

**COUNTY OF SAN DIEGO
BOULEVARD PLANNING GROUP (BPG)
MINUTE/SUMMARY FOR JUNE 6, 2019**

Meeting called to order at 7:00 PM at Backcountry Resource Center- Community Room, 39919 Ribbonwood Rd, Boulevard CA 91905 (modular behind old Boulevard Fire Station)

A. MEMBERS PRESENT: 1) Robert Maupin; 4) Donna Tisdale; 5) Michele Strand; 6) Michael Coyne (arrived @ 7:05); 7) VACANT. **MEMBERS ABSENT:** 2) Earl Goodnight (excused); 3) Kevin Keane (excused)

B. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE: (OPTIONAL) (please silence cell phones)

C. ACT ON MINUTES/SUMMARY FOR MAY 2ND MEETING:

- **M/S:MAUPIN/COYNE: Approve May 4th minutes/summary as written: Passed: 4-0-0**

D. PUBLIC COMMUNICATION:

- No comments on non-agenda items. (About people 54 present)

E. ACTION ITEMS (Agenda items may be taken out of order upon request):

1. **VOTE NEEDED TO RESCHEDULE REGULAR MEETING THAT WOULD FALL ON JULY 4TH:**

- **M/S:STRAND/MAUPIN: Motion to move the BPG meeting from 7/4/19 to 7/11/19: Passed 4-0-0**

2. **60-4.2 MW TURBINE CAMPO WIND: DRAFT ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT STATEMENT (DEIS) RELEASED BY BUREAU OF INDIAN AFFAIRS FOR PUBLIC COMMENT. COMMENTS DUE JULY 8TH:**

- Chair Tisdale announced that the agenda package included some maps, notices, and visual simulations.
- She reported that Terra-Gen is making the rounds of our elected officials to get their approval for this massive and dangerous project. Our representatives need to hear from us, too. If we don't call them, all they will hear is Terra-Gen's side of the story.
- Terra-Gen's Campo Wind project along with their Boulder Brush Gen-Tie Substation project and Torrey Wind project are all one big project instead of the 3 smaller projects.
- Terra-Gen's 252 megawatt (MW) Campo Wind project includes 60- 4.2 MW wind turbines (586 ft tall) proposed for 2,200 acres of the Campo Reservation.
- Chair read through 1 page summary of project highlights that was also included in package.
- Project maps and documents are posted at www.campowind.com.
- Resident Murphy Smith (studied sound) discussed his review of professional independent wind turbine noise reports that confirmed his personal findings using equipment to measure and record low-frequency noise and infrasound at his home and elsewhere. His own home never goes below 69 dBL. That is too high. He offered to conduct testing at homes of willing residents. Discussed the issues with infrasound traveling through buildings and bodies miles away from turbines. Big issue that needs to be addressed.
- Manzanita tribal member spoke out again about all the suspicious cancer cases / epidemic on their reservation around the Kumeyaay Wind turbines BUT their Chairperson is still pursuing wind turbine project. Reported that at one point two women were each using a cell phone when a huge blue arc flashed between their phones. This occurred at the Manzanita Tribal office that is only about 800 ft or so from the turbines installed on Campo Reservation. She has reported her own health issues with the turbines but gets no response or support. Her brother and his wife abandoned their home on Campo land because the turbines were making them sick and miserable. The impacts are real. A lot of people are sick.

- General discussion with questions and concerns raised over locations of various project component, noise, water, lights, shadow flicker, property values, wildlife, traffic, more.
- Bob Maupin discussed his late wife's rare cancer that started after the 500kV Southwest Powerlink was installed through their land. He also stated that during monitored groundwater testing conducted by Dudek for Soitec's Tierra Del Sol Solar project his well dropped 100'.
- When asked who supported the Campo Wind project no one raised their hand.
- Chair reminded everyone how important it was to show up at the Bureau of Indian Affairs Meeting on the Campo Wind DEIS at 6 PM Wednesday, June 19, 2019 at the Campo Tribal Hall at corner of Hwy 94 and Church Road. And to send in comments.
- **Comments due by July 8th. Send to:** harold.hall@bia.gov ; Bronwyn.brown@sdcounty.ca.gov and Dianne.jacob@sdcounty.ca.gov, 858-495-5516. Include Campo Wind DEIS comments in the subject line.
- **M/S: Maupin/Coyne: Authorize Chair to submit comments on the Campo Wind DEIS opposing these projects: Passed: 4-0-0.**

3. **CAMPO WIND & BOULDER BRUSH GEN-TIE SCOPING LETTER RELEASED BY SAN DIEGO COUNTY ON MAY 24TH: PDSMUP-19-002; ER-19-16-001:**

- Chair reported that she had not yet had time to review the County's scoping letter for Campo Wind and Boulder Brush Gen-Tie.
- Same general discussion / concerns similar to Campo Wind DEIS.
- **M/S: Maupin/Strand: Authorize Chair to submit comments on Campo Wind and Boulder Brush scoping letter opposing these projects. Passed: 4-0-0.**

4. **ZONING ORDINANCE UPDATE FOR SMALL CELL (5G) WIRELESS FACILITIES: PUBLIC COMMENT ENDS JUNE 30:**

- Chair commented that the 5G roll out is very controversial.
- The industry claims that 5G is safe but others claim that public health impacts have not been addressed by the industry and government, similar to wind turbine impacts that have not been addressed.
- 5 G will require many more antennas that are much closer together and much closer to homes and other occupied structures.
- She reported that Scientists warn of potential serious health effects of 5G and read an excerpt: "We the undersigned, scientists and doctors, recommend a moratorium on the roll-out of the fifth generation, 5G, for telecommunication until potential hazards for human health and the environment have been fully investigated by scientists independent from industry. 5G will substantially increase exposure to radiofrequency electromagnetic fields (RF-EMF) on top of the 2G, 3G, 4G, Wi-Fi, etc. for telecommunications already in place. RF-EMF has been proven to be harmful for humans and the environment". As of May16, 2019 there are 235 signatorie, including over 30 in the US: <https://www.5gappeal.eu/signatories-to-scientists-5g-appeal/>
- Other comments supported 5G saying our kids need it for school. Don't want them left behind.
- Michael Coyne suggested we not oppose 5 G noting that the City of Santee is working on it now.
- General discussion
- Chair said she could not currently support 5G due to health concerns based on independent science and need for more indepth research before placing antennas too close to homes and other sensitive receptors. She would send in her personal comments as an individual.
- **No action taken on 5G Small Cell Wireless Facilities**

5. **REQUEST FOR VALID POPULATION DATA FOR BOULEVARD PLANNING AREA:**

- Chair asked for approval to request the appropriate agency to provide valid population data for Boulevard Planning Area in order to avoid the use of inaccurate data by developers as has happened repeatedly in the past.
- ***M/S: STRAND/COYNE: Authorize Chair to submit request to the appropriate agency for current and valid population data of the Boulevard Planning Group area. Passed 4-0-0.***

F. GROUP BUSINESS & PROJECT UPDATES – DISCUSSION ONLY:

1. **ANNOUNCEMENTS & CORRESPONDENCE:**

- The Chair announced that applications are being accepted to fill Seat #7, vacated by Ron Hynum. Applicants must be at least 18 years of age, a resident, and registered to vote in the Boulevard Planning Area.
- She reported asking Supervisor Jacob's office to find out the valuation and property taxes for Boulevard property in the 91905 zip code: Net Assessed Valuation for 2018/19: \$174,185,625; Tax Rate 1.05669; Tax Levied: \$1,840,602.08
- SDG&E has proposed a 10 MW energy storage project at Boulevard Substation that we were never notified of. Their 10 MW ECO Substation energy storage project was withdrawn from the CAISO grid queue in 2015.
- Terra-Gen's 155MW Humbolt Wind project proposes up to 60 turbines, 591feet tall near scenic Ferndale along the Redwood Coast and Hwy 101.
- Unlike Boulevard, Terra-Gen actually held a public meeting for that community:
<https://lostcoastoutpost.com/2019/may/29/wind-energy-project-proponents-give-presentation-s/>
- They also held a community meeting near Tehachapi for the Pahnamin Wind project back in 2011. They withdrew the application a short time later after public outcry and stated opposition from the area's County Supervisor that the project did not meet community character:
http://www.tehachapinews.com/news/terra-gen-pulls-the-plug-on-pahnamid-project/article_eb75534e-1d4c-5a1a-a4ba-7035c62eca4b.html
- June 5th LA Times article: **California has too much solar power:** "On May 27 around 1 p.m., solar plant operators shut off a record total of about 4,700 megawatts of capacity at the same time — nearly 40% of the entire solar capacity installed on the California grid" . <https://www.latimes.com/business/la-fi-solar-batteries-renewable-energy-california-20190605-story.html>
- Pattern Energy's K2 Wind project in Ontario Canada is being ordered to shut down and correct noise issues from their 140-2.3MW Siemen's wind turbines. Locals conducted Freedom of information act request and found that over 400 complaints had come in with little to no response until now. The order includes Limiting the number of hours during a twenty-four (24) hour period during which the Equipment operates;De-rating the wind turbines to reduce the Sound Levels emitted from the Equipment; or Curtailing the operation of the Equipment under specific conditions, such as wind speed and direction.
- Pattern energy is the same company that built Ocotillo Wind using the same turbines as they did in Canada.

2. **REVITALIZATION REPORT by Tammy Daubach:** New community bulletin boards.

3. **FIRE SAFE COUNCIL REPORT by Tammy Duabach:** SDG&E Workshop 5-7:30 Tues June 11 at Backcountry Resource

4. **TERRA-GEN'S 126 MW TORREY WIND PROJECT WITH 30-4.2 MW TURBINES: PDS2018-MUP-18-014:** Manager: Bronwyn.Brown@sdcounty.ca.gov ; 858-495-5516.

- ***Draft EIR is expected to be released in next few months***

5. **90 MW JACUMBA VALLEY RANCH ENERGY PARK (JVR SOLAR) PDS2018-GPA-18-010, PDS2018-REZ-18-007, PDS2018-MUP-18-022; PDS2018-ER-18-22-001:**
 - No news
6. **TULE WIND PHASE 1 – NOISE /COMMUNITY COMPLAINT CONTACTS:** Toll Free Project Hotline & Noise Complaints directly to Iberdrola /Avangrid: 855-369-9337; windcommunity@avangrid.com. Noise complaints can also be made to San Diego County Noise Control & Code Compliance: (858) 694-3741 or e-mail PDS.CodeCompliance@sdcountry.ca.gov; and to BLM: Carrie Sahagun @ csahagun@blm.gov, 760-337-4437. It may be best to address complaints to Iberdrola/Avangrid and copy all the other contacts on every email complaint filed. Keep a record of all complaints and any responses.
7. **TULE WIND PHASE II:** Tule II is currently permitted to erect as many as 24 turbines with a capacity of 69 megawatts on land owned by the Ewiiapaayp Band of Kumeyaay Indians and State Lands Commission: <http://www.sandiegouniontribune.com/business/energy-green/sd-fi-tule-appeal-20170505-story.html>
 - Turbines locations for Tule II are reportedly being worked out now.
 - No new information from Jim Whalen.
8. **74 MW RUGGED SOLAR: PDS2017-MUP-12-007W1 MAJOR USE PERMIT MODIFICATION-NEW PROJECT**
DESCRIPTON: MUP extended to August 2019: County Project Manager: Bronwyn.brown@sdcountry.ca.gov; 858-495-5516.
 - No new information
9. **60 MW 420 ACRE BOULEVARD SOLAR MUP12-010TE PDS2012-3300-12-00 @ 796 Tierra Del Sol Road; MUP was renewed to February 2020:**
 - Invenegy has withdrawn from Soitec's previous Major Use Permit (MUP) (formerly Tierra Del Sol Solar), and certified EIR Log No 3910-120005. Property owner Joe Brown is reportedly marketing the project himself.
10. **100MW BOULEVARD ENERGY STORAGE FACILITY; PDS 2017-ZAP-17-006; MINOR USE PERMIT FOR 2 ACRE PROJECT LOCATED ON APN'S# 612-09-059; 612-09-019; 612-09-017, NEAR BOULEVARD SUBSTATION: MUP extended to August 2019:**
 - Current status of 100MW energy storage is unknown

G. MEETING ADJOURNED AT 8:22. NEXT MEETING DATE JULY 11, 2019 @ BACKCOUNTRY RESOURCE CENTER.

Minutes were approved by the Group on July 11, 2019

Donna Tisdale, Chair: 

For More information contact Donna Tisdale, Chair at 619-766-4170 or tisdale.donna@gmail.com ;

Current and past meeting agendas and approved minutes are posted on the County website @

<http://www.sandiegocounty.gov/content/sdc/pds/gpupdate/comm/blvd.html>

**Disclaimer Language included as directed by San Diego County PDS: Public Disclosure: We strive to protect personally identifiable information by collecting only information necessary to deliver our services. All information that may be collected becomes public record that may be subject to inspection and copying by the public, unless an exemption in law exists. In the event of a conflict between this Privacy Notice and any County ordinance or other law governing the County's disclosure of records, the County ordinance or other applicable law will control. Access and Correction of Personal Information: You can review any personal information collected about you. You may recommend changes to your personal information you believe is in error by submitting a written request that credibly shows the error. If you believe that your personal information is being used for a purpose other than what was intended when submitted, you may contact us. In all cases, we will take reasonable steps to verify your identity before granting access or making corrections.*