

**COUNTY OF SAN DIEGO  
BOULEVARD PLANNING GROUP (BPG)  
\*\*\*MINUTES/SUMMARY FOR MAY 2, 2019\*\*\***

**DATE & TIME:** 7:00 PM, Thursday, May 2, 2019

**MEETING LOCATION:** Backcountry Resource Center- Community Room, 39919 Ribbonwood Rd, Boulevard CA 91905 (modular behind old Boulevard Fire Station)

**A. MEMBERS PRESENT:** 1) Robert Maupin; 2) Earl Goodnight 3) Kevin Keane; 4) Donna Tisdale; 5) Michele Strand.  
**MEMBERS ABSENT:** 6) Michael Coyne (excused); 7) VACANT AS OF 5-2-19

**B. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE:** (OPTIONAL) (please silence cell phones)

**C. MINUTES/SUMMARY FOR APRIL 4TH MEETING:**

- *M/S: Keane/Maupin: Approve April 4<sup>th</sup> minutes/summary as written: Passed 5-0-0*

**D. PUBLIC COMMUNICATION:**

- Earl Goodnight reported that Jewel Valley Road paving is finally complete and it only took 3 years.
- Rent questions were raised for Boulevard Planning Group (BPG) meetings held in Community Room.
- Chair Tisdale confirmed that the County will pay for rent if requested, and it should be requested.
- Lorrie Ostrander raised concerns with the solar project planned near Lake Morena and asked if she could circulate a petition for signatures.
- Tisdale clarified that the petition was not affiliated with the BPG and it was up to individuals if they wanted to sign it.
- Tammy Daubach reported on a meeting set for the Campo Locket update.

**E. ACTION ITEMS (Agenda items may be taken out of order upon request):**

1. **SCOPING LETTER RELEASED (4-29-19): 90 MW JACUMBA VALLEY RANCH ENERGY PARK (JVR SOLAR) PDS2018-GPA-18-010, PDS2018-REZ-18-007, PDS2018-MUP-18-022; PDS2018-ER-18-22-001:**
  - Tisdale made the following comments:
    - Copies of the first 6 pages of 118 page scoping letter were included in packet. Anyone wanting a full copy can let her know and she will send it via email.
    - "Major Use Permit (MUP) Findings: A Major Use Permit will also be required. In accordance with Section 7358 of the Zoning Ordinance, it shall be found: a. That the location, size, design, and operating characteristics of the proposed use will be compatible with adjacent uses, residents, buildings, or structures, with consideration given to:
      - Harmony in scale, bulk, coverage and density; • The availability of public facilities, services and utilities; • The harmful effect, if any, upon desirable neighborhood character; • The generation of traffic and the capacity and physical character of surrounding streets; • The suitability of the site for the type and intensity of use or development which is proposed; and to • Any other relevant impact of the proposed use; and b. That the impacts, as described in paragraph "a" of this section, and the location of the proposed use will be consistent with the San Diego County General Plan. c. That the requirements of the California Environmental Quality Act have been complied with. "
    - "Please provide additional, quantitative information that accurately describes the scale, bulk, coverage and intensity of the proposed energy storage facility in relation to existing uses in the area. Please provide draft MUP Findings. Ongoing coordination between County staff and the applicant will be required to adequately

address the MUP findings. Staff cannot move forward with a recommendation until all findings are made. In addition, staff has identified several General Plan and community plan policies for which additional information will be needed to determine the project's compliance. Staff cannot move forward with a recommendation of approval until the project is found consistent with all applicable General Plan and community plan policies. "

- Potential adverse impacts to Visual, Cultural, Biological resources. Staff requested more information including evidence of permits for existing graded, brushed, and/or cleared land.
- "Fire Service Agreement: This project, along with all other development, has a cumulative impact on the emergency services for this community. Due to the unique nature of the proposed project, additional equipment/staff/training will likely be necessary. To mitigate for this impact, the project will be required to participate in an emergency services agreement with the San Diego County Fire Authority. Please see project issue checklist for additional fire comments".
- "ESTIMATE OF DISCRETIONARY PROCESSING COSTS AND SCHEDULE An estimate of discretionary processing time and costs that includes several assumptions has been generated for your project and is included in Attachment B. It is estimated that \$750,000.00-\$950,550.00 of County fees and deposits will be required to get the project through to a hearing. The total estimated time to process the proposed project is 25-35 months. Attachment B includes the County's standard applicant submittal dates, three EIR iterations, and a submittal occurring within 60 days of the resubmittal of the project. The estimated hearing date for this project is between Summer 2020 to Winter 2021"
- 2 articles included in agenda packet, (April 21 & 23), report on an explosion and substation battery fire in Surprise Arizona, on April 19, at a 2 MW battery next to McMicken Energy Storage facility in Arizona. 8 firefighters were hospitalized and 2 of the 8 were still hospitalized 4 days later. Officials said it was too early to assess the performance of the fire suppression system and that the fire remained under investigation by the utility, firefighters, and third party consultants. The battery owner, APS, has reportedly de-energized their other batter storage project as a precaution.
- Phoenix Fire Department spokesperson said "Basically you need to overwhelm it with more water than you think you would need," "lithium-ion batteries will reignite when drenched even after it appears the flames are out".
- Cherry Diefenbach asked if anyone knew the total number of individual solar panels on each module. She also reported that LAFCO was at the last Sponsor Group meeting. They want to preserve agriculture land. She also reported that the glider folks who use the Jacumba airport had not been informed about the project.
- Kevin Keane and Jim Whalen both commented that each module is likely considered as one panel.
- Additional general discussion.
- ***M/S: Keane/Maupin: Authorize Chair to submit comments on scoping letter to address any additional information, if time allows: Passed: 5-0-0 (Seat 6 absent; Seat 7 vacant)***

## 2. **2019 GENERAL PLAN CLEAN-UP DISCUSSION AND POTENTIAL ACTION:**

- Chair Tisdale pointed to the County's clean up summary included in the agenda package.
- 'Clean-up' items are limited to the following: Mapping errors; qualifying ownership changes; errors or omissions; internal clarifications, and inconsistencies; and/or minor community plan changes.

- Tisdale discussed the map she had included in the package of the Boulevard Planning Area outlined in blue with sections outlined in red that she proposed the BPG should request be included in our Planning Area.
- The marked parcels cannot be accessed through any other planning area due to their location at the north end of McCain Valley. And any project proposed on those lands will most likely impact Boulevard in one way or another.
- Jim Whalen commented that the marked parcels located east of McCain Valley Road were conserved as mitigation land for Tule Wind.
- Tisdale said she had not been aware of that but it should not impede the request for inclusion.
- ***M/S: Maupin/Goodnight: Authorize the Chair to submit the map with request for Boulevard Planning Area boundary adjustment to include areas outlined in red: Passed: 5-0-0 (Seat 6 absent; Seat 7 vacant)***

## **F. GROUP BUSINESS & PROJECT UPDATES – DISCUSSION ONLY:**

### **3. ANNOUNCEMENTS & CORRESPONDENCE:**

- Tisdale reported that the Campo Wind draft environmental report is expected to be released in May.
- She also reported on article in packet regarding the fact that in Illinois, the DeWitt County Board voted to reject Tradewind Energy Inc's \$300 million Alta Farms II wind project. The article demonstrates that some County Boards do act to protect their constituents from adverse impacts generated by industrial wind projects.

### **4. REVITALIZATION REPORT by Tammy Daubach:**

- A Pet/Microchip/Rabies Clinic will be held on May 25<sup>th</sup> from 9:00 AM – 1:00 PM at the Pine Valley Community Clubhouse. \$10 for micro chipping cats and dogs. \$10 for rabies vaccination.
- Supervisor Dianne Jacob's Backcountry Matrix Meeting will be on May 23<sup>rd</sup> at the Campo Community Center from 2:00 – 4:00 PM.
- Yoga at the Backcountry Resource Center will be at 6:00 PM on May 14<sup>th</sup> and 28<sup>th</sup>.
- Library Crafts at the Backcountry Resource Center for adults will be from 10:00 AM – Noon on May 8<sup>th</sup> and 22<sup>nd</sup>.
- Two toilets were installed at the Backcountry Resource Center. Looking into a way to get wifi and phone service down here. Also looking into a bigger bulletin board.
- Mountain Empire School Foundation that was started as a way for energy projects to donate to local schools for STEM wants to dissolve. Questions were raised about perceived conflict of interest for Mtn Empire school officials being seated on the Board.
- Jim Whalen, who initiated the Foundation for Tule Wind, suggested making the nonprofit dormant until money comes in from any additional projects.

### **5. FIRE SAFE COUNCIL REPORT by Tammy Daubach:**

- There will be a Large & Small Animal Disaster Planning Workshop on Saturday, May 11<sup>th</sup> from noon – 3:00 PM at the Pine Valley Community Clubhouse. RSVP at 619-473-9050.

### **6. UPDATE ON PLANNING COMMISSION'S APRIL 26 MEETING & ANY ACTION TAKEN ON REQUESTS TO REVOKE OR AMEND PUBLIC HEALTH POSITION STATEMENT ON HEALTH EFFECTS OF WIND TURBINES:**

- Tisdale stated that "we got slammed at the April 26<sup>th</sup> Planning Commission meeting on the Health Effects of Wind Turbines" and reported the following:

- 3 of the 4 Commissioners that had previously supported requests for Health Impact Assessment, changes in the wind ordinance, removal of the noise waiver, and more, were absent.
- That left Chairman Seiler to support us and 3 others supporting the wind industry and denying that turbines are causing adverse impacts to our residents. Was their absence a coincidence?
- Letters from the American Wind Energy Association (1,000 member companies), the California Wind Energy Association, Avangrid /Tule Wind, Clean-Tech of San Diego and WZI, inc (consulting firm) were submitted in support of the County's vastly inadequate Public Health Position Statement and denouncing our request to revoke it.
- Tule Wind's letter falsely stated that they have been producing clean renewable energy for the 'San Diego region'—when the energy is sold to Southern California Edison for the Los Angeles area. They also denounced all the evidence and testimony provided by our community members.
- Jim Whalen stood up at that meeting and said the Wind Ordinance and Noise Waiver work because they allowed Tule Wind turbines to be built and up and running as a good example of best management practices. No other noise sources regulated for "annoyance". Admitted Boulevard is disproportionately impacted but that is where the wind is. Invited Commissioners to tour Tule Wind – 1 hour tour. Has not seen any persuasive health data so don't fix is not broken.
- Nancy Radar from California Wind Energy Association read their letter that called us a "few naysayers" and urged the Commissioners to "not allow conspiracies, misinformation, and self-serving bias to delay or derail wind energy projects that are crucial for our public health and our planet."
- Nancy must have not recognized the irony of her obvious own 'self-serving bias' towards the industry that paid for her to be there to slander and degrade those who suffer basic torture from the turbines that they continue to push onto communities without shame.
- An epidemiologist named Kenneth Mundt, a paid advocate for wind industry, also spoke against us. He was in close conversation with Nancy Radar and Terra-gen's lobbyist, Chris Brown. Later he was seen getting in a car with Nancy Radar. It can be assumed that his biased testimony was paid for by the industry, if not directly by Terra-Gen.
- Clean –Tech's (trade association) Jason Anderson also called us "naysayers who peddle conspiracy theories about supposed harms of wind turbines... we must move forward and stop letting a very small minority stifle the advancement of our region's wind developments".
- The WZI letter focused on attempting to discredit the professional noise report on local testing conducted by Wilson Ihrig, a national firm.
- 2 Commissioners made comments against us that had obviously been industry influenced. The one commissioner that came out on her own, Calvo, said all she heard were airplanes and highway traffic and incorrectly said that new turbines don't make as much noise as older ones and seismic activity could also be generating local impacts. The WZI letter mentioned seismic impacts.
- Overall, the derogatory and dismissive comments, denying our real-world impacts, won the day.
- They needed 4 votes for any action but with Chairman Seiler supporting us, they could not get anything passed. That means that the 2019 Public Health Position Statement, denying adverse impacts from wind turbines, stands as is and will be used against us for Campo Wind, Torrey Wind and any other wind projects.

- Seiler said that the setback allowed by the Wind Ordinance of 1.1 x height of the turbine as ludicrous and that public health is at issue here.

- Jim Whalen commented that he was right there.
- Tisdale then asked him to confirm what she had stated, commenting that she had double checked her meeting notes by watching the meeting video.
- Whalen confirmed that the comments attributed to him were accurate.
- Charlie Good asked about property values that are a huge concern with these projects.
- Nancy Good reported being contacted by a real estate agent who denied knowledge of these turbine projects and asked where project evidence came from, leaving Nancy to conclude that realtors are not disclosing these projects to potential buyers in our area.
- Michele Strand said she had received a similar call and discussion.
- Kevin Keane said we should rely on facts and legitimate rock solid science.
- Tisdale responded that most research funding went to support wind energy with virtually zero going to research adverse health impacts or safe setbacks.
- Mary Dauphine asked about the construction process for these projects.
- Charlie Good reported knowledge that during construction of SDG&E's ECO Substation and related bulk water sales from the Campo Reservation the water permit allowed for about 12 tanker loads per day when they were actually hauling about 200 loads per day. They only stopped when the wells ran dry.
- Questions were raised about Manzanita's vote to authorize additional wind turbines.
- Tisdale reported that her sources claimed that a tribal vote passed in March to authorize pursuit of a lease.

**7. TERRA-GEN'S BOULDER BRUSH LLC GEN-TIE LINE & SUBSTATION FACILITIES; HEIGHT LIMIT EXEMPTION: NOTICE OF PROJECT; BEGINNING OF ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT REVIEW AND PUBLIC PROCESS; PDSMUP-19-002; ER-19-16-001:**

- Draft EIR is pending release for public comment in the next few months.

**8. TERRA-GEN'S 252 MW - 60 TURBINE CAMPO WIND PLANNED FOR 2,200 ACRES OF THE CAMPO RESERVATION:**

- Next public meeting will be when the joint Draft EIS/EIR is released which is currently expected to be sometime in May.

**9. TERRA-GEN'S 126 MW – 30 TURBINE TORREY WIND PROJECT: PDS2018-MUP-18-014:**

- Draft EIR is pending release for public comment in the next few months.

**10. TULE WIND PHASE 1 – NOISE /COMMUNITY COMPLAINT CONTACTS:**

- Tisdale reminded folks that if they are having problems with Tule Wind turbines, to please file complaints, including with Supervisor Dianne Jacob.
- *Toll Free Project Hotline & Noise Complaints directly to Iberdrola /Avangrid: 855-369-9337; [windcommunity@avangrid.com](mailto:windcommunity@avangrid.com). Noise complaints can also be made to San Diego County Noise Control & Code Compliance: (858) 694-3741 or e-mail [PDS.CodeCompliance@sdcountry.ca.gov](mailto:PDS.CodeCompliance@sdcountry.ca.gov); and to BLM: Carrie Sahagun @ [csahagun@blm.gov](mailto:csahagun@blm.gov), 760-337-4437. It may be best to address complaints to Iberdrola/Avangrid and copy all the other contacts on every email complaint filed. Keep a record of all complaints and any responses.*

11. TULE WIND PHASE II:

- Tule II is currently permitted to erect as many as 24 turbines with a capacity of 69 megawatts on land owned by the Ewiiapaayp Band of Kumeyaay Indians and State Lands Commission.

12. 74 MW RUGGED SOLAR: PDS2017-MUP-12-007W1 MAJOR USE PERMIT MODIFICATION-NEW PROJECT  
DESCRIPTON: MUP extended to August 2019: Jim Whalen reported no news.

13. 60 MW 420 ACRE BOULEVARD SOLAR MUP12-010TE PDS2012-3300-12-00 @ 796 Tierra Del Sol Road; MUP was renewed to February 2020:

- No news to report

14. 100MW BOULEVARD ENERGY STORAGE FACILITY; PDS 2017-ZAP-17-006; MINOR USE PERMIT FOR 2 ACRE PROJECT LOCATED ON APN'S# 612-09-059; 612-09-019; 612-09-017, NEAR BOULEVARD SUBSTATION: MUP extended to August 2019:

- No news to report.
- The Arizona battery fire articles should be kept in mind if this project moves forward

G. THE MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:52 PM: NEXT MEETNG SET FOR THURSDAY, JUNE 6<sup>TH</sup>, 2019 @ BACKCOUNTRY RESOURCE CENTER.

Minutes approved by Group on June 6, 2019

Michele Strand, Secretary:



*For More information* contact Donna Tisdale, Chair at 619-766-4170 or [tisdale.donna@gmail.com](mailto:tisdale.donna@gmail.com) ;

Current and past meeting agendas and approved minutes are posted on the County website @

<http://www.sandiegocounty.gov/content/sdc/pds/gpupdate/comm/blvd.html>

*\*Disclaimer Language included as directed by San Diego County PDS: Public Disclosure: We strive to protect personally identifiable information by collecting only information necessary to deliver our services. All information that may be collected becomes public record that may be subject to inspection and copying by the public, unless an exemption in law exists. In the event of a conflict between this Privacy Notice and any County ordinance or other law governing the County's disclosure of records, the County ordinance or other applicable law will control. Access and Correction of Personal Information: You can review any personal information collected about you. You may recommend changes to your personal information you believe is in error by submitting a written request that credibly shows the error. If you believe that your personal information is being used for a purpose other than what was intended when submitted, you may contact us. In all cases, we will take reasonable steps to verify your identity before granting access or making corrections.*