



County of San Diego

ERIC GIBSON
INTERIM DIRECTOR

DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING AND LAND USE

5201 RUFFIN ROAD, SUITE B, SAN DIEGO, CALIFORNIA 92123-1666
INFORMATION (858) 694-2960
TOLL FREE (800) 411-0017

BOARD MINUTES

HISTORIC SITE BOARD

October 17, 2011

Draft

Time: 6:30 PM

**Location: 5201 Ruffin Road, Suite B,
Planning Commission Board Room**

(NOTE: The minutes are a summary of the HSB meetings. Recordings of the meeting are available upon request. Comments are welcome.)

ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

ITEM 1 – ADMINISTRATIVE

A. Board Administrative Matters and General Information

- **Call to Order**

6:31 pm

- **Members Present:**

Paul Johnson
Carmen Lucas
Jim Royle
Helen Ofield
Scott Moomjian
Vicki Estrada

- **Staff Present:**

Gail Wright
Donna Beddow
Diane Buell

Members Absent: Margie Warner

Staff Absent: None

- **Other General Information:** None

B. Conflict of Interest Declaration: Scott Moomjian on item 4 the Ullman/Chavez Residence MAA 11-003

C. Approval of July 18, 2011 Board Minutes

Approval of the July 18, 2011 Board Minutes; Motion by Jim Royle to approve minutes; 2nd by Vicki Estrada; motion carried 5-0-1 (Paul Johnson abstained)

D. Reports:

- Draft Environmental Impact Report Notice of Preparation for the East Otay Mesa Recycling Collection Center and Landfill.

Gail Wright discussed that the response to a Notice of Preparation (NOP) documents were due on October 12, 2011 for this item. The NOP was for the East Otay Mesa Landfill project. The Historic Site Board members were sent the material but since the due date for comments had passed, the item could not be discussed at tonight's meeting.

- Update on the Environmental Impact Report for the Star Building (General Services).

Dahvia Lynch from General Services showed a PowerPoint presentation discussing the revised project and alternatives specifically relating to cultural resources. Carmen Lucas discussed that she would like a Native American monitor onsite during grading. Dahvia said that she would send follow-up images that were missing from the presentation to send to the Historic Site Board Members. The Star Building is still proposed to be demolished under the currently proposed project.

E. Announcements

- **San Diego County Archaeological Society:** **San Diego County Archaeological Society:** October 25th at 7:30 PM – To be determined; November 22nd at 7:30 PM– Erin Blakenship-Sefczek, "*Status and the 'Lower' Class: A Bio-Cultural Examination of the Non-Elite Maya of Guerra, Belize,*" at Los Peñasquitos Ranch House.
- **San Diego Archaeological Center:** The Center has on-going programs, lectures and other activities. Check out their schedule at: <http://www.sandiegoarchaeology.org/>
- Presentation of a certificate to Carmen Lucas for 10 years of service on the Historic Site Board. Tonight was her last night as a board member.

F. Formation of Consent Calendar:

Item 5, the Burton I. Jones House, MAA 11-004, was approved on the consent calendar.

Board Action: Motion by Helen Ofield to approve Item 5 on the consent calendar for landmarking, second by Jim Royle, Motion carried 6-0-0.

Motion by Paul Johnson to approve Item 5 on the consent calendar for staff recommendation of Mills Act participation, second by Vicki Estrada, Motion carried 6-0-0.

ITEM 2 – PUBLIC COMMENTS

A. Public Comment: None

B. County Department of Parks and Recreation Update: Cailin Hunsaker, District Park Ranger, Department of Parks and Recreation (DPR)

Cailin Hunsaker introduced herself and discussed that she will be overseeing many of Lynne Newell Christiansen's former cultural resource duties for DPR and will be available to discuss projects to the Historic Site Board during future meetings. She also discussed that there is a new book called "*Historic Stage Routes of San Diego County*" by Lynne Newell and Ellen Sweet available in the parks series for purchase at the DPR headquarters located at the Overland campus or at Barnes and Noble.

ACTION ITEMS:**ITEM 3- The McGowan/Dean Family Residence, Rancho Santa Fe; MAA 11-001**

Location: 5496 Avenida Maravillas, Rancho Santa Fe, CA 92067
Supervisor District: 5 – Bill Horn

Description: The McGowan/Dean Family residence is a California ranch style home with American colonial influences designed by master architect Winchton Leamon Risley. The applicant is requesting that this resource be found significant under item V(b)(3) of the Local Register that identifies a resource as significant if it embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type (California ranch style with American colonial influences) and represents the work of an important creative individual (Winchton Leamon Risley). The period of significance is 1935.

Staff Recommendation: Recommend placement of the McGowan/Dean Family Residence (APN 266-140-16-00) on the Local Register of Historic Resources, as Landmark Number 2011-001 and recommend approval for participation in the Mills Act contract. Staff finds this resource to be significant under County's Local Register of Historical Resources Ordinance 9493 under Criterion V(b)(3).

Meeting Notes: Jim Royle requested that staff send HSB members the staff report for each action item for review prior to the meeting. Jim also discussed that should have been a mention of the previous owners of the home in the report. He stated that the north end of the building had a closet that was converted into a bathroom and that this should not be included in the landmarking. The original windows were removed but will be put back on as part of restoration of the building since the owners still have them.

Board Action: Motion to approve staff recommendation for landmarking and participating in Mills Act by Jim Royle, second by Paul Johnson; Motion carried 6-0-0.

Formal Motion by Jim Royle: Moved that the Historic Site Board recommends the McGowan/Dean Family Residence, located at 5496 Avenida Maravillas (APN 266-140-16-00) in the Rancho Santa Fe community, be placed on the Local Register of Historic Resources as Landmark Number 2011-001. The resource is significant under Criterion V(b)(3) of Ordinance 9493, as it represents the work of an important creative individual, Winchton Leamon Risley, and as it embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, the California ranch style with American colonial influences. Distinguishing features include shutters at windows and lattice and trellises at the front entrance.

The period of significance is 1935. In addition to the south and west sides of the residence and garage, the landmarking includes: the wall, gate and enclosure adjoining the garage; the wall and gate between the driveway and front entry, the low wall enclosure at the front entry, and the decorative wooden treatment of the walls adjacent to the driveway. The Historic Site Board notes the addition of a bathroom near the north end of the west side of the house. The Historic Site Board also recommends the resource for participation in a Mills Act contract.

ITEM 4- Ullman/Chavez Residence, Mt. Helix; MAA 11-003

Location: 4786 Mount Helix Drive, La Mesa, CA 91941
Supervisor District: 2 – Dianne Jacob

Description: The Ullman/Chavez Residence is a mid-century modern house (post and beam) that was constructed in 1964 by contractor Erne L. Johnson and designed by architect John R. Mock for Dr. Milton and June Ullman. The applicant is requesting that this resource be found significant under item V(b)(3) of the Local Register that identifies a resource as significant if it embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type (mid-century modern architecture) and represents the work of an important creative individual (John R. Mock). The period of significance is 1964.

Staff Recommendation: Recommend placement of the Ullman/Chavez Residence (APN 496-140-16-00) on the Local Register of Historic Resources, as Landmark Number 2011-003 and recommend approval for participation in the Mills Act contract. Staff finds this resource to be significant under County's Local Register of Historical Resources Ordinance 9493 under Criterion V(b)(3).

Meeting Notes: Paul Johnson noted that he would like the rectangular entryway included in the landmarking of the residence. Scott Moomjian represented the applicant and stated that a swimming pool was added per consultation with John R. Mock. He also stated that although mature trees date to the period of significance there is an SDG&E easement on the property and trees are periodically cut and thinned for views. There is also a California Conservation Corps wall on the property that is not included in the landmarking application or Mills Act. Ron May stated that the CCC walls were previously dedicated by the previous Historic Site Board by the Board of Supervisors. The landmarking also included the decking which was part of Mock's original design.

Board Action: Motion to approve staff recommendation for landmarking and Mills Act participation by Jim Royle, second by Paul Johnson; Motion carried 5-0-1 (Scott Moomjian abstained).

Formal Motion by Jim Royle: Moved, that the Historic Site Board recommends the Ullman/Chavez Residence, located at 4786 Mount Helix Drive (APN 496-140-16-00) in the Mt. Helix community in, be placed on the Local Register of Historic Resources as Landmark Number 2011-003. The resource is significant under Criterion V (b)(3) of Ordinance 9493, as it represents the work of an important creative individual, John R. Mock, and as it embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, Post and Beam Mid-Century Modern. The period of significance is 1964. In addition to the south, east and northern sides of the residence and carport, the landmarking includes the hardscaping at the entry. The Historic Site Board finds that, although the residence is less than 50 years old, sufficient time has passed to establish the historic significance of the resource. The Historic Site Board notes the recent addition of a swimming pool, done in consultation with Mr. Mock, to the north of the residence. The Historic Site Board also recommends the resource for participation in a Mills Act contract.

ITEM 5- Burton I. Jones House, Mt. Helix; MAA 11-004

Location: 9830 Edgelake Drive, La Mesa, CA 91941
Supervisor District: 2 – Dianne Jacob

Description: The Burton I. Jones house is a one-story Modernist residence (post and beam) that was built in 1950 by master architect Lloyd Ruocco. The applicant is requesting that this resource be found significant under item V(b)(2) of the Local Register that the resource is associated with the lives of persons important to the history of San Diego (Burton I. Jones) or its communities (Mt. Helix); and item V(b)(3) of the Local Register that identifies a resource as significant if it embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type (modern architectural style) and as an important work of an important creative individual (Lloyd Ruocco).

Staff Recommendation: Recommend placement of the Burton I. Jones House (APN 491-592-07-00) on the Local Register of Historic Resources, as Landmark Number 2011-004 and recommend approval for participation in the Mills Act contract. Staff finds this resource to be significant under County's Local Register of Historical Resources Ordinance 9493 under Criteria V(b)(2), and V(b)(3).

ITEM 6- Old Survey 97 Road, Ramona, MAA 11-002

Location: Old Survey 97 Road, Ramona, CA 92065
Supervisor District: 2 – Dianne Jacob

Description: The Old Survey 97 Road application represents a segment of the Southern Overland Trail dating from the early 19th through early 20th century that was originally a portion of the vast network of trails used by Native Americans. The applicant is requesting that this resource be found significant under item V(b)(1) of the Local Register for its association with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of San Diego County's history and cultural heritage (Battle of San Pasqual), and under Criterion V(b)(2) that the Road is associated with the lives of persons important to the history of San Diego County or its communities (including General Stephen Watts Kearny, Andres Pico, Kit Carson, Capt. Abraham Johnson, Capt. Archibald Gillespie, Capt. Benjamin D. Moore, Surgeon John S. Griffin, and Lt. Edward F. Beale).

Staff Recommendation: Staff agrees that the Old Survey 97 Road is a historic resource pursuant to Section V(b)(1) of the Admin. Code that the resource is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of San Diego county's history, and to Section V(b)(2) that the resource is associated with the lives of persons important to the history of San Diego County. However, because a majority of the private property owners have not agreed to the listing of the Road, pursuant to the Administrative Code Section VIII (b) and (c), staff recommends that the HSB find the resource as formally eligible for listing in the Local Register for all of the Old Survey 97 Road within the unincorporated portion of the county of San Diego.

Meeting Notes: Many of the property owners of land that is intersected by the Old Survey 97 Road attended the meeting to discuss that they did not want their properties listed. Brian Weir discussed that he was not noticed (his property is just outside the affected properties) and that the survey alignment is not mapped correctly. The Historic Site Board allowed all members of the public to voice their concerns and it was decided that the item would be continued until the January meeting so that additional information could be provided by Brian Weir regarding an alternate alignment. County staff was directed to review the new General Plan and MSCP programs for land use issues and to clarify designating versus eligibility of a resource for the January meeting.

Board Action: Motion to approve recommendation for a continuation by Jim Royle, second by Paul Johnson; Motion carried 6-0-0.

DISCUSSION ITEMS:

.None

ITEM 7– FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

- Next meeting will take place on January 23, 2012 (due to Martin Luther King Holiday)
- No HSB Project Review Committee Meeting(s) currently scheduled.

ITEM 8– ADJOURNMENT

9:05 PM

APPROVAL OF BOARD MINUTES:

Chairman, Scott Moomjian

January 23, 2012

Vice-Chairman, Jim Royle

January 23, 2012