

**COUNTY OF SAN DIEGO
BOULEVARD PLANNING GROUP (BPG)
MINUTES /SUMMARY FOR JANUARY 2, 2020**

DATE & TIME: 7:00 PM, Thursday, January 2, 2020

MEETING LOCATION: Backcountry Resource Center- Community Room, 39919 Ribbonwood Rd, Boulevard CA 91905

A. ROLL CALL (Determination of quorum): 1) VACANT; 2) Earl Goodnight 3) Kevin Keane; 4) Donna Tisdale; 5) Michele Strand (arrived @ 7:10); 6) Michael Coyne; 7) Nancy Good (Applications being accepted to fill vacant Seat #1)

B. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE: (OPTIONAL) (please silence cell phones)

C. ACT ON DRAFT MINUTES/SUMMARY DECEMBER 12TH MEETING:

- *M/S: Coyne/Good: Accept minutes (12-12-19) as corrected: Passed 5-0-0*

D. PUBLIC COMMUNICATION: Opportunity for public comment on any subject matter within the Group's jurisdiction that is not on the posted agenda. No action can be taken on non-agenda items. Items can be added on future agendas.

E. ACTION ITEMS (Agenda items may be taken out of order upon request):

1. **ACTION ON DRAFT ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT (DEIR) FOR BOULDER BRUSH GEN-TIE /SUBSTATION FOR 60-CAMPO WIND AND 30-TORREY WIND TURBINES; PDSMUP-19-002; ER-19-16-001; PUBLIC MEETING SET FOR 6 PM THURSDAY, JANUARY 23RD, AT BACKCOUNTRY RESOURCE CENTER (OLD BOULEVARD FIRE STATION). PUBLIC COMMENT ENDS FEBRUARY 3RD:**
 - Chair Tisdale pointed to 2-page summary she produced of the initial issues/concerns with the Boulder Brush-Campo Wind DEIR. Members of the public asked her to go through that list point by point.
 - Chair Tisdale reminded everyone that this Draft EIR is under County jurisdiction for Boulder Brush facilities proposed for private land and their evaluation of the connected Campo Wind turbines proposed for Campo Reservation land.
 - The County has no jurisdiction on the Campo Reservation.
 - The Campo tribes' Land Use Plan and Campo Land Use Code do not apply to the Campo Wind project.
 - The Boulevard Planning Group (BPG) submitted a formal 33-page letter to the County on their Notice of Project from the BPG on March 18, 2019, as authorized by the unanimous vote taken on March 7th, with two members absent.
 - Another BPG letter was submitted to the Bureau of Indian affairs on July 8th opposing Terra-Gen's Campo Wind project / Draft EIS, as authorized by vote taken on June 6th.
 - Letters from our Planning Group do not make up for personal comments that need to be submitted by 4PM February 3rd. The need for public participation cannot be stressed enough.
 - **ES.3 Areas of Controversy CEQA Guidelines Section 15123(b) (2) requires that an EIR identify areas of controversy, including issues raised by other agencies and the public. Areas of known controversy associated with the Project that are relevant to the EIR are as follows:**

- Aesthetics • Lighting from the wind turbines • Degraded views • Shadow flicker from the wind turbines
Biological Resources • Avian species strikes • Wildlife migratory routes Hazards • Public concerns of health effects including: • Exposure to electric and magnetic fields (EMF) • Exposure to low-frequency noise • Exposure to shadow flicker • Oil leakage from generators Hydrology • Availability of groundwater • Contamination of the water table • Noise from wind turbines • Noise from construction • Infrasound and low-frequency noise Wildfire • Fire hazards
- **See BPG agenda package (1-2-20) for copies of the Legal Notice with directions for commenting; 2 maps (including view shed map); list of mitigation measures; and two pages of Table ES-1 listing the 14 significant and unavoidable impacts all related to Campo Wind turbines that are proposed to connect to the Boulder Brush high voltage line, new substation / switchyard, and Sunrise Powerlink:**
 - Aesthetics related to Boulder Brush facilities, size and scale of turbines, alteration of visual landscape, degradation of existing vistas from surrounding roads; impacts of night lighting on turbines; cumulative impacts on visual environment; direct loss of County's List A & B special status plants during construction; permanent direct impacts to habitat for special status-wildlife species; direct impacts to sensitive vegetation communities within the Campo Wind Corridor; Permanent direct impacts to RPO wetland and wetland buffer; potential cumulative project impacts to sensitive plants and vegetation communities; potentially significant noise impact due to operation wind turbines; potentially significant noise impacts to noise-sensitive land uses On-reservation; Cumulative noise impacts with regard to the Ldn Guidance Limit.
- **There are another 9.5 pages listing impacts that are less than significant due to alleged mitigation measures.**
 - They do recognize and admit the increased risk of wildfire for Boulder Brush facilities and Campo Wind but allege that it will be mitigated by the related Fire Protection Plans.
 - They also allege that all traffic / road impacts will be also be mitigated.
- **Water:**
 - 173 AF (123 AF for Campo Wind Facilities and 50 AF for Boulder Brush Facilities) needed for 14 month construction phase.
 - Water sources include: Same On-Reservation wellfield that was run dry during construction of ECO Substation, and/or JCSD and Pine Valley MWD Off-Reservation supply sources.
 - A 2019 groundwater investigation prepared by Dudek (2019a) claims that JCSD Well 6 can provide up to 100,000 gpd (112 AFY) of untreated non-potable groundwater for construction use.
 - JCSD Highland Center Well can reportedly provide up to 174 gpm (and a maximum of 20 GPD from the Park Well) of untreated non-potable groundwater for construction use.
 - 930 Acres of Temporary and Permanent Disturbance.
 - Estimated 1,349,550 Cubic Yards of Fill Soil (26,000 cubic yards for Boulder Brush)
 - 37,700 cubic yards of concrete required.
 - Approximately 250,000 gpd would be required during peak construction demand, which would occur over the first 3 months of construction. For the remainder of
- **Errors & Omissions:**
 - There are numerous errors and omissions throughout the Draft EIR, including factual and mapping errors that should be included in comment letters.
- **ES.5 Project Alternatives**

- The County selected a range of alternatives to the Project that would attain most of the basic objectives of the Project, would be feasible to implement, and would avoid or substantially lessen one or more of the significant effects of the Project. Accordingly, the following alternatives to the Project were selected:
 - Alternative 1: No Project Alternative
 - Alternative 2: No Boulder Brush Facilities on Private Lands Alternative
 - Alternative 3: Alternative Gen-tie Route within Boulder Brush Boundary
 - Alternative 4: Underground Gen-tie within Boulder Brush Boundary Alternative
- **There is another alternative not mentioned:** Place the Boulder Brush facilities at the SW corner of the Campo Reservation and connect the Campo Wind project to the existing 500 kV Southwest Powerlink. This alternative would further impact off-reservation residents living along Tierra Del Sol Road and southern end of Shockey Truck Trail the most. There are no tribal homes near that SW corner.
- Public discussion took place, including but not limited to the following:
 - **Pam Guy (former Boulevard Volunteer Firefighter):** The Project will cause fires that will be hard to reach in time; notification of blasting must be provided to neighbors; Tule Wind failed to notify neighbors of blasting that startled neighbors, livestock and pets; not all Ribbonwood Road residents have been made aware of this Project; it was great when noisy and annoying Tule Wind turbines were shut down for 2 weeks or so in December 2019.
 - **Byron Polen:** asked about separation between last Campo Wind turbine and Southwest Powerlink in SW corner of Campo Reservation. He lives adjacent to the SE corner of the Reservation and BIA 10 where 7 turbines are proposed along with the O&M, rock crushing and other components are proposed.
 - Kevin Keane: The political battle over wind turbines is currently even more fierce in Germany where communities are pushing back. We need to get word out to Bed & Breakfast type operations.
 - **Andy DeGroot:** Turbines are not clean. You can see oil dripping down the sides of Kumeyaay Wind turbines. They had to park a semi-trailer between their home and the turbines to block FAA required flashing red turbine night lighting.
 - **Consensus:** Ask County staff to hold Q & A session at January 23rd, Boulder Brush-Campo Wind DEIR meeting in Boulevard instead of the usual individual stations and one and one conversations. Everyone needs to hear each question, comments, and Staff responses.
- **The Chair reviewed her recommendations for two votes in the following order:**
 - Alternative 1: No Project Alternative
 - Alternative 2: No Boulder Brush Facilities on Private Lands Alternative
 - Alternative 4: Underground Gen-tie within Boulder Brush Boundary
 - Alternative 3: Alternative Gen-tie Route within Boulder Brush Boundary
 - 5th potentially viable alternative that can be included in Alternative 2:
 - Move Boulder Brush facilities to Southwest corner of Campo Reservation and connect to grid via existing Southwest Powerlink, thereby keeping all project components on Campo tribal land, avoiding use of private along with Manzanita and La Posta tribal lands.
 - **M/S: Strand/Goodnight: Endorse recommended order of preference for Project Alternatives (1,2,4,3) including 5th potentially viable alternative: Move Boulder Brush facilities to Southwest corner of Campo Reservation and connect to grid via existing Southwest Powerlink, thereby keeping all project components on Campo tribal land, avoiding use of private along with Manzanita and La Posta tribal land: Passed: 6-0-0**
 - **M/S:Goodnight/Strand: Authorize Chair to submit letter of opposition to Boulder Brush / Campo Wind project, reflecting preferred order of alternatives along with appropriate comments and corrections on the Draft EIR document: Passed: 6-0-0**

2. **ANNUAL ELECTION OF OFFICERS:** Group will vote to elect Chair, Vice-Chair, and Secretary to serve for 2020.

- Chair: *M/S: Keane/Good: Nominate Donna Tisdale as Chair for 2020: Passed: 6-0-0*
- Vice-Chair: *M/S: Tisdale/Keane: Nominate Earl Goodnight as Vice-Chair for 2020: Passed: 6-0-0*
- Secretary: *M/S: Tisdale/Coyne: Nominate Michele Strand as Secretary for 2020: Passed: 6-0-0*

F. GROUP BUSINESS & PROJECT UPDATES – DISCUSSION ONLY:

1. **ANNOUNCEMENTS & CORRESPONDENCE:** Applications for vacant Seat #1 are being accepted.

- **Chair Tisdale reported that on Dec 17, the Humboldt County Board of Supervisors on Tuesday voted 4-1 to deny the Terra-Gen wind energy project, rejecting a widely controversial plan to build wind turbines on the Bear River and Monument ridges above Scotia.**
- Michael Coyne commented that Humboldt County Supervisors are generally more politically liberal than San Diego County Supervisors and that could help limit some criticisms of community opposition when future Campo Wind / Torrey Wind decisions are made.
- Under new US spending bill, wind energy projects would be able to qualify for a 30% Investment Tax Credit if they start construction by Jan. 1, 2021 – as opposed to current law requiring them to break ground by Jan. 1, 2020 to get the credit, according to the amendment. The bill preserves a planned reduction scheduled to begin next year in an investment tax credit for solar companies, a setback for solar companies that had been lobbying hard for an extension,
- Tule Wind turbines were forced off/curtailed between December 4 and December 19. No word what the problem was.
- According to the CAISO's grid queue report dated 1/1/2020:
 - Empire Ranch's 20 MW Starlight Solar project's current online date is 12/15/2022, pushed back from 6/1/2020
 - 256 MW Energia Sierra Juarez Wind expansion's current online date is 1/19/2021
 - 352 MW Energia Sierra Juarez Wind 3's current online date is 12/31/23
 - 300 MW Obsidian Wind project in Mexico (ECO Substation) current online date is 12/1/24
 - 400 MW Mount Laguna Wind 2's current online date is 6/1/2020 (Suncrest-Ocotillo 500kV)
 - 400 MW Boulder Oaks Hybrid wind / battery project's current online date is 9/30/2021 (ECO Sub-Miguel 500kV)
 - 90 MW Kettle One Solar (JVR?) current online date is 12/1/2021
 - 965,241 MWh of wind and solar were curtailed in 2019 to mitigate local congestion and /or oversupply: http://www.caiso.com/Documents/Wind_SolarReal-TimeDispatchCurtailementReportDec31_2019.pdf
 - Kevin Keane commented that the CPUC also voted to keep some gas-fired generation online.

2. **REVITALIZATION REPORT & FIRE SAFE COUNCIL REPORT:**

- Tammy Daubach was not available to provide report for January meeting.

3. **COMMUNITY CHOICE ALTERNATIVE UPDATE:** Community choice entities in San Diego and other counties are being lobbied to buy energy from backcountry wind and solar projects.

4. **60-4.2 MW TURBINE CAMPO WIND: FINAL ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT STATEMENT (DEIS) EXPECTED TO BE RELEASED BY BUREAU OF INDIAN AFFAIRS FOR PUBLIC COMMENT AFTER THE FIRST OF THE YEAR:**
5. **TERRA-GEN'S 126 MW TORREY WIND PROJECT WITH 30-4.2 MW TURBINES: PDS2018-MUP-18-014: NO ESTIMATED DRAFT EIR TIMELINE AVAILABLE:**
 - No news
6. **90 MW JACUMBA VALLEY RANCH ENERGY PARK (JVR SOLAR) PDS2018-GPA-18-010, PDS2018-REZ-18-007, PDS2018-MUP-18-022; PDS2018-ER-18-22-001; DRAFT EIR PENDING:**
 - No news
7. **TULE WIND PHASE 1 – NOISE /COMMUNITY COMPLAINT CONTACTS:**
 - Tule Wind responded on Dec 30 to my Nov 6th request, saying they sent a report to BLM to address the noise complaints and they are still working on the development of Phase 2 and there are no details to share at this time.
 - I responded with a request for a copy of the report they sent to BLM and the name of the contact there.
8. **TULE WIND PHASE II:** Tule II is currently permitted to erect up to 24 new turbines on State land and the Ewiiapayaap Reservation, with a capacity of 69 megawatts.
9. **74 MW RUGGED SOLAR: PDS2017-MUP-12-007W1 MAJOR USE PERMIT MODIFICATION-NEW PROJECT DESCRIPTOR: Applicant submitted new documents on Oct 29th deadline:**
 - The CAISO Public Grid Queue report shows current online date of 7/30/2020
10. **60 MW 420 ACRE BOULEVARD SOLAR MUP12-010TE PDS2012-3300-12-00 @ 796 Tierra Del Sol Road; Application extension renewed to February 2020:**
 - This project is no longer in the CAISO grid queue. So any new developers would need to apply to get in line.

G. ADJOURNMENT: NEXT MEETING SET FOR FEBRUARY 6, 2020 @ BACKCOUNTRY RESOURCE CENTER.

For More information contact Donna Tisdale, Chair at 619-766-4170 or tisdale.donna@gmail.com ; Current and past meeting agendas and approved minutes are posted on the County website @ <http://www.sandiegocounty.gov/content/sdc/pds/gpupdate/comm/blvd.html>

Minutes approved by Group on: February 6, 2020

Minutes submitted by Michele Strand, Secretary:



**Disclaimer Language included as directed by San Diego County PDS: Public Disclosure: We strive to protect personally identifiable information by collecting only information necessary to deliver our services. All information that may be collected becomes public record that may be subject to inspection and copying by the public, unless an exemption in law exists. In the event of a conflict between this Privacy Notice and any County ordinance or other law governing the County's disclosure of records, the County ordinance or other applicable law will control. Access and Correction of Personal Information: You can review any personal information collected about you. You may recommend changes to your personal information you believe is in error by submitting a written request that credibly shows the error. If you believe that your personal information is being used for a purpose other than what was intended when submitted, you may contact us. In all cases, we will take reasonable steps to verify your identity before granting access or making corrections.*