allowed to review applications that came in after the deadline?
 - County Counsel: Needs to review and will report back.
- Chair Nash calls the Vote.
 - Vote:
 - Clark, C – Aye
 - Clark, K – Absent
 - De Los Rios - Absent
 - Elliot-Santos – Aye
 - Evans – Aye
 - Farouq – Aye
 - Fowler Sr. – Absent
 - Garcias – Aye
 - Harrison - Absent
 - Hassane – Aye
 - Hodges – Aye
 - Ismaeil – Aye
 - Khoury – Aye
 - Murray Ramirez – Absent
 - Nash – Aye
 - Perlov - Aye
 - Roberts – Absent
 - Ruanto-Ramirez – Absent
 - Shah - Absent
 - Vance – Absent
 - Ayes: 11
 - Nays: 0
 - Abstain: 0
- Motion passes.

6) Adjournment

- Meeting adjourned at 7:07pm