

3.1.7 Recreation

This section of the environmental impact report (EIR) describes the existing on- and off-site recreational resources within the Project Area and vicinity, and analyzes the potential effects of Otay Ranch Village 14 and Planning Areas 16/19 (Proposed Project) on those resources. This section identifies the recreational facilities that would be constructed as part of the Proposed Project, and analyzes whether development of those facilities would result in adverse environmental impacts. Information provided in this section was incorporated from the following sources: the Otay Ranch Final Program EIR (Otay Ranch PEIR) (City of Chula Vista and County of San Diego 1993a), the San Diego County General Plan (County of San Diego 2011a), the San Diego County General Plan EIR (County of San Diego 2011b), and the Otay Ranch Village 14 and Planning Areas 16/19 Public Facilities Finance Plan (PFFP) prepared by Development Planning and Financing Group and included as Appendix 3.1.6-1 of this EIR.

This section tiers from the 1993 Otay Ranch PEIR because the Proposed Project is within the boundaries of the Otay Ranch General Development Plan/Otay Subregional Plan, Volume II (Otay Ranch GDP/SRP) (City of Chula Vista and County of San Diego 1993b), and development of the Project Area was analyzed in the Otay Ranch PEIR. The Otay Ranch PEIR determined that impacts to parkland, recreation facilities, and open space would be potentially significant and recommended mitigation measures be implemented at the specific plan amendment level to ensure that project-related impacts would be less than significant with mitigation incorporated.

Following the issuance of the Notice of Preparation (NOP) for the Proposed Project, the lead agency, the County of San Diego (County), received multiple comment letters from private entities regarding recreation. Comments included recommendations to analyze trail connections and use by the community, the balance of recreational uses with natural resources preservation, development of nature-based trail loops, and potential impacts on the existing trail network. The analysis presented in this section addresses these topics.

3.1.7.1 Existing Conditions

3.1.7.1.1 Environmental Setting

The Project Area is currently undeveloped private property and contains no parks or permitted recreational facilities. The County of San Diego, City of San Diego, and City of Chula Vista provide recreational areas and facilities in the areas surrounding the Project Area. It is worth noting that unauthorized off-road bicycle and off-road-vehicle use occurs in the Project Area. To reduce potential effects of these activities, guard rails and signage have been installed along Proctor Valley Road, limiting off-road vehicle usage; however, illegal trespassing by mountain bikers still occurs.

County Recreational Facilities

Within unincorporated San Diego County, there are nearly 50,000 acres of recreational facilities, including local and regional parks, fishing lakes, community centers, special use facilities, and preserves. The nearest County Park is the Otay Lakes County Park, located approximately 3 miles south of the Project Area. In addition, a system of regional and community trails provides public recreational opportunities throughout the San Diego region. The following section describes the types of recreational facilities within San Diego County that are owned, operated, and/or maintained by the County of San Diego Department of Parks and Recreation.

Local Parks

Local parks include mini-parks, neighborhood parks, and community parks. The County General Plan (County of San Diego 2011a) identifies a goal of 10 acres per 1,000 residents for local parks. Mini-parks are typically less than 1 acre and serve a limited population who live, work, or shop in a distinct area. Neighborhood parks typically range from 5 to 10 acres and serve a residential area. Neighborhood parks provide active and passive recreational areas. Community parks serve the community as a whole and range from 20 to 50 acres. As of 2007, the County was deficient by 3,966 acres of local parks, and had a ratio of approximately 2 acres per 1,000 residents (County of San Diego 2011b). There are no existing County local parks in the vicinity of the Project Area.

Regional Parks

Regional parks serve County residents and visitors and are often larger than 200 acres, although smaller facilities may be appropriate for specific sites of regional interest. Most regional parks contain open spaces, natural resources, cultural resources, and multi-use trails. Most regional parks also contain a local park element by serving as the recreational outlet for a community. The County's acreage goal for regional park facilities is 15 acres per 1,000 residents (County of San Diego 2011a). As of 2007, there were approximately 17 acres of regional parkland per 1,000 residents (County of San Diego 2011b). Otay Valley Regional Park, Sweetwater Summit Regional Park, and Otay Lakes County Park are regional parks in the vicinity of the Project Area.

Otay Valley Regional Park

Otay Valley Regional Park represents one of the major open space areas within southern San Diego County, extending about 11 miles from the southeastern edge of the San Diego Bay National Wildlife Refuge, through the Otay River Valley, to the land surrounding both the Lower and Upper Otay Reservoirs. The park is envisioned to ultimately encompass more than 8,000 acres. It currently provides residents and visitors with recreational opportunities ranging from picnic areas and overlooks to hiking, biking, and horse trails. As this regional park is built out it

will provide playing fields, interpretive centers, and additional local park elements and trails. The park protects open space, wildlife, historic, agricultural, and archaeological resources. Otay Valley Regional Park is a multi-jurisdictional planning effort by the County and the Cities of San Diego and Chula Vista (OVRP 2015).

Sweetwater Summit Regional Park

The 500-acre Sweetwater Summit Regional Park offers modern campsites, including corrals for equestrians who want to bring their horses and explore the miles of trails in the area. Hundreds of acres of streamside vegetation, grasslands, and open areas provide a variety of habitats for hikers, horseback riders, and mountain bikers (County of San Diego 2016a).

Otay Lakes County Park

Otay Lakes County Park encompasses 78 acres in southern San Diego County. The park has one site available for reservation that can accommodate up to 100 people, four additional sites for walk-in visitors, a playground, horseshoe pits, hiking trails, open green space, and a native plant/demonstration garden (OLCP 2015).

Trails

Trails provide recreational opportunities, allow the public to enjoy parks and open space preserves, and provide connections between recreation uses. The County Trail Program is addressed in detail in the Community Trails Master Plan (County of San Diego 2005). Planned trails in the vicinity of the Project Area include the Otay Valley Regional Park Trail, Upper Otay Reservoir Trail, Chula Vista Greenbelt Trail/Centennial Trail, and the California Riding and Hiking Trail, among others (County of San Diego 2011b).

Recreation Facilities

County recreational facilities include community centers, teen centers, and gymnasiums, and are operated and maintained by County staff, volunteers, and service contracts (County of San Diego 2011b). Additional nearby recreational facilities not owned or managed by the County include the Monteville Recreation Center located approximately 2 miles west of the Project Area with sport courts and fields, a recreation center, a dog area, and picnic tables; and the Chula Vista Elite Athlete Training Center located approximately 1 mile southwest of the Project Area with 155 acres of sports fields, training/weight rooms, housing, and dining areas.

Preserves

Preserves include areas of environmental significance and beauty. The purpose of preserves is to protect community character, biological, cultural, and historical resources, and to make these resources available for public recreation opportunities (County of San Diego 2011a). Typically, only minimal improvements such as trails, parking, and restroom facilities are found in preserves. Some preserves may also provide interpretive or educational amenities. Preserves vary in size depending on the resources being protected, and public access can be limited according to the sensitivity of the resources. The County's system of preserves totals approximately 26,000 acres, and preserves are located primarily in the western and central areas of the County (County of San Diego 2011b).

Specific to Otay Ranch, the Otay Ranch Resource Management Plan (RMP) Preserve (within the County Multiple Species Conservation Program (MSCP) Subarea Plan and City of Chula Vista MSCP Subarea Plan), will encompass approximately 11,375 acres when completed and will be a fully funded, managed preserve system.

Federally Owned Lands

The federal government owns approximately 591,930 acres of predominantly open space land within the County. The U.S. Forest Service manages 291,380 acres in the Cleveland National Forest, including Corral Canyon Park, a park that allows off-highway vehicle activities; the Bureau of Land Management (BLM) manages 170,839 acres of land in the region; the Department of Defense manages 123,810 acres on Camp Pendleton; and the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service operates the San Diego National Wildlife Refuge, Tijuana Slough National Wildlife Reserve, and Sweetwater Marsh Wildlife Refuge, which collectively total 5,753 acres. The San Diego National Wildlife Refuge was formed in 1996 to manage the required federal contribution to the MSCP. The federal government provides for the management, conservation, and development of water, wildlife, forest, range, and recreational resources within these landholdings (County of San Diego 2011b). The nearest BLM land is the 18,500-acre Otay Wilderness, located approximately 3 miles south of the Project Area (County of San Diego 2011b).

State-Owned Lands

State lands offer a variety of recreational facilities and opportunities, including camp sites, trails, and swimming areas; however, the principal reason for land acquisition by the state is natural resource protection. State lands within the County provide 557,552 acres of public open space and parkland (County of San Diego 2011b). Portions of the state-owned Rancho Jamul Ecological Reserve are located within the Otay Ranch GDP/SRP and extend beyond the east boundary of the Otay Ranch

GDP/SRP. The Rancho Jamul Ecological Reserve covers 5,600 acres and is only open to the public for special events (California Department of Fish and Wildlife 2017).

Local Government-Owned and Public Utility-Owned Lands

Land owned by water and irrigation districts feature natural open space, reservoirs, and protected water bodies. Many irrigation districts provide multi-use trails and staging areas, such as Olivenhain Water District in the San Dieguito Community Planning Area, and the Otay Water District and Sweetwater Authority, both in the Sweetwater Community Planning Area. Recreational uses, including fishing and limited boating, are generally permitted on reservoirs owned and managed by the City of San Diego Public Utilities Department. Within the vicinity of the Project Area, the City of San Diego owns the Upper and Lower Otay Reservoirs, both of which permit fishing and limited use of personal water craft. The reservoirs also have surrounding informal footpaths, which often receive unauthorized use by mountain bikers and hikers (County of San Diego 2011b).

City of Chula Vista

As of 2017, the City of Chula Vista (City) has nearly 560 acres of regional, neighborhood, and community parks, and public mini-parks. The following City-owned recreational facilities are within 5 miles of the Project Area (City of Chula Vista 2016):

- Monteville Community Center
- Salt Creek Community Park
- Chula Vista Community Park
- Mount San Miguel Community Park
- Mountain Hawk Park
- Mackenzie Creek Park
- Windingwalk Park
- Sunset View Park
- Scobee Park
- All Seasons Park
- Harvest Park
- Tiffany Park
- Bonita Long Canyon Park

Privately Owned Open Space Lands

The range of privately owned open space lands in the County includes private parks, private nature preserves, private land banks, golf courses, club playing fields, landscaped outdoor areas, and facilities such as animal or off-highway-vehicle parks. Private open space also includes floodplains, steep slope areas, seismic hazard zones, and sensitive habitats over which the County has land use authority. Many of these lands are owned and managed by non-profit conservation groups (County of San Diego 2011b).

3.1.7.1.2 Regulatory Setting

Federal Regulations

National Trails System Act of 1968

The National Trails System Act of 1968 (Public Law 90-543) instituted a nationwide system of interstate riding and hiking trails. This act reflects the federal government's goals of preserving and developing new riding and hiking trails, and aims to protect existing trails and provide for new trails and related facilities.

State Regulations

Quimby Act

The Quimby Act (Section 66477 of the California Government Code) provides cities and counties with the authority to require, by ordinance, land dedications, fee payments, or a combination thereof, for recreation facilities as a condition to the approval of tentative and parcel maps. Section 66477 outlines a number of items that must be contained in the local ordinance, including standards from which calculations can be made for the amount of land or fee that must be given for recreation purposes. In addition, the dedications and fees can only be used for creating or rehabilitating recreational facilities, and the city/county must develop a timeline for construction of the facilities.

The Quimby Act sets forth a standard ratio of dedicated park area within a city to the number of residents. Based on the average number of people per household and an approved or tentatively approved map, the Quimby Act requires a dedication of at least 3 acres of parkland, or cash in-lieu fees, or a combination of both for every 1,000 residents generated by a proposed residential project.

Landscaping and Lighting Act of 1972

The Landscaping and Lighting Act (California Streets and Highways Code, Section 22500) enables counties, cities, and special districts to acquire land for parks, recreation, and open space.

A local government may also use the assessments to pay for improvements and maintenance to these areas. In addition to local government agencies (i.e., counties and cities), park and recreation facilities may be provided by other public agencies, such as community service districts, park and recreation districts, and water districts. If so empowered, such an agency may acquire, develop, and operate recreation facilities for the general public.

Local Regulations

County of San Diego General Plan

The County of San Diego General Plan Mobility Element provides for planning and implementing a network of bicycle, pedestrian, and trail facilities throughout the County. Trails are primarily designed for recreation and for enhancing the quality of life and health benefits associated with walking, hiking, mountain biking, and horseback riding throughout the County's varied environments (County of San Diego 2011c). The following are relevant goals and policies from the General Plan Mobility Element:

Goal M-11: Bicycle and Pedestrian Facilities. Bicycle and pedestrian networks and facilities that provide safe, efficient, and attractive mobility options as well as recreational opportunities for County residents.

- **Policy M-11.1: Bicycle Facility Design.** Support regional and community-scaled planning of pedestrian and bicycle networks.
- **Policy M-11.2: Bicycle and Pedestrian Facilities in Development.** Require development and Town Center plans in Villages and Rural Villages to incorporate site design and on-site amenities for alternate modes of transportation, such as comprehensive bicycle and pedestrian networks and facilities, including both on-street facilities as well as off-street bikeways, to safely serve the full range of intended users, along with areas for transit facilities, where appropriate and coordinated with the transit service provider.
- **Policy M-11.3: Bicycle Facilities on Roads Designated in the Mobility Element.** Maximize the provision of bicycle facilities on County Mobility Element roads in Semi-Rural and Rural Lands to provide a safe and continuous bicycle network in rural areas that can be used for recreation or transportation purposes, while retaining rural character.
- **Policy M-11.4: Pedestrian and Bicycle Network Connectivity.** Require development in Villages and Rural Villages to provide comprehensive internal pedestrian and bicycle networks that connect to existing or planned adjacent community and countywide networks.

- **Policy M-11.7: Bicycle and Pedestrian Facility Design.** Promote pedestrian and bicycle facility standards for facility design that are tailored to a variety of urban and rural contexts according to their location within or outside a Village or Rural Village.
- **Policy M-11.8: Coordination with the County Trails Program.** Coordinate the proposed bicycle and pedestrian network and facilities with the Community Trails Master Plan’s proposed trails and pathways.

Goal M-12: County Trails Program. A safe, scenic, interconnected, and enjoyable non-motorized multi-use trail system developed, managed, and maintained according to the County Trails Program, Regional Trails Plan, and the Community Trails Master Plan.

- **Policy M-12.4: Land Dedication for Trails.** Require development projects to dedicate and improve trails or pathways where the development will occur on land planned for trail or pathway segments shown on the Regional Trails Plan or Community Trails Master Plan.
- **Policy M-12.9: Environmental and Agricultural Resources.** Site and design specific trail segments to minimize impacts to sensitive environmental resources, ecological system and wildlife linkages and corridors, and agricultural lands. Within the MSCP Preserves, conform siting and use of trails to County MSCP Plans and MSCP resource management plans.

The County of San Diego General Plan’s Conservation and Open Space Element provides for future growth and development in the County with respect to the conservation, management, and use of natural and cultural resources, the protection and preservation of open space, and the provision of park and recreation resources (County of San Diego 2011a). The General Plan identifies the following recreation goals and policies relevant to the Proposed Project:

- **Policy COS-6.3: Compatibility with Recreation and Open Space.** Encourage siting recreational and open space uses and multi-use trails that are compatible with agriculture adjacent to the agricultural lands when planning for development adjacent to agricultural land uses.
- **Policy COS-21.1: Diversity of Users and Services.** Provide parks and recreation facilities that create opportunities for a broad range of recreational experiences to serve user interests.
- **Policy COS-21.2: Location of Parks.** Locate new local parks and recreation facilities near other community-oriented public facilities such as schools, libraries, and recreation centers where feasible, so that they may function as the “heart” of a community.

- **Policy COS-21.3: Park Design.** Design parks that reflect community character and identity, incorporate local natural and cultural landscapes and features, and consider the surrounding land uses and urban form and cultural and historic resources.
- **Policy COS-21.4: Regional Parks.** Require new regional parks to allow for a broad range of recreational activities and preserve special or unique natural or cultural features when present.
- **Policy COS-21.5: Connections to Trails and Networks.** Connect public parks to trails and pathways and other pedestrian or bicycle networks where feasible to provide linkages and connectivity between recreational uses.

Goal COS-22: Park and Recreational Services. High-quality parks and recreation programs that promote the health and well-being of County residents while meeting the needs of a diverse and growing population.

- **Policy COS-22.1: Variety of Recreational Programs.** Provide and promote a variety of high-quality active and passive recreation programs that meet the needs of and benefit County residents.

Goal COS-23: Recreational Opportunities in Preserves. Acquisition, monitoring, and management of valuable natural and cultural resources where public recreational opportunities are compatible with the preservation of those resources.

- **Policy COS-23.1: Public Access.** Provide public access to natural and cultural (where allowed) resources through effective planning that conserves the County's native wildlife, enhances and restores a continuous network of connected natural habitat, and protects water resources.

Goal COS-24: Park and Recreation Funding. Adequate funding for acquisition, development, maintenance, management, and operation of parks, recreation facilities, and preserves.

- **Policy COS-24.1: Park and Recreation Contributions.** Require development to provide fair-share contributions toward parks and recreation facilities and trails consistent with local, state, and federal law.

Live Well San Diego – Thriving Strategy Agenda

In 2010, the County Board of Supervisors adopted the Live Well San Diego vision for the region, composed of three components: Building Better Health, Living Safely, and Thriving. Building Better Health involves improving the health of residents and supporting healthy choices; Living Safely works to ensure that residents are protected from crime and abuse, neighborhoods are

safe, and communities are resilient to disasters and emergencies; and Thriving includes cultivating opportunities for all people and communities to grow, connect, and enjoy the highest quality of life. The following goals from the Thriving Strategy Agenda (County of San Diego 2014) apply to recreation:

Goal 3b: Improve planning, designing and maintaining parks.

- **ii:** Expand identification of park-poor communities as measured by acreage, access levels, and facilities through existing mapping and data sources.
- **iii:** Identify potential implementation and maintenance approaches related to health, safety and equal access to meet needs in park-poor communities, such as joint-use arrangements, new developments, and financing.

Goal 8a: Promote environmentally resilient communities that can prosper and residents can enjoy clean parks, open spaces and water.

Otay Ranch General Development Plan/Otay Subregional Plan

The Otay Ranch GDP/SRP parks, recreation, and open space system is designed to meet or exceed City of Chula Vista and County requirements, and enhance the quality of life for residents and visitors by providing active and passive recreational amenities at all levels (City of Chula Vista and County of San Diego 1993b). Regional trails will accommodate hiking, biking, and equestrian travel depending on gradient and adjacent environmental sensitivity. Regional bikeways will be designated in each direction along circulation element roads in Otay Ranch to carry bicycle traffic. Within each specialty village, a complete system of trails and walks will connect the major areas and provide access to adjacent regional trails and bike systems. The following policies from the Otay Ranch GDP/SRP apply to recreation (City of Chula Vista and County of San Diego 1993b):

- **Policy:** Provide local and regional trails which run through and/or connect open space areas in: Otay River Valley, Poggi Canyon, Wolf Creek Canyon, Salt Creek Canyon, Mt. Miguel, Jamul Mountain, Otay Mountain, Otay Lakes and BLM land.
- **Policy:** Provide 15 acres of regional park and open space per 1,000 Otay Ranch residents.

County Trails Program – Community Trails Master Plan

The County Trails Program and the Community Trails Master Plan, including the Jamul/Dulzura Community Trail and Pathway Plan, were adopted in 2005 by the County Board of Supervisors. In 2009, the first update of the Community Trails Master Plan was approved. The County is currently in the planning stages, working with stakeholder groups, identifying existing trail

alignments, and preparing opportunities and constraints analyses for potential trail routes and alternative alignments within the Otay Regional Trail Alignment Study, which encompasses the Otay Ranch GDP/SRP boundary.

The Community Trails Master Plan sets forth criteria and guidelines for acquisition, dedication, development, operation, and maintenance of non-motorized trails and pathways. These trails and pathways are intended to address an established public need for recreation and transportation, as well as health and quality of life benefits associated with use of these facilities (e.g., hiking and bike riding). The goal of the County Trails Program is to establish a system of interconnected and continuous regional and community trails to meet the needs of County residents. The County Trails Program involves trail development and management on public, semi-public, and private lands. The Community Trails Master Plan is the implementing document for the trails program and contains adopted individual community trails and pathway plans. The Community Trails Master Plan includes the following relevant policies and implementation strategies (County of San Diego 2005):

- **Policy CIS 1.6:** Consider shared-use of public utility easements if beneficial to the trail system.
- **Policy CP 3.5:** Discourage non-consenting public use of private trail systems through restricting connections, staging area locations, and trail map publications.
- **Policy CP 3.7:** Development projects and other discretionary projects proposed on lands upon which a trail or pathway in the Regional Trail Plan or Community Trails Master Plan has been identified may be required to dedicate and improve land for trail or pathway purposes.
- **Policy CP 4.7:** When locating specific trail segments, prioritize locations that avoid significant impacts to sensitive environmental resources.
- **Policy CIS 4.8:** Gates, fencing, and other physical barriers should be used to control access and provide increased user safety when warranted by site conditions.

Regional Trails Plan

The Regional Trails Plan identifies County-approved general alignment corridors of regional trails in the County. Regional trails have characteristics and conditions that serve a regional function by covering long linear distances, transcending community and/or municipal borders, having state or national significance, or providing important connections to existing parks and reserves. Regional trails in the vicinity of the Project Area include the California Riding and Hiking Trail and the Otay Valley Regional Park Trail (County of San Diego 2005).

Jamul/Dulzura Subregional Area and Community Plan

The Project Area is located within the Jamul/Dulzura Subregional Plan area boundary. The Jamul/Dulzura Subregional Plan (a supplement to the County General Plan) establishes goals and policies to guide development within the areas of Jamul, Steel Canyon, Dulzura, Barrett Junction, and the remainder of the area that composes the Jamul/Dulzura Subregion of southern San Diego County (County of San Diego 2011d). The goals and policies of the Subregional Plan are intended to be more specific than those of the County General Plan, as they consider the distinct history, character, and identity of the Jamul/Dulzura communities. It should be noted, however, that the policies set forth in the Otay Ranch GDP/SRP take precedence over the Jamul/Dulzura Subregional Plan in the event of any conflicts.

The following policies in the Jamul/Dulzura Subregional Plan relate specifically to recreation (County of San Diego 2011d):

- **Policy M-11:** Residential development shall be designed with equestrian trails and foot paths as an integral part of the project. In addition, permission should be granted for short-term use of portions of Mobility Element road easements for equestrian trails until such time as full road improvements are necessary.
- **Policy REC-2:** Park development should be in the form of active recreation (i.e., multi-purpose play fields, community center, horse staging areas). The development of passive recreation (i.e., picnic grounds, open space) should be highly restricted. It is the strong belief of the citizens that the community's ultimate density provides for adequate open space by the individual land owners.
- **Policy REC-7:** Strict controls prohibiting off-road vehicle use in other than specifically designated areas is highly desirable.

Park Lands Dedication Ordinance

The Park Lands Dedication Ordinance (PLDO), County of San Diego Code of Regulatory Ordinances, Section 810.101 et seq., identifies policies and standards for the provision of parklands in compliance with the state's Quimby Act. It divides the County into Local Park Planning Areas to facilitate park planning by communities. The ordinance establishes park dedication and in-lieu fee requirements, and is intended to provide land for local active parks only. No operational or maintenance funding requirements are covered by the PLDO (County of San Diego 2007).

The PLDO allows project applicants the option of dedicating parklands, paying in-lieu fees (which the County would use to acquire and/or improve parklands), or some combination thereof. Dedicated parkland must be usable for active recreational uses, must be level or gently sloping land (maximum slope of 10%), and must be designed for facilities such as sports fields,

court games, swimming pools, children's play areas, picnic areas, or other similar uses. Active recreational areas do not include natural open space, buffer areas, steep slopes, golf courses, riding and hiking trails, or water bodies. The County PLDO for the Jamul Local Park Planning Area, which includes the Project Area, requires the dedication of 390.73 square feet of improved parkland for each unit or lot, whichever is greater (County of San Diego 2016b).

3.1.7.2 Analysis of Project Effects and Determination as to Significance

3.1.7.2.1 Deterioration of Parks and Recreational Facilities

Guidelines for the Determination of Significance

The County's Guidelines for Determining Significance do not include sections on Parks and Recreation. Therefore, this EIR will apply the criterion set forth in Appendix G of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines, Section XV, Recreation, to determine the significance of the Proposed Project's specific and cumulative impacts on recreational resources.

A significant impact would result if the Proposed Project would (14 CCR 15000 et seq.):

- Increase the use of existing neighborhood and regional parks or other recreational facilities such that substantial physical deterioration of the facility would occur or be accelerated.

Analysis

On-Site Recreational Facilities

The Project Area is currently undeveloped with no existing parks or recreational facilities. Therefore, implementation of the Proposed Project would not result in an adverse impact to existing on-site recreational facilities.

The Proposed Project includes up to 1,119 single-family homes. Therefore, the Proposed Project would generate increased demand for parks and recreation facilities and could potentially increase the use of existing and proposed regional and neighborhood parks. According to the Otay Ranch GDP/SRP, the Quimby Act, and the County's PLDO, the Proposed Project would be required to provide 3 acres of neighborhood and community parkland for every 1,000 residents. The amount of land to be dedicated, or in-lieu fee to be paid, is based upon the Local Park Planning Area boundaries described in Section 810.106(f) of the County's PLDO, which are derived from average occupancy figures. The Project Area is located in the Jamul community planning area, which requires 390.73 square feet dedicated per dwelling unit or lot, whichever is greater, or in-lieu fee of \$4,284 per dwelling unit or lot, whichever is greater pursuant to the County's PLDO.

The Proposed Project includes up to 1,119 dwelling units and therefore would be obligated to provide approximately 10.04 acres of parkland (1,119 units x 390.73 square feet per unit ÷ 43,560 square feet per acre). The Proposed Project would include four public parks totaling 15.2 acres, and 4.5 acres of private parks and recreation areas for a total of 19.7 acres of parks and recreation facilities within the Project Area. Of this total, 11.1 acres are eligible for credit under the County's PLDO. The parkland included in the Proposed Project is calculated in Table 3.1.7-1, Proposed Project Parkland.

The following describes the proposed public and private parks in more detail (also see Chapter 1, Project Description, Location, and Environmental Setting; Section 1.2.2.1, of this EIR).

Public Parks

- **South Park (P-1):** As shown in Figure 1-6, Parks, Recreation, Preserve, Open Space and Trails Plan, in Chapter 1, South Park (P-1) is a 2.9-acre park located in the southwest corner of South Village 14.
- **The Village Green (P-2):** The Village Green is a 7.2-acre park located in the heart of the Village Core within Central Village 14. As shown on Figure 1-6, the Village Green is located across from the elementary school site, providing the principal community gathering place for the entire Otay Ranch Village 14. It is anticipated that the Village Green would provide a venue for passive and active recreational opportunities and community events.
- **Scenic Park (P-3):** As shown on Figure 1-6, Scenic Park (P-3) is a 3.7-acre park located on the western edge of the entry into Central Village 14. Scenic Park would offer views of Proctor Valley Creek and the steep landforms of San Miguel Mountain to the west. The park would be programmed with active and passive recreational opportunities and a fenced dog park.
- **Northern Park (P-4):** As shown on Figure 1-6, Northern Park (P-4) is a 1.4-acre park located in the northwestern entry to Planning Areas 16/19. It is anticipated that the Northern Park would provide a venue for passive and active recreational opportunities and community events.

The four public parks proposed would be maintained by the County of San Diego Parks and Recreation Department. If the necessary public parks acreage is not met, either additional private park acreage would be provided and maintained by a Community Facilities District, homeowner's association (HOA), or other form of public financing, or an in-lieu fee would be paid.

Private Pocket Parks

As illustrated in Figure 1-6, pocket parks would be distributed in various locations throughout Otay Ranch Village 14. These small neighborhood parks would provide occasional passive

and/or active use areas and stopping places for residents of the respective neighborhood. Pocket parks would range in size from 0.2 to 0.7 acres. Private pocket parks would be maintained by an HOA or similar Community Facilities District.

Private Community Facilities

One private swim club would be located in each of the three phases of Otay Ranch Village 14 (North Village 14, Central Village 14, and South Village 14). The swim clubs would range in size between 1 and 1.5 acres. Each swim club would provide a pool and picnic and recreational facilities for homeowners. Private community facilities would be maintained by an HOA or Community Facilities District.

In summary, as presented in Table 3.1.7-1, the Proposed Project would provide a total of 19.7 acres of parks and recreation facilities, of which 11.1 acres are eligible for park credit, exceeding the 10.04 acres needed to satisfy the Proposed Project's parkland obligation under the PLDO.

In addition to the above public and private park facilities, the Proposed Project would include a system of pathways within the Project Area. A 4.5-mile portion (multi-purpose) of the Proctor Valley Community Pathway adjacent to Proctor Valley Road is proposed from Eastlake Woods to Jamul. When combined with the Proctor Valley Community Pathway, an internal 3-mile-long Park-to-Park Loop (a Specialty Trail, as defined in the County Trails Master Plan, Section 7.3 – Specialty Trails) would connect the South Village Park to the North Village, stopping at the Scenic Park and Village Green Park, as well as private parks along the way. The Park-to-Park Loop would also have connections to the Preserve Trails Option trails located in and adjacent to Otay Ranch RMP Preserve land in Village 14 and Planning Areas 16/19, as well as the Perimeter Trail Option in Village 14. The locations of planned recreational facilities are shown in Figure 1-6. The trails are open to public pedestrian access through public parks and trailheads.

Therefore, the public and private provision of park and recreational facilities within the Project Area would be sufficient for the demand of the future residents of the Proposed Project, and would be consistent with the PLDO. As a result, existing public parks and recreational facilities would not be adversely impacted such that substantial physical deterioration would occur or be accelerated by the Proposed Project's population. Impacts of the Proposed Project would be **less than significant**.

Off-Site Recreational Facilities

The Proposed Project would provide approximately 19.7 acres of public and private parks, as well as additional recreational land for residents such as pathways, trails (the Perimeter Trail and Preserve Trails Options), and private recreational amenities located within the Project Area. The proposed recreational facilities would exceed the PLDO requirement of 3 acres per 1,000 people. Therefore, the Proposed Project would provide sufficient parks and recreation facilities such that

substantial physical deterioration of the surrounding off-site facilities (i.e., Salt Creek Community Park, Chula Vista Community Park, Mount San Miguel Community Park) is not expected to occur or be accelerated. Additionally, as analyzed in Section 3.1.3, Land Use and Planning, and Appendix 3.1.3-1, General Plan Amendment Report/Plan Consistency Analysis, the Proposed Project is consistent with applicable Otay Ranch GDP/SRP Parks, Recreation, and Open Space objectives and policies. The Proposed Project would include diverse park and recreational opportunities to meet the recreational, conservation, preservation, cultural, and aesthetic needs of residents, as well as park areas serving the general public.

Compliance with the PLDO and Otay Ranch GDP/SRP would ensure that impacts associated with parks and recreational facilities as a result of Proposed Project implementation would be reduced. The Otay Ranch PEIR concluded a potentially significant impact to local parks because it was unknown at the time where or how the park acreage would be provided. Because the Proposed Project is consistent with the County PLDO and the Otay Ranch GDP/SRP, and provides sufficient parks and recreation facilities that substantial physical deterioration of the surrounding off-site facilities is not expected to occur, impacts would be **less than significant**.

3.1.7.2.2 Construction of New Recreational Facilities

Guidelines for the Determination of Significance

The County's Guidelines for Determining Significance do not include sections on Parks and Recreation. Therefore, this EIR applies the following significance criterion set forth in Appendix G to the CEQA Guidelines, Section XV, Recreation.

A significant impact would result if the Proposed Project would (14 CCR 15000 et seq.):

- Include recreational facilities or require the construction or expansion of recreational facilities that might have an adverse physical effect on the environment.

Analysis

The Proposed Project would include both public and private recreational facilities on site, as detailed previously. Construction and operation of these future recreational amenities, including the Perimeter Trail and Preserve Trails Options, would have the potential to cause environmental effects. The environmental impacts associated with construction and operation of such on-site recreational amenities are discussed throughout this EIR.

The proposed on-site facilities are sufficient to accommodate the Proposed Project population pursuant to the requirements of the PLDO. Therefore, there would be no need to construct additional off-site recreational facilities or improvements, or expand off-site recreational facilities as a result of

the Proposed Project. Impacts associated with the construction and operation of on-site recreational facilities as part of the Proposed Project would be **less than significant**.

3.1.7.3 *Cumulative Impact Analysis*

The geographic scope for cumulative parks and recreation impacts includes the Jamul/Dulzura Subregional Plan area within unincorporated San Diego County and considers the cumulative projects listed in Table 1-7, Cumulative Projects List, and depicted in Figure 1-16, Cumulative Projects, in Chapter 1. San Diego Association of Governments population forecasts estimate that the population of the Jamul/Dulzura Subregional Plan area is projected to increase from 6,504 residents in 2014 to 17,653 residents in 2050 (SANDAG 2017). This growth will necessitate development of additional park and recreation facilities distributed according to the locations of new development. Additionally, nearby cumulative projects from Table 1-7 that would contribute to population include, but are not limited to, Jamul Highlands Estates (approximately 23 single-family residential lots in Jamul), Simpson Farms (approximately 95 single-family residential lots in Jamul), Sweetwater Vistas (approximately 225 residential units located in Spring Valley), and Otay Ranch Village 13 (1,938 residential units and a 200-room hotel located in Otay Ranch).

Cumulative impacts on recreation could result if the Proposed Project, in combination with other past, present, and future projects, increases demand on recreation facilities such that additional facilities must be constructed that could result in cumulative significant impacts to the environment. However, the Proposed Project would provide park facilities that would be adequate to meet the needs of its residents, as well as residents in Jamul and neighboring communities, and would satisfy the requirements of the PLDO. Cumulative residential projects, as previously described, would contribute to a cumulative demand for recreational facilities. However, these cumulative projects would also be required to satisfy the requirement of the PLDO. Pursuant to the PLDO, and to accommodate future demand for park and recreational facilities from population growth in the County, additional park and recreational facilities would be developed and constructed throughout the region. Importantly, the cumulative projects would be required to demonstrate compliance with CEQA prior to project approval, which would help ensure that potential environmental impacts are adequately addressed at the project level, thereby minimizing the potential for cumulative impacts. Therefore, the Proposed Project, in combination with other cumulative projects, **would not contribute to a cumulatively considerable** impact related to recreation.

3.1.7.4 *Conclusion*

The Proposed Project includes 1,119 dwelling units, which, per the County's PLDO, requires 10.04 acres of parkland. The Proposed Project would construct 19.7 acres of parks and recreation facilities within the Project Area, 11.1 acres of which are eligible for credit under the County's PLDO.

Therefore, sufficient parks and recreation facilities would be provided to accommodate future residents and visitors of the Proposed Project. The environmental impacts associated with construction and operation of on-site recreational amenities are discussed throughout this EIR. No off-site facilities would be required. Therefore, impacts related to recreation would be **less than significant**.

**Table 3.1.7-1
Proposed Project Parkland**

ID (Per Specific Plan)	Total Acreage	Usable/Eligible PLDO Acreage*
P-1	2.9	1.9
P-2	7.2	5.7
P-3	3.7	1.8
P-4	1.4	0.9
<i>Total Public Parks</i>	<i>15.2</i>	<i>10.3</i>
<i>Total Private Parks</i>	<i>4.5</i>	<i>1.7</i>
Total	19.7	11.1

PLDO = Park Lands Dedication Ordinance.

* The parkland requirement under the PLDO (County of San Diego Code of Regulatory Ordinances, Sections 810.108 and 810.108.1) allows 100% credit for active recreation within public parks and 50% credit for active recreation within private parks, which are designed to meet County Department of Parks and Recreation requirements.