

**COUNTY OF SAN DIEGO
BOULEVARD PLANNING GROUP (BPG)
MINUTES/SUMMARY FOR MEETING HELD ON NOVEMBER 1, 2018**

MEETING WAS CALLED TO ORDER AT 7PM at the Backcountry Resource Center- Community Room, 39919 Ribbonwood Rd, Boulevard CA 91905 (modular behind old Fire Station)

A. MEMBERS PRESENT: 1) Robert Maupin; 2) Earl Goodnight 3) Kevin Keane; 4) Donna Tisdale; 5) Michele Strand; 6) Michael Coyne; 7) Ronald Hynum.

B. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE:

C. MINUTES/SUMMARY FOR OCTOBER 4TH MEETING:

- *M/S: Maupin/Keane: Accept minutes/summary for Oct 4th as written: Passed: 7-0-0*

D. PUBLIC COMMUNICATION:

- Local Boulevard resident Ken Daubach reported that he has been having cell phone problems (Verizon) at home and at work. Verizon reprogrammed his cell phone today so he will see if it improves over the next month and let us know. Verizon told Ken that if the problem continues, they will send out a specialist to check it out. Verizon said it could be from electromagnetic interference (EMI) from the turbines. He sees both Kumeyaay and Tule Wind turbines from his home.
- Ken Daubach also reported that there has been an increase in rodents in his yard (floating dead in the horse trough, etc.). Can it be related to increased ground vibrations near turbines and/or fewer raptors?
- Tammy Daubach said new turbines will be worse.
- 51-year local Boulevard resident Jeff Morrison reported that they are unable to open their windows due to the noise (swooshing sound of the blades) and the feeling of increased bad energy in the air. They can also feel it from just standing on the ground. There has also been a high-pitched squealing sound coming from the turbines. The Morrison's have found a record 11 snakes on their front porch this year and have seen a huge increase in the rodent population since the Tule Wind turbines were built and vibrations increased. Jeff tried to research who owns the Kumeyaay wind turbines now so he could file complaint, with no luck. He also complained to Verizon. The engineer came out and blamed it on the Tule Wind turbines since Morrison had good service before they started up and they were the only new source of EMI. Neighbors have reported similar impacts.
- Michele Strand reported cell service issues since Tule Wind started up.
- Kevin Keane said they can hear the turbines again.
- Chair Donna Tisdale expressed her sorrow that people are being affected so negatively by the turbines. Tisdale said she had also tried to locate the current owner of the Kumeyaay turbines online but one site leads to another, that leads to another that leads to "no information". Tisdale suggested that the Morrison's and anyone else affected by the turbines should send complaints to Tule Wind, to the BLM, and the County of San Diego. Turbine owners can adjust or curtail problematic turbines to help neighbors in response to complaints are filed. Tisdale also stated that the BPG Group has been fighting these projects for many years trying to protect residents.

E. ACTION ITEMS (Agenda items may be taken out of order upon request):

1. **LETTER FROM PDS DIRECTOR MARK WARDLAW IN RESPONSE TO GROUP'S REQUEST FOR HEALTH IMPACT ASSESSMENT (HIA)FOR WIND TURBINE HEALTH EFFECTS:**

- Director Mark Wardlaw's response to BPG's request for a Health Impact Assessment was indirectly denied in a craftily-worded letter dated October 26, 2018. He basically says that the health impacts will be studied in the Torrey Wind EIR, but Tisdale said the HIA request should be separate from EIR literature review.

- Director Wardlaw's vague response also says that **only** the part of the project that is in the County's jurisdiction (which means NOT the Indian land where a majority of the project is located in) will be subject to NEPA and CEQA review. Tisdale and others disagreed, saying that both NEPA and CEQA require that connected actions and the whole of the project, including new Campo Wind project, must be analyzed.
- There was a discussion on what CEQA requires and whether or not the HIA should be part of the EIR.

M/S: Maupin/Keane: Authorize Chair to respond to Director Wardlaw's October 26th letter: Passed: 7-0-0.

2. SHOULD THE GROUP SEND A LETTER OPPOSING PLACEMENT OF SEXUALLY VIOLENT PREDATOR ALVIN QUARELS AT 43050 DESERT ROSE RANCH IN JACUMBA?

- It has been reported that the home located at 43050 Desert Rose Ranch is partially owned by Veteran's Affairs, which does not allow this use.
- Our backcountry area has an overconcentration of sex offenders (approx. 1 per 100 residents). This is disproportionate to other areas and we don't have necessary services.
- Multiple entities do not believe Quarels should be released at all.
- A retired law enforcement professional in the audience said that these sexually violent predators are only closely monitored for about 6 months before they are free to roam the community. To add insult to injury, we don't have 24-hour law enforcement coverage in the backcountry.

M/S: Hynum/Maupin: Authorize Chair to send a letter opposing placement of sexually violent predator Alvin Quarels at 43050 Desert Rose Ranch in Jacumba, or any other address in the Boulevard/Jacumba area: Passed: 7-0-0.

E. GROUP BUSINESS & PROJECT UPDATES – DISCUSSION ONLY

1. ANNOUNCEMENTS & CORRESPONDENCE:

- Terra-Gen's Boulder Brush Gen-Tie Project: The Major Pre-Application letter has been delayed. It may be placed on December's agenda for action if project information becomes available in time.
- Lawsuit filed for 60 neighbors of Iberdrola's Hardscrabble Wind in New York State, alleging negligence, nuisance, adverse noise, EMI, shadow flicker, health and property value impacts and more was recently settled with a confidential agreement, for at least some of the plaintiffs. Tule Wind is an Iberdrola / Avangrid project:
<https://www.scribd.com/doc/114674283/Hardscrabble-Wind-lawsuit>
- Baja Rail has begun analyzing how to repair or rebuild dozens of damaged tunnels and bridges on local rail line to allow freight and manufactured goods, including liquid propane, to be shipped from San Diego and Tijuana to the East Coast. Also, train whistles have been heard, only at night, by some Boulevard residents;
See <http://bajarr.com/eng/about-us/>
- The Department of Energy has extended the comment period for the Energia Sierra Juarez Supplemental EIS by 45 days to December 4th. Comments can be submitted via JulieA.Smith@hq.doe.gov.
<https://www.energy.gov/oe/articles/oe-issues-supplemental-environmental-impact-statement-eis-energia-sierra-juarez-esj-us>
- German professor reports that infrasound acts like a heart jammer. Citing the results of his research, Prof. Vahl said: "The fundamental question of whether infrasound can affect the heart muscle has been answered."
<https://principia-scientific.org/new-medical-research-wind-turbines-pose-health-risks/>
 - Kevin Keane asked about the news source of the article saying that was a fairly common German name.

- City of San Diego is going forward with their 100% renewable Climate Action Plan. They could potentially buy energy from Torrey Wind, Rugged Solar or other local energy project. One article reported that the City has made little progress on reducing green house gases. Their one claim of reduction allegedly comes from an error in estimated traffic levels that they don't plan to correct.
 - Jim Whalen suggested that the City should provide community benefits (if they buy energy from a local project). He suggested \$5/MW
 - The Board of Supervisors approved a new bike plan. It will be used to guide the potential addition of bike lanes or bike lane improvements when road projects in unincorporated communities, including resurfacing and repaving, are planned and built in the future.
 - CPUC is seeking input on how well SDG&E is prepared for wildfires. Send comments by Dec 31st to public.advisor@cpcu.ca.gov
2. **REVITALIZATION REPORT by Tammy Daubach:**
- Tzu-Chi Medical Outreach performed 280 procedures including 3 crowns and 17 pairs of eyeglasses.
 - Friends of the Library are meeting on November 20th at 6:00 PM. Christmas trees will be sold and there will be a bake sale starting November 13th through 17th.
 - December 1st will be Mountain Empire Health's Breakfast with Santa at Jacumba and Campo.
 - Richard Alcorn passed away yesterday. He was a very involved volunteer in both Boulevard and Jacumba. A service will be announced at a later time.
3. **FIRE SAFE COUNCIL REPORT by Tammy Daubach:**
- The Halloween Trick-or-Treat event was attended by almost 150 children. We'd like to thank all the people who donated to the event.
 - The Jacumba Community Clean-up Day was a success. We had around 88 loads of trash, 18 loads of tires, and 7 loads of brush for chipping. 20 of the trash loads were e-waste or appliances. 2 of the trash loads were green waste only. One dumpster was entirely filled with green waste from the Jacumba Park. One dumpster was filled with furniture from a dumpsite along the roadside. 535 tires were collected to be recycled.
 - Potrero's Community Clean-up Day will be Saturday, November 17th from 7:30 AM – 12:00 PM.
 - The Real East County Fire Safe Council meeting will be at 6:30 PM on November 15th at the Backcountry Resource Center.
 - The Boulevard Fire Dept. will be accepting donations for Fill the Boot for MDA. The drive will continue until November 3rd.
 - Free chipping is available through Sunrise Powerlink grants. Flyers are available.
 - Tables, chairs, and more were donated by the Campo Volunteer Fire Dept.
4. **TERRA-GEN'S 126 MW TORREY WIND PROJECT – PDS2018-MUP-18-014:**
- Nothing new to report.
5. **60 MW 420 ACRE BOULEVARD SOLAR MUP12-010TE PDS2012-3300-12-00 @ 796 Tierra Del Sol Road; MUP extended to February 2019:**
- Still pending environmental surveys.
6. **74 MW RUGGED SOLAR: PDS2017-MUP-12-007W1 MAJOR USE PERMIT MODIFICATION-NEW PROJECT**
DESCRIPTON: MUP extended to February 2019:
- Jim Whalen said he may have something to report next month.

7. 100MW BOULEVARD ENERGY STORAGE FACILITY; PDS 2017-ZAP-17-006; MINOR USE PERMIT FOR 2 ACRE PROJECT LOCATED ON APN'S# 612-09-059; 612-09-019; 612-09-017, NEAR BOULEVARD SUBSTATION: MUP extended to February 2019:

- Nothing new to report.

8. LIVE OAK SPRINGS AG CLEARING; PDS2017-AD-17-028: REDUCED ACERAGE:

- Chair Tisdale reported that a resident of Campo called her to report on and warn us about the problems they have been having with their wells since the same owner bought the old Dairy Fresh property on Hwy 94 in Campo and started using huge sprinklers to irrigate their crops. They said numerous neighboring wells have experienced dropping water levels, dirt in their water, loss of production, air gaps, loss of pressure and significant recovery time. Allegations were also made that foreign workers are brought in from somewhere and housed on site with workers being rotated out every 3-6 months or so.

1. TULE WIND PHASE 1 – NOISE /COMMUNITY COMPLAINT CONTACTS:

- Chair Tisdale reported that Tule Wind had informed her that they have not received any complaints, beyond her request back in April for the correct complaints contacts. Legitimate complaints should be filed with Tule Wind, the BLM, and San Diego County. It is Tule Wind's obligation to attempt to resolve any noise, shadow flicker or other complaints filed by neighbors. If Tule Wind can't or won't resolve the complaints then the neighbors have the right to defend themselves, their families, and their properties through the courts.
- Toll Free Project Hotline & Noise Complaints directly to Iberdrola /Avangrid: 855-369-9337; windcommunity@avangrid.com.
- Noise complaints can also be made to Lazaro Herrera, County Noise Control Officer & Code Compliance: 858-694-3741; lazaro.herrera@sdcounty.ca.gov; and to BLM: Tristan Riddell @ triddell@blm.gov, 760-337-4436; or Carrie Sahagun @ csahagun@blm.gov, 760-337-4437.

2. TULE WIND PHASE II:

- Once this project gets cleared through the 9th Circuit Court of Appeals, another 24 wind turbines will be going up at the north end of the Kumeyaay turbines that already there.

G. MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:45 PM: NEXT MEETING SET FOR THURSDAY, DECEMBER 6TH @ BACKCOUNTRY RESOURCE CENTER.

CORRECTED MINUTES/SUMMARY APPROVED BY GROUP ON DECEMBER 5TH.

Donna Tisdale, Chair: *Donna Tisdale*

For More information contact Donna Tisdale, Chair at 619-766-4170 or tisdale.donna@gmail.com ;

Current and past meeting agendas and approved minutes are posted on the County website @

<http://www.sandiegocounty.gov/content/sdc/pds/gpupdate/comm/blvd.html>

**Disclaimer Language included as directed by San Diego County PDS: Public Disclosure: We strive to protect personally identifiable information by collecting only information necessary to deliver our services. All information that may be collected becomes public record that may be subject to inspection and copying by the public, unless an exemption in law exists. In the event of a conflict between this Privacy Notice and any County ordinance or other law governing the County's disclosure of records, the County ordinance or other applicable law will control. Access and Correction of Personal Information: You can review any personal information collected about you. You may recommend changes to your personal information you believe is in error by submitting a written request that credibly shows the error. If you believe that your personal information is being used for a purpose other than what was intended when submitted, you may contact us. In all cases, we will take reasonable steps to verify your identity before granting access or making corrections.*