

**COUNTY OF SAN DIEGO
BOULEVARD PLANNING GROUP (BPG)
MEETING MINUTES/SUMMARY**

The meeting was called to order at 7:00 PM, Thursday, April 4, 2019 at the Backcountry Resource Center- Community Room, 39919 Ribbonwood Rd, Boulevard CA 91905

A. MEMBERS PRESENT: ROLL CALL (Determination of quorum): 1) Robert Maupin; 3) Kevin Keane; 4) Donna Tisdale; 5) Michele Strand; 6) Michael Coyne (arrived @ 7:05); 7) Ronald Hynum. **MEMBERS ABSENT:** 2) Earl Goodnight (excused)

B. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE: (OPTIONAL) (please silence cell phones)

C. MINUTES/SUMMARY FOR MARCH 7TH MEETING:

- *M/S: Maupin/Keane: Approve March 7th minutes/summary as written: Passed: 5-0-0 (1 absent, 1 late)*

D. PUBLIC COMMUNICATION:

- No public comments were made.

E. ACTION ITEMS (Agenda items may be taken out of order upon request):

1. **90 MW JACUMBA VALLEY RANCH ENERGY PARK (JVR SOLAR) PDS2018-GPA-18-010, PDS2018-REZ-18-007, PDS2018-MUP-18-022; PDS2018-ER-18-22-001:**

- Chair Tisdale apologized for missing the March 21st scoping meeting in Jacumba due to the fact that she was still preparing the PowerPoint presentation for the March 22nd Planning Commission meeting on wind turbine health effects.
- Tisdale stated her opinions:
 - The project is too big and too close to existing community and homes.
 - Energy is not for locals.
 - Boulevard and Jacumba already carry a disproportionate burden of industrial wind, solar and infrastructure-being treated as a dumping ground for massive energy projects & SVP's
 - There are better alternatives; several documents included in agenda packet identified 400-4,000 MW of solar siting options on existing structures and over parking lots. The 400 MW survey, claimed 75% of those sites are over parking lots.
 - Those two surveys are just for the City of San Diego and do not include even more options in the County's much larger urban/suburban territory.
 - None of these sites would consume precious local groundwater or destroy rural and predominantly low-income communities in the process.
 - Project further industrializes rural community and incentivizes even more energy projects.
- Cherry Diefenbach stated that she owns the Chinese Castle property in Jacumba and that the views of the project and quality of life for her and others would be significantly damaged.
 - The project flanks 2 sides of park and community center and 3 sides of airport runway.
 - Project violates sub regional plan and more.
 - She has been asking for public to comment and has been seeking media coverage.
 - Project would be nail in the coffin for Jacumba.
 - Spa business would no longer attract tourists.
 - There is no talk of trails or open space; project is a loser for community; town is waking up.
 - Project includes several 10,000 gallon water tanks but water can't be used for electrical fires.
 - Project does not allow for future growth of community.
- Others commented that the Jacumba Spa property and part of the solar project are still owned by the Chair of the Jacumba Sponsor Group who has reportedly recused herself from voting.

- Spa reportedly fell out of escrow because of this project. The potential buyers were very health oriented and the project was perceived as not being healthy for community.
- Ostrander: petition going around gathering lots of signatures.
- Comment setters will be sent in by Fire Safe Council and Revitalization:
 - Permanent specialty trained fire-fighters are required for large solar projects.
 - Foam equipment previously secured for ECO Substation mitigation was inexplicably transferred to Lake Morena Fire, leaving Jacumba with large energy projects but no foam equipment.
- Project is proposed for site that is basically a dry lake bed. What happens when flooding similar to past events takes place at that site?
- Strand: Project is not a 'park' and should not be portrayed as one.
- ***M/S: Maupin/Strand: Authorize Chair to submit comments in opposition to JVR Solar project: Passed 5-0-1 (Keane abstained).***

2. **SHOULD THE GROUP REQUEST A FORMAL WITHDRAWAL OR AMENDMENT OF THE COUNTY'S 2019 PUBLIC HEALTH POSITION STATEMENT ON HEALTH EFFECTS OF WIND TURBINES:**

- Chair Tisdale reported that at the March 22nd Planning Commission hearing, six turbine-impacted neighbors stood up and testified to the Commissioners, who actually pushed back against our public health officer, Dr. Wooten, and Planning & Development Services Director and Staff, questioning their public position statement and more.
- The Commissioners asked some hard questions and wanted to take action but had to wait until the issue is placed on an agenda for action at an upcoming meeting. Site visits to impacted homes and the Tule Wind project were proposed.
- Tisdale also stated that in the interim, they will be lobbied hard by Tule Wind's Jim Whalen and Terra-Gen's lobbyist, Chris Brown. Before the meeting, when she asked Brown if he wanted to meet some of Terra-Gen's Torrey Wind and Campo Wind neighbors, he said he did not have anything to say to them. She told him he would be hearing from them anyway.
- Tisdale provided her interpretation of some of the items that a majority of the Commissioners wanted to request the Board of Supervisors to fund:
 - Health Impact Assessment for turbine-impacted neighbors
 - Testing at impacted homes
 - Better research on noise, infrasound, and low-frequency noise from turbines
 - Determine what a safe set-back is between turbines and homes
 - Potential modifications to Wind Energy Ordinance including current noise waiver and turbine setback of 1.1 times the turbine height.
 - Consider reducing the rural noise limits that are currently too high.
 - Topographic maps showing radius of impacts from existing turbines and how many homes will be impacted by new much larger turbines (proposed by Terra-Gen).
- These issues were supposed to be placed on the next PC agenda for April 5th, but that did not happen. PDS Director, Mark Wardlaw, has not yet responded to request for updated information.
- Unfortunately, any potential changes will not apply to Terra-Gen's Torrey Wind project that is already in the planning process.
- The Planning Director did advise the Commissioners that they do have great discretion to modify or deny proposed projects out right, including Terra-Gen's.

- County Counsel responded to one question confirming they have no jurisdiction over Terra-Gen's Campo Wind proposed for the Campo Reservation
- Tisdale commented that any County actions, good or bad, can be used to try to influence Campo Wind decisions by the Bureau of Indian Affairs and others.
- Tule Wind has already used the County's statement in response to local complaints, implying that there is nothing to worry about.
- Jim Whalen reported that he did follow-up with Staff. If site visit takes place, it will not include a quorum. Several Commissioners may participate individually or at the same time.
- Michael Coyne reminded everyone that larger wind turbines were not studied for the 2019 Statement.
- ***M/S: Maupin/ Coyne: Authorize Chair to submit letter requesting formal withdrawal/revocation of the 2019 Public Health Position Statement on Human Health Effects from Wind Turbines: Passed: 6-0-0.***

F. GROUP BUSINESS & PROJECT UPDATES – DISCUSSION ONLY

3. ANNOUNCEMENTS & CORRESPONDENCE:

- Tisdale announced that placement of SVP Alan James has been approved for Jacumba. Dianne Jacob sent a letter showing map of local predators.
- Information has been received that Manzanita tribal members voted 20-1 on March 24th to authorize their Chairperson to continue pursuing about 13 or so industrial wind turbines for their 3,580 acre Reservation. Non-disclosure agreements were allegedly required to be signed before receiving project details.

4. REVITALIZATION REPORT:

- Yoga classes are available at the Backcountry Resource Center on the 2nd and last Tuesdays of the month at 5:00 PM. The next dates are April 9th and April 30th.
- YANA (You Are Not Alone) is a program for elderly, disabled, and shut-ins to be checked on monthly by the Sheriff Dept's Senior Patrol. Vacation checks are also available. Call Vicki at 619-938-8400 to sign up.
- Earth Day Celebration will be held at the Desert View Tower on April 20th from 9:00 AM – 6:00 PM.
- Friends of the Library meet on April 12th at 1:00 PM at the Jacumba Library.

5. FIRE SAFE COUNCIL REPORT:

- Fire Safe and Revitalization now meet on the same day at the Backcountry Resource Center.
- Fire Safe will meet at 6:30 PM and Revitalization will meet at 7:30 PM on April 18th, July 18th, and November 21st.
- Mountain Empire Disaster Preparedness Council will meet on April 9th at 1:30 PM at the Campo Community Center.
- There will be a Large & Small Animal Disaster Planning Workshop on Saturday, May 11th 12:00 – 3:00 PM at the Pine Valley Community Clubhouse. RSVP at 619-473-9050.
- 2019 Prepare in a Year Campaign will be taking place on Saturday, April 13th from 9:00-10:30 AM at the Boulevard, Pine Valley, and Potrero fire stations. There will be a limited supply of first aid kits handed out to those who come by.
- A County Hazardous Waste event will be on April 27th from 9:00 AM – 2:00 PM at 2001 Tavern Rd, Alpine.

6. TERRA-GEN'S BOULDER BRUSH LLC GEN-TIE LINE & SUBSTATION FACILITIES; HEIGHT LIMIT EXEMPTION: NOTICE OF PROJECT; BEGINNING OF ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT REVIEW AND PUBLIC PROCESS; PDSMUP-19-002; ER-19-16-001:

- No news on project.
- Tisdale reported finding documentation that Terra-Gen's 22 or so Alta Wind projects located in Tehachapi received \$552,133,973 in 1603 cash grants that are funded by taxpayers. Page with actual per project \$\$ figures was included in agenda packet.

7. **TERRA-GEN'S 252 MW - 60 TURBINE CAMPO WIND PLANNED FOR 2,200 ACRES OF THE CAMPO RESERVATION:**

- No News

8. **TERRA-GEN'S 126 MW – 30 TURBINE TORREY WIND PROJECT: PDS2018-MUP-18-014:**

- No news

9. **TULE WIND PHASE 1 – NOISE /COMMUNITY COMPLAINT CONTACTS:**

- Tisdale reported receiving an email from Tule Wind saying they had responded to the Guy and Morrison complaints and found no degradation of cell phone service. No Surprise there.
- Tule Wind also reported they are working on another study to evaluate low-frequency noise emissions and evaluating shadow flicker concerns.
- *Toll Free Project Hotline & Noise Complaints directly to Iberdrola /Avangrid: 855-369-9337; windcommunity@avangrid.com. Noise complaints can also be made to San Diego County Noise Control & Code Compliance: (858) 694-3741 or e-mail PDS.CodeCompliance@sdcountry.ca.gov ; and to BLM: Carrie Sahagun @ csahagun@blm.gov, 760-337-4437. It may be best to address complaints to Iberdrola/Avangrid and copy all the other contacts on every email complaint filed. Keep a record of all complaints and any responses.*

10. **TULE WIND PHASE II:**

- Jim Whalen responded that there was nothing new to report.

11. **74 MW RUGGED SOLAR: PDS2017-MUP-12-007W1 MAJOR USE PERMIT MODIFICATION-NEW PROJECT DESCRIPTION: MUP extended to February 2019:**

- Jim Whalen responded that he was expecting project news at 'any minute'.

12. **60 MW 420 ACRE BOULEVARD SOLAR MUP12-010TE PDS2012-3300-12-00 @ 796 Tierra Del Sol Road:**

- MUP was extended to February 2020 by project manager, Bronwyn Brown.

13. **100MW BOULEVARD ENERGY STORAGE FACILITY; PDS 2017-ZAP-17-006; MINOR USE PERMIT FOR 2 ACRE PROJECT LOCATED ON APN'S# 612-09-059; 612-09-019; 612-09-017, NEAR BOULEVARD SUBSTATION:**

- MUP was extended to August 15, 2019 by project manager Bronwyn Brown.

G. MEETING ADJOURNED @ 7:52 PM: NEXT MEETING SET FOR THURSDAY, MAY 2ND, 2019 @ BACKCOUNTRY RESOURCE CENTER.

Minutes were approved by Group on 5-2-19

Michele Strand, Secretary

For More information contact Donna Tisdale, Chair at 619-766-4170 or tisdale.donna@gmail.com ;

Current and past meeting agendas and approved minutes are posted on the County website @ <http://www.sandiegocounty.gov/content/sdc/pds/gpupdate/comm/blvd.html>

**Disclaimer Language included as directed by San Diego County PDS: Public Disclosure: We strive to protect personally identifiable information by collecting only information necessary to deliver our services. All information that may be collected becomes public record that may be subject to inspection and copying by the public, unless an exemption in law exists. In the event of a conflict between this Privacy Notice and any County ordinance or other law governing the County's disclosure of records, the County ordinance or other applicable law will control. Access and Correction of Personal Information: You can review any personal information collected about you. You may recommend changes to your personal information you believe is in error by submitting a written request that credibly shows the error. If you believe that your personal information is being used for a purpose other than what was intended when submitted, you may contact us. In all cases, we will take reasonable steps to verify your identity before granting access or making corrections.*