

**COUNTY OF SAN DIEGO
BOULEVARD PLANNING GROUP (BPG)
MINUTES/SUMMARY FOR MEETING HELD ON MARCH 7, 2019**

The meeting was called to order at 7:00 PM at the Backcountry Resource Center- Community Room, 39919 Ribbonwood Rd, Boulevard CA 91905 (modular behind old Boulevard Fire Station)

A. ROLL CALL/MEMBERS PRESENT: 1) Robert Maupin; 3) Kevin Keane – arrived at 7:15pm; 4) Donna Tisdale; 5) Michele Strand; 6) Michael Coyne. **MEMBERS ABSENT:** 2) Earl Goodnight (excused); 7) Ronald Hynum (excused)

B. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE:

C. ACT ON MINUTES/SUMMARY FOR FEBRUARY 7TH MEETING:

M/S: Maupin/Strand: Approve February 7, 2019 minutes/summary: Passed: 4-0-0

D. PUBLIC COMMUNICATION:

- The Dennis Ruth fundraiser will be at the Jacumba Community Center on Saturday, March 23rd at 3:00.
- The Board of Supervisors is voting on Tuesday on fire safety enhancements.

E. ACTION ITEMS (Agenda items may be taken out of order upon request):

1. BOULDER BRUSH LLC GEN-TIE LINE & SUBSTATION FACILITIES: APPLICATIONS FOR MAJOR USE PERMIT, ENVIRONMENTAL INITIAL STUDY, AND HEIGHT LIMIT EXEMPTION ; PDSMUP-19-002; ER-19-16-001:

- Chair Tisdale reported that this project and the connected Campo Wind project are being analyzed together by the Bureau of Indian Affairs and San Diego County. The County has no jurisdiction over Campo Wind but they are a cooperating agency per CEQA and NEPA.
- All 3 projects, including Torrey Wind should be analyzed as the one large project that they obviously are.
- On Feb 7th, BPG voted 4-0 (3 absent) to “authorize the chair to submit comments in opposition to Boulder Brush Gen-tie line, substation and height limit waiver”.
- Chair submitted a 14-page comment letter on Feb 12.
- On Feb 14th the County released the Notice of Project (NOP) and held a public meeting on Feb 28th.
- About 40 or so people showed up on February 28th but only Tisdale and Strand showed up from the BPG.
- Tisdale urged people to submit comments, if they had not already done so. Don’t rely on our Group comments.
- We need as many people to submit comments as possible. Otherwise, they think we don’t care.
- Request authorization to submit additional opposition comments on the NOP addressing any new information.
- *M/S: Maupin/Strand: Authorize the Chair to submit additional comments and to address new issues in opposition to Boulder Brush Gen-Tie line, Substation Facilities, and height limit waiver for 150 foot tall poles: Passed: 4-0-0*

Board member Kevin Keane arrived at this time and was able to vote in the motions below.

2. 2019 HHSA PUBLIC HEALTH POSITION STATEMENT ON HEALTH EFFECTS OF WIND TURBINES:

- Chair Tisdale reported that Health and Human Services Agency (HHSA) and Planning & Development Services (PDS) staff will present the findings of the current literature review in the 2019 Public Health Position Statement on Human Health Effects of Wind Turbines to the Planning Commission on March 22, 2019.

- Their literature review found no direct link between wind turbines and adverse health effects but did find that wind turbines may be associated with annoyance which may cause indirect health effects.
 - HHSa STATEMENT SUMMARY
 - “Since 2012, numerous comprehensive journal reviews and studies have been conducted around the world to examine potential adverse health effects of wind turbines. In addition to the vast majority of credible, scientific, peer-reviewed journals, evidence from numerous federal, state and local governments has been examined. Based on these findings and the scientific merit of the research conducted to date:
 - An imbalance was found between the availability of primary bibliographical sources (i.e., original scientific experiments and studies) and secondary sources (i.e., scientific literature reviews). This included focus on noise, low frequency noise and infrasound, EMF, and shadow flicker.
 - The majority of evidence shows that, while noise from wind turbines is not causally related to adverse health effects, wind turbines may be a source of annoyance for a small minority of community residents. That annoyance may cause stress for these individuals, and that stress may be associated with certain reported health effects.
 - The weight of evidence suggests that, when sited properly, wind turbines are not related to adverse health effects. Numerous literature reviews were found, however, limited number of primary sources (i.e., research articles) available. Additional research, such as cohort or case-controlled studies, would be needed to establish a potential causal association between wind turbines and adverse health effects.”
- Tisdale expressed her opinion that the 2019 HHSa statement is just as industry-biased and inadequate as the 2012 statement; there is a lot of credible information that discredits both the 2012 and 2019 statements.
- Kevin Keane urged caution. Industry/County already trying to dismiss related health effects, but Donna found some good scientific research. That is what we need.
- Carmen also raised concerns with impacts on wildlife including endangered frogs found under the train trestle on Hwy 94/Campo Reservation and elsewhere locally.
- Another resident reported having a friend who is an electrician who has lots of information on turbine issues.
- Bob Maupin expressed his opinion that we are basically throw-away people to bureaucrats in San Diego.
- Tisdale requested authorization to make a counter presentation at March 22nd Planning Commission meeting to address the current research that was ignored along with the real world impacts and adverse health effects reported by turbine impacted residents locally and globally.
- ***M/S: Maupin/Keane: Authorize the Chair to submit additional comments and to make a counter presentation responding to the 2019 HHSa Public Health Position Statement on Health Effects of Wind Turbines: Passed: 5-0-0***

3. **PROPOSED PLACEMENT OF SEXUALLY VIOLENT PREDATOR (SVP) ALAN JAMES AT 45612 OLD HWY 80, JACUMBA HOT SPRINGS:**

- Here we go again! A flyer on the predator was included in the agenda packet.
- Frustration and dismay was the general consensus on so many SVP's being placed locally.
- Tisdale expressed concern that if the SVP is released to the site near Jacumba Airport and the JVR solar project is approved; the SVP could get lost in all the traffic and end up in areas he is not supposed to be.
- ***M/S: Strand/Maupin: Authorize the Chair to submit comments opposing the placement of sexually violent predator Alan James at 45612 Old Hwy 80, Jacumba Hot Springs: Passed: 5-0-0***

4. **PUBLIC WORKS NOTIFICATION OF DEAD TREE REMOVAL:**

- Tisdale reported that County Public works had provided a 30-day notice for planned removal of two dead oaks in the County Right of Way at 40248 Old Hwy 80 and 1176 Tierra del Sol Rd.
- She went to those addresses and confirmed that the trees were obviously dead and should be removed.
- ***No action taken. Consensus to remove.***

F. GROUP BUSINESS & PROJECT UPDATES – DISCUSSION ONLY

5. **ANNOUNCEMENTS & CORRESPONDENCE:**

- San Diego City and County have voted to pursue Community Choice Energy (CCE) options as an alternative to SDG&E that is reportedly getting out of the energy business. SDG&E will stick with infrastructure.
- Jacumba Valley Ranch solar Energy Park: The Notice of Project was released March 7 with the public meeting set for 6 PM on Wed March 21 at Jacumba Highland Center. See map and some info in packet and separate flyer with public hearing/comment dates.
- Bronwyn Brown has been promoted to Planning Manager. She will still be involved as contact for local projects but Nicholas Koutoufidis will be assisting her. Nicholas.Koutoufidis@sdcounty.ca.gov
- In response to question from the Chair to Jim Whalen, regarding the status of Starlight Solar on Empire Ranch, he said they are in phase I of interconnection study; no project has yet been submitted to the County.
- Regarding the County CCE action, Whalen reported that the Board of Supervisors will need to acquire energy from County area projects in response to Sierra Club CAP litigation. They will likely form a Joint Powers Authority to insulate themselves.

6. **REVITALIZATION REPORT by Tammy Daubach:**

- Nothing new to report.

7. **FIRE SAFE COUNCIL (FSC) REPORT by Tammy Daubach:**

- Tammy reported that our FSC is the biggest area in the County, area wise, but most is federal land that is non-taxable.
- Our FSC is updating our Community Wildfire Protection Plan (CWPP. Comments are welcome.
- Wind and solar projects should be included in our CWPP because fire fighters cannot safely fight fires at these massive projects. They generally have to stand back and wait for the fire to burn through the project to fight it.
- It was confirmed that the roadside garbage exposed during on the fire break work along Tule Jim and Tierra Del Sol Road fire will be removed.
- Mistletoe is an invasive species. Tammy had flyers available with information on how to properly remove it.

8. **TERRA-GEN'S 252 MW - 60 TURBINE CAMPO WIND PLANNED FOR 2,200 ACRES OF THE CAMPO RESERVATION:**

9. Tisdale reported that Dan Hall with Bureau of Indian Affairs said he thinks the DRAFT EIS / EIR will be released in a couple of months.

10. **TERRA-GEN'S 126 MW TORREY WIND PROJECT: PDS2018-MUP-18-014:**

- Tisdale reported that PDS Project Manager, Bronwyn Brown, said she anticipates that the Draft EIR will be going out in the second quarter (2-3 months?) She will provide a preliminary notification on the release date.

11. TULE WIND PHASE 1 – NOISE /COMMUNITY COMPLAINT CONTACTS:

- Tisdale said it is OK to complain to her, but asked that people who are bothered by the turbines to please file complaints.
- If you don't complain then Tule Wind has no incentive to try to reduce the noise, shadow flicker, and cell phone interference. They can and should try to reduce the impacts they are creating.
- Include Supervisor Dianne Jacob on any complaints filed at Dianne.jacob@sdcounty.ca.gov
- Toll Free Project Hotline & Noise Complaints directly to Iberdrola /Avangrid: 855-369-9337; windcommunity@avangrid.com. Noise complaints can also be made to San Diego County Noise Control & Code Compliance: (858) 694-3741 or e-mail PDS.CodeCompliance@sdcounty.ca.gov ; and to BLM: Carrie Sahagun @ csahagun@blm.gov, 760-337-4437. It may be best to address complaints to Iberdrola/Avangrid and copy all the other contacts on every email complaint filed. Keep a record of all complaints and any responses.

12. TULE WIND PHASE II:

- Bronwyn Brown informed Tisdale that Tule Wind is now determining locations for Phase II turbines.

**13. 74 MW RUGGED SOLAR: PDS2017-MUP-12-007W1 MAJOR USE PERMIT MODIFICATION-NEW PROJECT
DESCRIPTON: MUP extended to February 2019:**

- Nothing new to report.

14. 60 MW 420 ACRE BOULEVARD SOLAR MUP12-010TE PDS2012-3300-12-00 @ 796 Tierra Del Sol Road; MUP set to expire on February 15, 2019:

- Tisdale reported that the permit has been extended to February 15, 2020, without any notice or public comment, until after the fact.

15. 100MW BOULEVARD ENERGY STORAGE FACILITY; PDS 2017-ZAP-17-006; MINOR USE PERMIT FOR 2 ACRE PROJECT LOCATED ON APN'S# 612-09-059; 612-09-019; 612-09-017, NEAR BOULEVARD SUBSTATION: MUP extended to February 2019:

- Invenenergy's permit has been extended by PDS to August 15, 2019, without any notice or public comment.

G. MEETING ADJOURNED AT 8:05 PM: NEXT MEETING SET FOR THURSDAY, APRIL 4, 2019 @ BACKCOUNTRY RESOURCE CENTER.

Minutes/summary approved by Group on 4-4-19

Michele Strand, Secretary: _____

For More information contact Donna Tisdale, Chair at 619-766-4170 or tisdale.donna@gmail.com ;

Current and past meeting agendas and approved minutes are posted on the County website @

<http://www.sandiegocounty.gov/content/sdc/pds/gpupdate/comm/blvd.html>

**Disclaimer Language included as directed by San Diego County PDS: Public Disclosure: We strive to protect personally identifiable information by collecting only information necessary to deliver our services. All information that may be collected becomes public record that may be subject to inspection and copying by the public, unless an exemption in law exists. In the event of a conflict between this Privacy Notice and any County ordinance or other law governing the County's disclosure of records, the County ordinance or other applicable law will control. Access and Correction of Personal Information: You can review any personal information collected about you. You may recommend changes to your personal information you believe is in error by submitting a written request that credibly shows the error. If you believe that your personal information is being used for a purpose other than what was intended when submitted, you may contact us. In all cases, we will take reasonable steps to verify your identity before granting access or making corrections.*