

# Visual Resources / Community Character / Growth Induction Analysis

#### WARNER RANCH

3810-06-002 (SP), 3800-06-009 (GPA), 360-06-011 (R), 3100-5508 (TMRPL14), 3500-11-007 (S), 3000-06-040 (AD), 3910-0602020 (ER)

#### Prepared for: County of San Diego

Department of Planning and Land Use 5510 Overland Avenue, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor San Diego, CA 92123-1666

#### Applicant: Capstone Advisors

1545 Faraday Avenue San Diego, CA 92122 Contact: Mark Hayden Phone: (760) 804 -6900 Direct: (760) 804-6903

#### Prepared by:

#### RBF Consulting, a company of Michael Baker International

9755 Clairemont Mesa Boulevard, Suite 100 San Diego, California 92124 Contact: Nicole Marotz Phone: 858-614-5000

October 2014

CEQA CONSULTANT FOR VISUAL ANALYSES Nicole Marotz, AICP, LEED AP

Micole Marotz

#### THIS PAGE LEFT BLANK INTENTIONALLY.



November 8, 2016

Mark Slovick, Planning Manager County of San Diego Planning and Development Services 5510 Overland Ave, San Diego, CA 92123 San Diego, California

Subject: Warner Ranch - Visual Resources/Community Character/Growth Induction Analysis

Dear Mr. Slovick,

Per direction received from County of San Diego Planning & Development Services Department staff, this letter has been prepared as result of a change in the project's proposed fire protection service provider. The San Diego County Fire Authority has indicated they will provide fire service to the proposed project site; refer to the attached Fire Service Availability Letter signed by the San Diego County Fire Authority. The project applicant no longer proposes annexation into the North County Fire Protection District (NCFPD) for fire protection services.

Therefore, all references made to the NCFPD within the Warner Ranch Visual Resources/Community Character/Growth Induction Analysis prepared by Michael Baker International (formerly RBF Consulting) and dated October 2014, are hereafter changed to County Fire Authority by way of this letter. This proposed change in the fire protection service provider does not result in any new potential impacts that would require additional analysis, nor are any of the original findings made in the report affected.

Sincerely,

Nicole Marotz, AICP, LEED AP

Micole Marots

Senior Environmental Planner

#### THIS PAGE LEFT BLANK INTENTIONALLY.

## **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

EXECUTIVE SI	JMMARY	V
CHAPTER 1:	VISUAL RESOURCES ANALYSIS	1-1
1.1	Introduction	1-1
1.2	Project Description	
1.3	Visual Environment	
1.4	Existing Visual Resources and Viewer Response	1-27
1.5	Visual Impact – Guidelines for Determining Significance	
1.6	Visual Mitigation Measures / Design Considerations	1-85
CHAPTER 2:	COMMUNITY CHARACTER ANALYSIS	2-1
2.1	Purpose	2-1
2.2	Proposed Project	
2.3	Applicable Plans and Policies	
2.4	Thresholds of Significance	2-5
2.5	Recommended Mitigation Measures	2-43
2.6	Conclusions	
CHAPTER 3:	GROWTH INDUCTION ANALYSIS	3-1
3.1	Purpose	3-1
3.2	Project Study Area	
3.3	Land Use Policy Considerations	
3.4	Existing Conditions	3-5
3.5	Significance Criteria	3-15
3.6	Analysis of Project Effects and Determination of Significance	3-16
3.7	Cumulative Impacts	3-33
3.8	Conclusion	3-37

#### **REPORT PREPARERS**

#### REFERENCES

APPENDIX A PROPERTIES WITHIN 5-, 10-, AND 20-MINUTE TRAVEL TIMES FROM PROPOSED FIRE STATION

## **List of Figures**

Regional / Vicinity Map	1-95
Aerial Photograph	1-97
Specific Plan Map	1-99
SPA Subareas and Existing Parcels Map	1-101
Conceptual Design: Single-Family Home	1-103
Conceptual Design: Duplex	1-105
Conceptual Design: Sixplex	1-107
Clubhouse - Elevation	1-109
Conceptual Design: Fire Station	1-111
Manufactured Slopes/Retaining Walls	1-113
Landscape Plan	1-115
Wall and Fence Plan	1-117
Community Entry - Elevation	1-119
Existing/Proposed Land Use	1-121
Proposed Zoning	1-123
Photo Location Map – Onsite Views	1-125
Onsite Views	1-127
Onsite Views	1-129
Onsite Views	1-131
Photo Location Map – Offsite Views	1-133
Surrounding Land Uses	1-135
Surrounding Land Uses	1-137
Offsite Views	1-139
Community Context Map	1-141
Key Views/Landscape Units	1-143
Key View #1	1-145
Key View #2	1-147
Key View #3	1-149
Discretionary Projects	1-151
Pala Village Expansion Analysis – 1938	2-49
Pala Village Expansion Analysis – 1946	2-51
Pala Village Expansion Analysis - 1953	2-53
Pala Village Expansion Analysis – 1964	2-55
Pala Village Expansion Analysis – 1981	2-57
Pala Village Expansion Analysis – 1989	2-59
	Aerial Photograph Specific Plan Map SPA Subareas and Existing Parcels Map Conceptual Design: Single-Family Home Conceptual Design: Duplex Conceptual Design: Sixplex Clubhouse - Elevation Conceptual Design: Fire Station Manufactured Slopes/Retaining Walls Landscape Plan Wall and Fence Plan Community Entry - Elevation Existing/Proposed Land Use Proposed Zoning Photo Location Map – Onsite Views Onsite Views Onsite Views Onsite Views Surrounding Land Uses Surrounding Land Uses Surrounding Land Uses  Offsite Views Community Context Map Key Views/Landscape Units Key View #1 Key View #2 Key View #3 Discretionary Projects Pala Village Expansion Analysis – 1938 Pala Village Expansion Analysis – 1946 Pala Village Expansion Analysis – 1964 Pala Village Expansion Analysis – 1964 Pala Village Expansion Analysis – 1964

Figure 2-1G	Pala Village Expansion Analysis – 2005	2-61
Figure 2-1H	Pala Village Expansion Analysis – 2006	2-63
Figure 2-11	Pala Village Expansion Analysis – 2008	2-65
Figure 2-1J	Pala Village Expansion Analysis – 2009	2-67
Figure 2-1K	Pala Village Expansion Analysis – 2012	2-69
Figure 2-2	Surrounding Land Uses	2-71
Figure 2-3A	Parcel Size (One-Mile Radius)	2-73
Figure 2-3B	Total Parcel Acreage (One-Mile Radius)	2-75
Figure 2-4A	Residential Housing Units	2-77
Figure 2-4B	Site Plan – Proposed Multi-Family Units	2-79
Figure 2-5A	Residential Density/Lot Size Study	2-81
Figure 2-5B	Surrounding Land Uses	2-83
Figure 2-6	Manufactured Slopes/Retaining Walls	2-85
Figure 3-1	Water Conveyance System	3-43
Figure 3-2	Sewer Conveyance System	3-45
Figure 3-3	North County Fire Protection District Map	3-47
Figure 3-4	Fire Station Travel Time Map: 5 Minutes	3-49
Figure 3-5	Fire Station Travel Time: 10 Minutes	3-51
Figure 3-6	Fire Service Travel Time: 20 Minutes	3-53
	List of Tables	
Table 1-1	Land Use Summary	1-5
Table 1-2	General Plan Land Use	
Table 1-3	Zoning	
Table 1-4	Anticipated Permits and Approvals	1-15
Table 1-5	Viewer Groups and Anticipated Exposure	
Table 1-6	Residential Density (Within 0.75 Mile)	
Table 1-7	Proposed Structural/Lot Design Characteristics	
Table 1-8	Proposed Building Coverage	
Table 1-9	Cumulative Projects	1-77
Table 1-10	Mitigation Measures	1-88
Table 1-11	Design Measures	1-91
Table 2-1	Average Parcel Size Within a One-Mile Radius	2-21
Table 2-2	Residential Density (Within 0.75 Mile)	2-25
Table 2-3	Proposed Lot and Structural Size	2-28
Table 2-4	Land Use Summary	
Table 2-5	Mitigation Measures	2-43

Visual Resources / Community Character / Growth Induction Analysis	

#### THIS PAGE LEFT BLANK INTENTIONALLY.

### **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

The Warner Ranch Visual Resources/Community Character/Growth Induction Analysis provides an evaluation of potential Project impacts on existing visual resources and character of the surrounding community of Pala, California, in northwestern San Diego County. Additionally, the analysis evaluates the potential for the Project to influence community character and anticipated growth patterns in the community over the short- and long-term.

With regard to visual resources, the Project would not result in the introduction of features that would substantially detract from or contrast with the visual character of the surrounding community by conflicting with visual elements or quality of an existing area (i.e., through conflicting style, size, coverage, scale, building materials, etc.). The Project would have the potential to result in the removal of or substantial adverse change to one or more features that contribute to the valued visual character or image of the Project area, including but not limited to designated landmarks, historic resources, trees, or rock outcroppings, as the project would require construction of manufactured cut/fill slopes of substantial height (greater than 30 feet) that, if left unmitigated, could result in a significant impact. Furthermore, certain Project features could potentially obstruct, interrupt, or detract from a valued focal and/or panoramic vista from a public road, trails within an adopted County or State trail system, scenic vista or highway, or recreational area. Mitigation measures, as well as design measures, are proposed to reduce potential direct and cumulative impacts on visual resources resulting with the proposed Project to a less than significant level. Refer to Chapter 1, Visual Resources Analysis, for an in-depth discussion of potential visual impacts resulting with the Project.

Regarding community character, the Project as proposed would require County approval of a General Plan Amendment (GPA), Subregional Plan Amendment, and a rezone classification to change the land use and zoning designations and allow development to occur at the density proposed. Relative to the site being identified as a Special Study Area (SSA), thereby requiring additional analysis to determine the most compatible and consistent land uses for the property. Additionally, Project consistency with the General Plan and Pala/Pauma Subregional Plan is evaluated in the General Plan Amendment Report (GPAR); available under separate cover. The Community Character Analysis determined that the Project would be compatible with existing and planned land uses of the community and would not conflict with any applicable habitat conservation plan, regulation, or ordinance. As the proposed Project would have the potential to result in the introduction of features that would detract from or contrast with the existing visual character and/or quality of a neighborhood, community, or localized area by conflicting with important visual elements or the quality of the area, significant impacts on community character would result. Additionally, the Project would result in increased levels of traffic relative to that presently existing on surrounding

area roadways; however, such an increase would not result in a change in existing community character. Furthermore, it was determined that the proposed Project would not result in the division of an established community. Impacts with regard to community character would be reduced to less than significant through implementation of the mitigation measures proposed. Refer to Chapter 2, Community Character Analysis, for an in-depth discussion of potential impacts on community character resulting with the Project.

Improvements proposed with the Project may result in an induction of growth within the existing Pala community. With the proposed improvements, all utilities and services would be adequate to serve the proposed development. A portion of the Project site is situated within the Rainbow Municipal Water District (RMWD). The remainder of the Project area would be annexed into RMWD and San Diego County Water Authority (SDCWA) which would require approval from the Local Agency Formation Commission (LAFCO). RMWD would provide potable water and sewer service to the Project. In order to provide water service to the site, approximately 2,000 linear feet of 8-inch diameter pipeline would be constructed from the terminus of an existing line in Jeremy Way to the property's northern boundary line. Sewer service would be provided via extension of a a 6-inch forced sewer main that would run from a proposed pump station near the southwestern boundary of the site to the west within the right-of-way (ROW) of SR 76, where it would ultimately connect to another new pump station (not part of the proposed Project) to be provided by the RMWD. The RMWD has provided a written statement indicating that no offsite land owners would be able to connect to either the proposed water or the sewer lines to be extended to the site, as such facilities would be sized for capacity to serve only the proposed development. Additionally, an existing natural gas pipeline would also be extended approximately 1.2 miles to the Project site within the right-of-way (ROW) of State Route 76 (Pala Road/SR 76). The gas line would be extended from west of the Project site to the intersection of SR 76 and Pala del Norte. Additionally, improvements are proposed along SR 76 to ensure that adequate circulation and public safety along the roadway are maintained following Project implementation. Construction of an onsite fire station is also proposed to ensure that the Project is adequately served with regard to the provision of fire protection services. The Project would result in additional growth in the area with construction of the proposed fire station; however, due to the limited number of new homes that could be built with construction of the fire station, the effects of such growth are considered less than significant, and beneficial effects (the ability of the North County Fire Protection District to provide adequate fire protection services to properties within its service boundaries) would result. Refer to Chapter 3.0, Growth Induction Analysis, for an in-depth discussion of potential growth-inducing impacts resulting with the Project.

Mitigation measures and design measures provided herein are proposed to reduce potential Project effects on the existing visual setting and the Pala community. Through implementation of such measures, combined with design measures identified in the Warner

Visual Resources	1 Community	v Character	1 Growth	Induction	Analysis
VISUAL RESOURCES	/ COITHITION	y Character .	, Giowiii	IIIauciioii	Aliulysis

Ranch Specific Plan to guide the overall future development of the proposed Project, Warner Ranch Environmental Impact Report (EIR), and/or Project Conditions of Approval, impacts with regard to visual resources, community character, and growth induction would be reduced to less than significant.

Visual Resources / Community Character / Growth Induction Analysis	
--	--

#### THIS PAGE LEFT BLANK INTENTIONALLY.

## CHAPTER 1: VISUAL RESOURCES ANALYSIS

#### 1.1 Introduction

#### 1.1.1 Purpose

The purpose of the Warner Ranch Visual Resources Analysis is to assess the potential visual impacts resulting with implementation of the proposed Project; to determine the significance of the impacts under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA); and, to propose measures to avoid, minimize, or mitigate potential adverse visual impacts associated with construction of the proposed development on the surrounding visual environment. The Visual Resources Analysis has been prepared in accordance with the *County of San Diego Guidelines for Determining Significance and Report Format and Content Requirements* (County of San Diego 2007).

#### 1.1.2 KEY ISSUES

Key issues to be evaluated in this analysis are whether the Project has the potential to adversely impact the existing visual character or quality of the affected properties and/or the physical or natural surroundings. Potential visual effects are considered from public roadways and other public vantage points in and around the Pala community. Project design attributes; the potential to remove, change, or add features that contribute to the existing quality of the visual landscape; and, potential conflicts with applicable plans or policies relating to visual resources are considered.

#### 1.1.3 Principal Viewpoints to be Considered

The Project site would be intermittently visible from a number of principal viewpoints within the Pala community, as identified by the County of San Diego Department of Planning and Development Services (PDS), as follows:

- ⊗ View from SR 76 looking east;
- view from SR 76 traveling west; and,
- Niew looking northwest from Pala Casino Resort and Spa (parking garage)

Other views may occur from surrounding public vantage points, such as the Wilderness Gardens County Park located approximately three miles to the southeast, Lilac Road, or other

surrounding residential, agricultural, and commercial uses on private lands; however, such views would generally be visually reduced due to intervening vegetation and/or development, distance, and physical topography. The Project site may be visible from public vantage points across the valley to the south and southeast/southwest from higher elevations, but such views would be visually reduced due to distance from the site, vegetation, topography, and elevational differences.

#### 1.2 PROJECT DESCRIPTION

#### 1.2.1 Project Location

The Project site is located within the 513-acre Warner Ranch property in Pala, California, in northwestern San Diego County. On a regional basis, the Project area is bordered by the City of Rainbow to the northwest; Pala -Temecula Road to the east; and, SR-76 and Pala Casino Resort and Spa to the south. Interstate 15 (I-15) is located approximately four miles to the west; refer to Figure 1-1, Regional/Local Vicinity Map, and Figure 1-2, Aerial Photograph. The Project area includes a portion of Gomez Creek and its channel tributaries on the western side of the property, as well as Pala Creek in the easternmost portion of the Project area. Elevations on the Project site range from approximately 355 feet above mean sea level (amsl) to approximately 1,000 feet amsl. The site is located just west of the northwest corner of the intersection of SR 76 and Pala Temecula Road.

The affected property totals approximately 513 gross acres and includes seven parcels. The County Assessor Parcel Numbers (APNs) that comprise the Project site include APNs 110-021-09 and -10; 110-090-01, -17, and -18; 110-021-32; and, 110-040-22.

#### 1.2.2 Project Description

#### Project Overview

The Warner Ranch Project is intended to provide a range of workforce housing opportunities consistent with the Job/Housing Balance goals and policies of the San Diego County General Plan. The County General Plan and associated Pala/Pauma Subregional Plan provide for the implementation of the Project by designating the 513-acre property as a Special Study Area (SSA). The SSA requires preparation of specific studies relative to Job/Housing Balance, Infrastructure, and Community Compatibility as part of a proposed General Plan Amendment (GPA) to the Land Use Element to allow for higher-density residential development within the SSA and to the Mobility Element for an allowance of increased length of deficiency along SR 76.

The Project proposes a GPA, Specific Plan, Rezone, Administrative Permit (for gated access), Site Plan, and Tentative Map (VTM) (to implement the residential subdivision) to develop 513 acres with 780 residential units and associated public and private facilities and services. The following is a summary of the proposed Project; refer also to Figure 1-3A, Specific Plan Map, and Figure 1-3B, SPA Subareas and Existing Parcels Map.

The Project as proposed would consist of the following:

- 80 780 residential units [534 single-family detached residential units on lots ranging from approximately 3,000 square feet (square feet) to 8,000 square feet, and 246 multi-family and attached townhomes] (refer to Figures 1-4A to 1-4C for housing types);
- ₹ 7.7 acres of private neighborhood parks, clubhouse, and pool;
- № 14.4 acres of privately maintained landscaped areas;
- ≈ 4.2-acre public park (active recreational uses);
- ≈ 359 acres of preserved onsite biological open space;
- ⊗ A fire station (approximately 10,000 square feet);
- Public and private community facilities would include sewer pumps, drainage structures, utility vaults, etc. A water reservoir would be constructed in the northwestern portion of the property. The reservoir would receive water from an existing 8-inch water line in Jeremy Way currently maintained by the Rainbow Municipal Water District (RMWD). Water would then be distributed to the proposed development via a 12-inch line connected to the water reservoir.
- Offsite Improvements: In order to provide the water reservoir onsite, approximately 2,000 linear feet of 8-inch diameter pipeline would be constructed from the terminus of the existing line in Jeremy Way to the property's northern boundary line. Additionally, a 6-inch forced sewer main would run from a proposed pump station near the southwestern boundary of the site to the west within the right-of-way (ROW) of SR 76, where it would ultimately connect to another new pump station (not part of the proposed Project) to be provided by the RMWD. An existing natural gas pipeline would also be extended approximately 1.2 miles to the Project site within the right-of-way (ROW) of SR 76. The gas line would be extended from west of the Project site to the intersection of SR 76 and Pala del Norte.

The Project site would be accessed by a central entry road at its current intersection with SR 76, where a signalized intersection is required. The Project would also result in frontage improvements to the existing 120-foot wide Pala Road/SR 76 easement. The proposed improvements would include widening of the existing 24-foot wide pavement to 52 feet; two

12-foot wide drive lanes; a 12-foot wide painted center median; and, 8-foot wide shoulders that also include a painted bike lane in each direction. Additionally, a 350-foot long and 12-foot wide acceleration/deceleration lane is proposed adjacent to the Project's main entry.

Earthwork quantities for on-site development are anticipated to consist of 2.3 million cubic yards (c.y.) of cut and 2.3 c.y. of fill material. The proposed grading would be balanced onsite with no import or export of materials. The proposed land uses are listed in Table 1-1, Land Use Summary. A variety of residential types are proposed, with the development largely planned within the central/southern portion of the site: Estate Residential, Attached Duplexes, and Six-Plex Courtyard; refer to Figures 1-4A to 1-4C for housing types. In addition, the Project as designed includes a total of approximately 385 acres for recreational, aesthetic, and biological open space purposes. Recreational onsite open space would include a centrally-located private community recreational park that would accommodate a clubhouse and pool; refer to Figure 1-5A, Clubhouse - Elevation. In addition, an approximately four-acre public park is proposed adjacent to the site's frontage along SR 76 and would include such active recreational uses as a baseball field, basketball court, playground, barbeque pits, and paved walking trails. Further, the Project would construct a new fire station on the Project site that would be subsequently transferred to the NCFPD for operation and maintenance. Design of the fire station has not yet been finalized; however, a conceptual drawing is provided as Figure 1-5B, Conceptual Design – Fire Station.

#### Project Schedule / Phasing

The Project would be implemented in phases. It is expected that issuance of building permits for the housing units would be market driven and would generally be phased along with the necessary public improvements. The key aspect of the phasing plan for the SPA is the provision of water, sewer, and fire protection services to support the land uses. Nine subareas were defined through allocated dwelling units which have been coordinated with the necessary infrastructure and facility improvements. Required improvements include the water storage reservoir, water pipelines, sewer pump station, fire station, public and private roadways, drainage improvements, and private and public park facilities. The majority of these facilities would be included in Phase I of the development, along with Residential Unit 1; refer to Figure 1-3B, SPA Subareas and Existing Parcels Map. Review procedures required prior to construction of the common areas and single-family residences may include (1) subdivision maps; (2) use review; and/or, (3) site plan review by the County Department of Public Works (DPW), County Department of Planning and Development Services (DPS), California Department of Transportation (Caltrans), and/or others.

TABLE 1-1 LAND USE SUMMARY

IABLE 1-1			LAND USE SUMMAKY						
Planning/Phasing Area	Total Dwelling Units	3K	4K	5K	6K	8K	Duplex	Six- Plex	Acreage
I	121	28	93	-	-	-	-	-	11.36
II	70	40	30	-	-	-	-	-	8.50
III	69	65	4	-	-	-	-	-	5.70
IV	117	-	-	-	-	-	-	102	7.96
V	66	-	-	-	-	-	-	66	4.24
VI	78	-	-	-	-	-	30	48	6.71
VII	96	-	96	-	-	-	-	-	10.39
VIII	88	-	-	29	44	15	-	-	21.15
IX	75	-	19	56	-	-	-	-	10.36
TOTAL:	780	148	242	85	44	15	30	216	86.52
Total Open Space Area (Biological/Recreational)									385.37
Biological Open Space Pr									359.05
Recreational/Aesthetics C	pen Space								26.32
- Public Recreation	nal Park								4.23
- Private Landsca	ping								14.38
- Private Park & C	Clubhouse								7.71
Fire Management Zone									2.41
<b>Utility Easement</b>									0.10
									2.29
Public Right of Way									>
									31.12
Private Streets									
									31.12
									31.12 4.43

#### Grading

Proposed grading has been designed so as to retain the natural shape of the landform and conform to the existing topography to the greatest extent possible. As stated above, Project grading requirements are estimated to total approximately 2.3 million cubic yards (c.y.) of cut and 2.3 million c.y. of fill material (balanced).

The Project as designed would encroach into steep slopes protected by the County's Resource Protection Ordinance (RPO) on a total of 10 lots; seven lots within the northwestern portion (Lots 253-254 and 256-260) and three lots within the northeastern portion (Lots 428 to 430). The percentage of encroachment into steep slope areas for these lots would range from approximately 2.2 to 15.5 percent; however, all proposed Project encroachment into onsite steep slope areas would be in conformance with maximum RPO allowances. Where the percentage of a lot in steep slope lands is 75% or less, the RPO allows a maximum 10% encroachment into areas of steep slopes; 80% or less, maximum 12% encroachment; 85% or less, maximum 14% encroachment; and 90% or less, maximum 16% encroachment. As RPO conformance would be required per the County's Ordinance, it would not be considered a mitigation measure. Further, several manufactured slopes greater than 30 feet in height would be required to accommodate the proposed development as designed; refer to Figure 1-6A, Manufactured Slopes/Retaining Walls.

Natural drainages within proposed onsite open space areas would be retained in their natural state whenever possible. Measures for the protection of onsite trees, native vegetation, natural drainages, rock outcroppings, and other natural features were considered in the grading design. Grading methods used to preserve the natural contours of the site to the extent possible include creating variable slope gradients with smooth rounded cuts; rounding off toe and crest of slope; blending graded slope contours with the natural topography; utilizing native vegetation to alleviate sharp, angular slopes; preserving natural and significant geologic features; and, designing drainage courses to blend with the natural setting; refer also to Section 1.5.4, Determination of Significance, below for a discussion of Project impacts resulting with manufactured slopes.

Furthermore, all Project grading would be in conformance with requirements of the County of San Diego Grading Ordinance. Refer also to Section 1.5.4, Determination of Significance, for an evaluation of required manufactured slopes and mitigation proposed to reduce potential impacts to less than significant.

#### Lighting and Glare

All exterior lighting proposed with the Project would adhere to Division 9 of the County's Light Pollution Code, or "Dark Skies" Ordinance. The Dark Skies Ordinance is intended to reduce potential adverse lighting effects on astronomical research at the Mt. Palomar and Mt. Laguna observatories in San Diego County. The Dark Skies Ordinance identifies lands within 15 miles of either observatory as being within Zone A, and lands outside of the 15-mile radius, but within the unincorporated portion of the County of San Diego, as within Zone B. The closest observatory to the proposed Project site is the Mt. Palomar Observatory,

located approximately 13 miles to the east; therefore, the Project site is located within Zone A.

All Project lighting types (e.g. landscaping, interior streets, private and public parks) and locations are shown on the Illustrative Street and Park Lighting Plan (as part of the Site Plan) prepared for the Project. Installation of Project lighting would be required to be installed with that shown on the Site Plan approved by the County to ensure that Project lighting would not result in adverse effects on adjacent lands or on the existing character of the Pala community.

Community lighting would be designed to provide adequate illumination for safety, security, and architectural accents without over lighting. The Project lighting design concept is focused on the quality of light along specific corridors and areas, as well as lighting along pedestrian corridors. Light fixtures would direct light to use areas and avoid light intrusion into adjacent areas. Light shields would be used where necessary to avoid nuisance lighting, particularly in residential neighborhoods and adjacent to preserved natural open space. Lighting in both on- and offsite improvements, including all landscape low-voltage decorative lighting, would comply with the County's Light Pollution Ordinance. The Specific Plan further outlines lighting concepts for the Project site, including guidelines for all public spaces within the project.

The height, materials, colors, and configuration of proposed lighting fixtures would be designed to blend with the natural backdrop to the extent practical and to avoid potential lighting impacts on adjacent land uses. All outdoor lighting would be energy-efficient, shielded, and screened to prevent direct rays from reaching adjacent properties. Exterior lighting would be provided to enhance the safety and security of motorists, pedestrians, and cyclists onsite and would be consistent with applicable County outdoor lighting standards.

Unique lighting features may be used to accentuate architectural elements, landscaping, entrances, or pedestrian areas; however, if proposed within visually sensitive areas or adjacent to onsite open space, such treatments would be minimized to the extent possible. All Project lighting would be shielded to minimize the potential for glare or spillover onto adjacent ownerships and/or designated open space lands. As indicated on the Site Plan, uplighting is proposed for selected trees and landscape features, such features would be softly uplit with light sources that produce less than 4,050 lumens in light fixtures that are carefully aimed and fitted with glare shields and louvers.

#### Signage

The following signs would be prohibited:

- Roof signs or any sign extending above the highest point of a building;
- ⊗ Pole signs;

- no Temporary advertising devices and displays; or,
- Notating, revolving, flashing or moving signs.

One monument sign is proposed to identify the entrance to the Project development. The sign is anticipated to be constructed of stone block, approximately 6-8 feet in height, with the words "Warner Ranch" displayed along the monument wall for identification purposes; refer to Figure 1-7, Community Entry — Elevation. The sign would be integrated into the community entryway, which would be constructed of stone pilasters and would incorporate two wooden gates to allow for the passage of vehicles to and from the development area. Landscaping would also be provided to define the entry and to enhance its prominence. The entryway would be constructed within the roadway median and set back from the main entry off of SR 76, and would therefore not be visible to those traveling along SR 76. All Project signage would be consistent with County design standards for monument signs and other signage information.

#### Access / Circulation

#### Construction Access

All materials for Project construction would be delivered to the site by truck. Project truck traffic would travel on designated area truck routes and/or major streets. Construction vehicles would access the site from SR 76 at the main entrance. Traffic resulting from construction activities would be temporary and may occur along area roadways as workers and materials are transported to and from the Project area.

#### **Project Access**

As stated above, SR 76 and I-15 provide regional access to the Project site. The County General Plan Mobility Element classifies SR 76 as a 2.1D Community Collector. Direct access to the site would be provided from SR 76 via a central entry road; refer to Figure 1-3A, Specific Plan Map. An all-way traffic signal would be installed at the intersection of the main entrance and SR 76. The Project would also construct frontage improvements within the existing 120-foot wide Pala Road/SR 76 right-of-way. These improvements would include widening the existing 24-foot wide pavement to 52 feet, two 12-foot wide drive lanes, a 12-foot wide painted center median, and 8-foot wide shoulders that would also include a painted bike lane in each direction along the length of the Project frontage. Additionally, a 350-foot long and 12-foot wide acceleration/deceleration lane is proposed adjacent to the Project's main entry. Emergency access would be provided by two roads near the eastern and western property boundaries with connection to SR 76. Both of these alternate access roads would be gated and only used in an emergency.

The Project would also initiate and contribute to a Project Study Report/Project Design Study with Caltrans. The Project applicant may ultimately complete or contribute to offsite improvements at three intersections to mitigate for traffic impacts: SR 76/East Pala Mission Road, SR 76/Lilac Road, and/or SR 76/Cole Grade Road. Precise improvements are being developed with Caltrans and may include additional turn lanes, traffic signals, and/or roundabouts.

#### **Onsite Circulation**

All onsite roads are proposed to be private roadways, designed consistent with the County's Private Road Standards, the Pala/Pauma Subregional Plan, and the Community Design Element of the Warner Ranch Specific Plan.

#### Trails and Walkways

The Project design includes a network of pathways and trails that meander along streets and within the open space areas. The Specific Plan provides details of the Project's trail network. There are no trails identified in the Community Trails Master Plan within proximity of the Project except for a Class III bike lane along SR76.

A public multi-use trail (1/2 mile) would run along the Project's frontage in addition to private trails (2.2 miles) that are proposed internally and along portions of the Project's perimeter. The trail widths are 4 foot, 8 foot and 12 foot wide respectively. The public trail is situated along the southern boundary of the project adjacent to SR 76 and would be 8 feet wide within a 15-foot public easement and be a multi-use trail. This trail would be constructed of stabilized decomposed granite or other material deemed suitable by the County. The internal trails will be four feet wide and located on the eastern edge of the main entrance road as well as near the western edge of the Project. The western trail connects with the 12-foot wide agricultural road/trail that traverses to the northern edge of the Project and connects to the existing avocado grove roads. The agricultural road/trail would be constructed of decomposed granite and will be used as a multi-use trail.

#### Landscaping

The landscape design guidelines proposed with the Warner Ranch Specific Plan encourage an overall design concept that visually enhances and blends with the surrounding built and natural environments. The Warner Ranch Specific Plan provides guidance for street tree planting; Primary and Secondary Themed Roads; landscape edge zones along roads and trails and at entry points and monuments; fire suppression zones; transition areas (ornamental to native areas); plantings along slopes; revegetation; and, retention of native vegetation and vegetation removal; refer to the Warner Ranch Specific Plan for a detailed discussion of

specific landscape design measures. Refer also to Table 1-11, Design Measures, and Figure 1-6B, Landscape Plan.

The overall theme for Project landscaping is intended to create a visually unified community reflective of both native and local landscape tradition that are respective of the natural landscape found within the surrounding area. All proposed landscaping would be consistent with the County's landscaping requirements and measures included in the Warner Ranch Specific Plan, as applicable. Drought-tolerant, deer-tolerant, and native species shall be used wherever possible to minimize water usage and maintain the visual and rural character of the natural environment. An informal tree theme is proposed through use of informal shrub massing. Stands of riparian tree species would be emphasized within the natural riparian areas. All irrigation plans shall be compliant with the County's Water Conservation in Landscaping Ordinance and Water Efficient Landscape Design Manual.

Proposed Project landscaping includes a variety of trees and other plantings to provide screening of views from SR 76 and other offsite public vantage points; refer to Figure 1-6B, Landscape Plan. Landscaping for the proposed Project would be utilized to minimize views into the site and to blend the development into the surrounding natural environment. Landscaping would be provided along the Project frontage and elsewhere within the interior to enhance the entryway and provide Project screening from offsite locations, in addition to creating a natural landscape that visually blends the development into the existing setting. Landscaping would also be used around onsite structures to visually reduce the surface area of larger buildings and enhance their appearance within the setting. In addition, landscaping would be provided within the interior of the property, along the private roadways, and within recreational open space areas to enhance views of the development and to reflect existing vegetation types in the surrounding rural community. Landscaping is intended to reinforce the form of the land, employing mounding and rounded plant forms when appropriate. Vegetation of varying heights and textures would be placed along perimeter walls and fences to visually soften hard planes by creating interest and variety.

#### Walls and Fences

Walls and fences would be designed using traditional materials, such as stone and wood that complement the natural and rural landscape while reflecting the community enhancements and landscape theme. Community theme walls and sound walls would provide screening, sound attenuation, security, and community identity. Wall and fence concepts are illustrated in Figure 1-6C, Wall and Fence Plan.

A variety of walls and fences would be installed along the Project boundaries and within the interior of the development. A six-foot high decorative block wall or 6-foot high tubular steel view fence would be installed along portions of the western, northern, eastern, and southern

limits of the Project development footprint. A three-foot high rail vinyl (wood) fence would generally be installed along the Project frontage adjacent to SR 76. Other walls and fences (e.g. to delineate the property boundary between adjoining residential lots) would be installed within the residential and recreational areas onsite, as specified in greater detail in the Warner Ranch Specific Plan, and as shown on the Wall and Fence Plan.

Additionally, several walls would be constructed onsite to reduce potential noise levels generated by vehicles traveling along SR 76. A number of proposed residences in the southern portion of the development area would be exposed to potential traffic noise; refer to Figure 1-6C. To reduce noise levels, sound walls constructed at seven feet (Lot 319); eight feet (Lots 213, 219-220); and, nine feet (Lots 214-218) in height would be required along the rear boundary of these lots, facing SR 76. These walls would be earth toned in color and distanced from SR 76 by approximately 75 feet or greater. Landscape screening would be planted to further reduce the visibility of these walls from travelers along SR 76; refer also to Table 1-2, Design Measures, which identifies specific design measures that will be adopted and implemented as part of the Project to reduce visual effects of the Project on the existing landscape.

#### Community Entry

The main entrance would be secured and gated and would incorporate monument signage and landscaping materials consistent with the surrounding natural landscape character. Typical gateway entry elevations are shown in Figure 1-7, Community Entry - Elevation. One monument sign is proposed to identify the entrance to the Project development. The sign is anticipated to be constructed of stone block, approximately 6-8 feet in height, with the words "Warner Ranch" displayed along the monument wall for identification purposes; refer to Figure 1-7, Community Entry – Elevation. The sign would be integrated into the community entryway, which would be constructed of stone pilasters and would incorporate two wooden gates to allow for the passage of vehicles to and from the development area. Landscaping would also be provided to define the entry and to enhance its prominence. The gated entryway would be set back from the main entry off of SR 76, and therefore, the gates would not be visible to those traveling along SR 76. As it would not be visible from the roadway, the proposed gated entry would not represent a visible element that would conflict with the existing character of the community.

#### Streetscape

All onsite roads are proposed to be private roadways, designed consistent with the County's Private Road Standards and requirements of the Pala/Pauma Subregional Plan, NCFPD requirements, and design measures given in the Community Design Element of the Warner Ranch Specific Plan. All onsite private roadways would conform to an overall streetscape

design theme. Design for private onsite streets would include landscaping, decomposed granite walkways, and bike lanes and/or pedestrian trails, consistent with the existing natural character of the area.

Roadway improvements, including landscaping, would be designed to complement the existing natural topography, to reduce the requirement for grading, and to protect and enhance existing views. Onsite, Primary Theme Roads would incorporate continuous design and landscaping elements to adequately enable various modes of circulation.

The following streetscape elements would be integrated into the design of all Primary Theme Roads onsite:

- & Vehicular circulation lanes;
- ⊗ Bike lanes:
- Pedestrian walkways;
- Parkway plantings;
- >> Traffic control devices:
- Street safety lighting and signage designs; and,
- Entry treatments where applicable.

Pedestrian amenities would also be provided in the form of shade tree canopies and appropriate street furnishings. Where walls are unavoidable, particular attention would be given to a comfortable pedestrian scale and to the provision of pilasters, plan offsets and landscaping to relieve visual monotony.

#### **Utilities**

A portion of the Project site is situated within the boundaries of the Rainbow Municipal Water District (RMWD). The Project would require annexation into the RMWD (and San Diego County Water Authority - (SDCWA) for water and sewer service. The RMWD has provided the Project applicant with a Project Facility Availability Letter that indicates the RMWD's ability to meet the water service demands of the Project. All associated facilities, including water pipelines and sewer gravity mains, would be constructed in accordance with RMWD and County design standards.

One water tank is proposed to be located in the northwestern portion of the Project site along the hillside. An existing water line located within Jeremy Way that terminates just north the Project's northwestern boundary would be extended to connect to the onsite water tank. The tank would have an estimated capacity of four million gallons. The tank would be approximately 135 feet in diameter and would be approximately 42 feet in height above

finished grade, once installed. The location of the proposed tank would be approximately one mile north of SR 76 at its closest point. Therefore, due to the height of the tank and distance from the nearest roadway, the tank would generally not be visible from SR 76, and views from SR 76 would be substantially limited and intermittent due to intervening vegetation and site topography. Although the tank may be visible from limited offsite vantage points to the south/southeast at a distance across the valley, the height of the tank as measured from the proposed building pad and distance at which views would occur, combined with surface treatment (painting of the tank in an earth-toned color), would greatly reduce visibility of the tank (or obscure it from view) within the visual landscape; no landscape screening is proposed. Refer also Section 1.5.4, Determination of Significance, which provides an analysis of potential visual effects resulting with construction of the water tank.

Sewer service would also be provided by RMWD. Improvements necessary to provide for the Project's wastewater disposal needs include the construction of a pump station located in the southwestern portion of the property. The pump station would connect to a proposed 6-inch diameter force main line that would be located within the SR 76 ROW. The forced main pipeline would carry sanitary sewer flow from the Project site westerly to a pump station located near Pankey Road.

San Diego Gas and Electric (SDG&E) would provide gas service to the Project site. To provide natural gas to the site, gas lines within SR 76 west of the Project site would be extended approximately 1.2 miles to the intersection of SR 76 and Pala del Norte, to the west of the Project boundary.

#### 1.2.3 GENERAL PLAN LAND USE DESIGNATIONS AND ZONING

The existing and proposed County of San Diego General Plan land use designations and zoning for the affected parcels are given in Tables 1-2 and 1-3, below. The Project proposes a change to both the existing land use designation and zoning to allow for preparation of a Specific Plan that would provide Project-specific goals, policies and programs for development of the site to ensure compatibility with existing and future land uses within the community. Refer also to Figure 1-8, Existing/Proposed Land Use, and Figure 1-9, Proposed Zoning.

TABLE 1-2 GENERAL PLAN LAND USE

		•	
Assessor Parcel Number	Approximate Acreage	Existing General Plan Land Use Designation	Proposed General Plan Land Use Designation
110-021-09	80	Rural Lands (RL-40)	Rural Lands (RL-40)
110-021-10	80	Rural Lands (RL-40)	Rural Lands (RL-40)
110-090-01	183	Rural Lands (RL-40)	VR 2.9 DU/AC
110-090-17	40	Rural Lands (RL-40)	VR 2.9 DU/AC
110-090-18	40	Rural Lands (RL-40)	VR 2.9 DU/AC
110-021-32	40	Rural Lands (RL-40)	(19) Rural Lands (RL-40)
110-040-22	39	Rural Lands (RL-40)	Rural Lands (RL-40)

**TABLE 1-3 ZONING** 

Assessor Parcel Number	Approximate Acreage	Existing Zone	Proposed Zone
110-021-09	80	(A70) Limited Agriculture	(S80) Biological Open Space
110-021-10	80	(A70) Limited Agriculture	(S80) Biological Open Space
110-090-01	183	(A72) General Agricultural	(S88) Specific Plan
110-090-17	40	(A72) General Agricultural	(S88) Specific Plan
110-090-18	40	(A72) General Agricultural	(S88) Specific Plan
110-021-32	40	(A72) General Agricultural	(S80) Biological Open Space
110-040-22	39	(A72) General Agricultural	(S80) Biological Open Space

#### Anticipated Permits and Agency Approvals Required

The County of San Diego will act as the Lead Agency under the requirements of CEQA. Approval from the County of San Diego would be required for grading and construction permits, as well as for right-of-way encroachment permits, if applicable, prior to commencement of ground-disturbing activities. The anticipated permits and approvals required are listed in Table 1-4.

TABLE 1-4 ANTICIPATED PERMITS AND APPROVALS

Permit Type/Action	Agency
General Plan Amendment	
Rezone	
Specific Plan	
Administrative Permit (Gate Entry Permit)	
Vesting Tentative Map	
Site Plan (Vesting and "D" Designator)	
County Right-of-Way Permits	
Construction Permit	
Excavation Permit	
Encroachment Permit	County of San Diego
Landscape Plans	
Grading Permit	
Habitat Loss Permit	
Improvement Plans	
Underground Storage Tank Permit (Sewage Treatment and Fire	
Protection)	
Final Subdivision Map	
Building Permits	
Air Quality Permit	
	Rainbow Municipal Water District;
Aggregation to a City on Consolal District	County Water Authority; Local Agency Formation
Annexation to a City or Special District	Commission (LAFCO); North County Fire
	Protection District
Deannexation to a City or Special District	CSA 135
State Highway Encroachment Permit	CALTRANS
401 Permit – Water Quality Certification	Regional Water Quality Control Board (RWQCB)
California Surface Mining and Reclamation Act (SMARA),	
Sections 2762 and 2763 – Elimination of Access to a State-	County of Son Diogo
Designated Mineral Resource Area Statement of Reasons	County of San Diego
(SOR)	
National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System (NPDES)	RWQCB
Permit	RWQCB
General Construction Storm Water Permit	RWQCB
Waste Discharge Requirements Permit	
Water District Approvals	Rainbow Municipal Water District
Sewer District Approvals	County Water Authority

#### 1.2.4 REGULATORY FRAMEWORK

#### State of California Guidelines

The Project is subject to technical and environmental review pursuant to CEQA, in conformance with applicable regulatory guidelines established by the County of San Diego.

Appendix G of the CEQA Guidelines states that a project has the potential for a significant impact if it will:

- a) Have a substantial adverse effect on a scenic vista;
- b) Substantially damage scenic resources, including, but not limited to: trees, rock outcroppings, and historic buildings within a state scenic route;
- c) Substantially degrade the existing visual character or quality of the site and its surroundings; or,
- d) Create a new source of substantial light or glare which would adversely affect day or nighttime views of the area.

In addition, CEQA Section 15064 (b) states "...the significance of an activity may vary with the setting ... an activity which may not be significant in an urban area may be significant in a rural area." This statement is applicable to the determination of the significance of a visual effect for the Project.

#### San Diego County Plans and Policies

#### <u>San Diego County General Plan</u>

The County of San Diego General Plan (adopted August 3, 2011) is intended to provide guidance for the long-term development of San Diego County. The General Plan includes various Elements that provide guidance for accommodating future growth while retaining or enhancing the County's rural character, its economy, its environmental resources, and its unique communities. Goals, policies and objectives are provided within each of the Elements to guide future land development and ensure consistency with the County's intended vision for the future of San Diego County. An evaluation of Project conformance with applicable goals and policies of the General Plan will be provided in the General Plan Amendment Report prepared for the Project.

#### <u>Pala/Pauma Subregional Plan</u>

The Pala/Pauma Subregional Plan is supplemental to the County of San Diego General Plan and provides goals and policies to guide development in this area of San Diego County, including the community of Pala. The Plan is intended to provide for orderly, planned growth as development occurs, ensuring that adequate services such as water, sewer, fire protection, and school services are available.

#### Warner Ranch Special Study Area

As stated above, with approval of the County of San Diego General Plan in August of 2011, the Pala/Pauma Subregional Plan identified the proposed Project site as a SSA. The SSA requires additional land use planning analysis to evaluate important property constraints and issues used "to determine the most compatible and consistent land uses for the property." The

requirement for additional analysis resulted in the Project applicant preparing the following studies: 1) Feasibility Study; 2) Infrastructure Study; and, 3) Land Use/Community Character Study. These studies are available under separate cover.

#### <u>San Diego County Zoning Ordinance</u>

Portions of the County Zoning Ordinance that may affect the assessment of visual impacts are generally zoning overlay designators. Relevant designators to the Visual Resources analysis include:

- ⊗ B Community Design Review Area
- ⊗ D Design Review Area
- ⊗ G Sensitive Resource
- ₩ H Historic/Archaeological Landmark or District
- ⊗ J Special Historic District
- ⊗ S Scenic Area

None of the above designators apply to any of the affected parcels, with exception of the G-Sensitive Resources designator, and the D – Design Review designator, which apply to all seven of the parcels. The Project would require compliance with the design standards identified in the Specific Plan with implementation of the "D" Special Area designator proposed as part of the zoning.

#### County of San Diego Resource Protection Ordinance

The County of San Diego Resource Protection Ordinance provides detailed development standards and thresholds for the protection of sensitive environmental resources including floodplains, wetlands, and biologically/visually significant areas. The RPO requires certain discretionary projects to undergo review to ensure that such resources are protected for the long-term through dedication of open space land. Lands affected by the RPO are present on the Project site.

The Project would provide protection of onsite sensitive RPO lands to the extent feasible; however, the Project as designed would encroach into steep slopes protected by the County's RPO on a total of 10 lots; seven lots within the northwestern portion (Lots 253-254 and 256-260) and three lots within the northeastern portion (Lots 428 to 430). The percentage of encroachment into steep slope areas for these lots would range from approximately 2.2 to 15.5 percent. Per Section 86.604(e)(2) of the RPO, and based upon the area of steep slopes within each lot and the percentage of each lot within RPO steep slopes, all proposed Project encroachment into RPO steep slope areas would be in conformance with maximum RPO encroachment allowances. Where the percentage of a lot in steep slope lands is 75% or less,

the RPO allows a maximum 10% encroachment into areas of steep slopes; 80% or less, maximum 12% encroachment; 85% or less, maximum 14% encroachment; and 90% or less, maximum 16% encroachment. As RPO conformance would be required per the County's Ordinance, it would not be considered a mitigation measure.

An opportunities and constraints analysis prepared for the Project identified all significant wildlife and sensitive habitats, canyons, rock outcroppings, steep slopes, and ridgeline features onsite. As a result, the Project has been designed to preserve approximately 359 acres, or 70 percent of the entire property, as dedicated biological open space for long-term protection. The proposed Project will be reviewed by County staff to ensure conformance with the Ordinance.

#### 1.3 VISUAL ENVIRONMENT

#### 1.3.1 Project Setting

The Project site is approximately 513 acres in size, comprised of seven individual parcels. The Project site supports diverse topography ranging from gentle to steep slope terrain.

Steep slopes, defined by the County of San Diego's Resource Protection Ordinance as slopes having a natural gradient of 25 percent or greater and minimum rise of 50 feet, occur largely in the northerly and easterly portions of the property. These areas currently support existing structures, orchards, an unnamed intermittent stream, and a network of unimproved roadways. The Project would provide protection of onsite sensitive RPO lands to the extent feasible; however, the Project as designed would encroach into steep slopes protected by the County's RPO on several lots within the northeastern portion of the development footprint. Project encroachment into RPO steep slope areas would not exceed 10 percent for any affected lot and would be in conformance with maximum RPO encroachment allowances.

Onsite elevations range from approximately 355 feet amsl to approximately 1,000 feet amsl. The northern portion of the site generally supports moderate to steep slopes, while the south-central areas consist of mostly level terrain with gently rolling hills. The majority of slopes onsite exceed 15 percent, with approximately 31 percent (156.91 acres) of onsite slopes ranging between 25 percent and 50 percent, and 28 percent (144.33 acres) of slopes exceeding 50 percent or greater. Along the Project frontage on SR 76, elevations range from approximately 350 feet amsl to 367 amsl. In the southeastern portion of the site, adjacent to SR 76, topography is varied and a large hill is present. The hill rises from approximately 370 feet amsl along the roadway to approximately 620 feet amsl near its highest point and largely blocks views from vantage points located to the east/southeast into the Project site, as well as those traveling east-west along portions of SR 76. In the northeastern portion of the site, the property gradually rises from the valley floor to a high point of approximately 910 feet amsl,

then slopes to the east where elevations near the northeasterly boundary of the proposed development footprint are generally 415-430 feet amsl. The majority of slopes within the northeasterly area of the site generally exceed 25 percent. Slopes ranging from 15 to greater than 50 percent generally span the western/northwestern portion of site; however, development is not proposed in this land area, allowing the terrain to remain in its natural state. Elevations within the proposed development footprint in the northwestern portion of the site reach a height of approximately 480 feet amsl near the northern portion of the proposed development footprint; refer also to Figure 1-2, Aerial Photograph. The proposed water tank would be constructed approximately 0.5 mile northeast of the boundary of the residential development area in the northwestern portion of the property. Existing elevation in this area of the site is approximately 960 feet amsl.

Approximately 77 percent of the site is undeveloped; the remaining 23 percent, or 117.6 acres, is developed and presently supports active agricultural and ranch uses, as well as disturbed land. The undeveloped areas are located in the northern and eastern portions of the site. Areas supporting agricultural uses and ranch facilities are more centrally located in the southern portion of the property. Existing development onsite includes the "Warner Ranch" Quarter Horses equestrian facility and associated support buildings such as an office, stables, and arena, equipment and feed garages, and irrigation equipment/storage; refer to Figures 1-11 to 1-13, Onsite Views.

The agricultural areas onsite include two avocado orchards located to the west, two citrus orchards located in the south central portion of the site, and pastures for livestock keeping. Several existing residences are located adjacent to the orchards and pastures, as well as a main house and garage. There are also existing asphalt roads crossing throughout the agricultural and ranch areas to allow access for operation and maintenance.

The San Luis Rey River, Pala Creek, and Gomez Canyon Creek are the main water bodies in the area of the Project site. Gomez Creek flows vertically along the western side of the Project site and converges with the San Luis Rey River further to the south. In addition, Pala Creek traverses the northeastern corner of the property.

Eleven habitat types have been identified onsite and largely consist of coastal sage scrub and southern mixed chaparral. Other smaller habitats include coast live oak woodland, southern cactus scrub, scrub oak chaparral, grasslands, mule fat scrub, coast live oak riparian forest, southern cottonwood willow riparian forest, and sycamore alluvial riparian woodland.

The Project site contains sensitive lands which are an integral part of several designated regional open space and wildlife corridors. The property is located within the boundaries of the County of San Diego's Draft North County Multiple Species Conservation Program (NCMSCP) and is designated as a Proposed Pre-Approved Mitigation Area (PAMA).

PAMA's are areas identified by the Wildlife Agencies as having high biological value and therefore, conservation efforts are strongly encouraged.

As identified on the Pala-Pauma Resources Conservation Area (RCA) Map in the Pala/Pauma Subregional Plan, natural resources in the Pala area include Mount Olympus, approximately 1.5 miles to the northwest of the Project site; Tourmaline Queen Mountain, approximately two mile to the northeast; and, Mount Gregory to the south and Pala Mountain to the southeast, just across SR 76. The County's Wilderness Gardens Preserve is located approximately three miles to the southeast across SR 76 and offers four miles of public trails, a staging area, a pond, and restrooms. Palomar Mountain State Park lies approximately 11 miles to the east.

#### Surrounding Land Uses

The Project site is located in the community of Pala, within northwestern San Diego County. To the north of Pala lies the community of Rainbow; to the east is the Pauma Indian Reservation; to the southeast lie Pauma Valley and Rincon; to the southwest lies Pala Mesa Village; and, to the west lie the communities of San Luis Rey Heights, Winterwarm, and Live Oak Park. Approximately three miles to the southeast across SR 76 lies the County of San Diego Wilderness Gardens Preserve. Further to the north and east are portions of the Cleveland National Forest and the Agua Tibia Wilderness Area, and approximately 11 miles to the east is Palomar Mountain State Park.

Surrounding land uses in the Project vicinity vary and include single-family and multi-family residential uses, retail commercial uses, sand mining operations, agricultural uses, and undeveloped lands. Land adjacent to the north and northeast of the Project site is currently undeveloped. Agricultural uses are present to the west and south.

#### Land Uses on the Pala Reservation

The Pala Band of Mission Indians Reservation lies directly to the north, east, and southeast. Development on the Reservation is not regulated by the County, but is overseen by the Federal Bureau of Indian Affairs (BIA). This area also supports a school, a wastewater treatment plant, a shooting range, a motocross raceway, and other facilities and services that are open to the public, such as a convenience store, gas station, Pala Learning Center, Cupa Cultural Center, and Pala Casino Resort and Spa; refer to Figure 1-14, Photo Location Map – Offsite Views; Figures 1-15A and 15B, Surrounding Land Uses; Figure 1-16, Offsite Views; and, Figure 1-17, Community Context Map.

The Pala Band of Mission Indians has been funding and building homes exclusively for tribal members within the Reservation. The Pala Housing Authority (PHA) was formed in order to provide continued housing and assisted loan programs. Several new homes have been

completed since then. The PHA has begun the planning and building of small master-planned communities in an attempt to ultimately ensure housing for every Tribal member. Since 2004, the PHA has been designing new home plans, ranging from three-bedroom to five-bedroom homes on lots measuring approximately 3,000 to 6,000 square feet in size. Other small-scale retail and commercial uses in the area typically range from approximately 2,000 to 5,000 square feet in size.

The Pala Casino Resort and Spa to the southeast of the Project site supports a number of amenities in addition to the casino, such as retail stores, a spa, golf, dining and entertainment venues, and a small commercial center. The resort includes roughly 600 hotel rooms ranging from approximately 500 to 1,000 square feet in size. The Casino's facilities and parking areas have recently been renovated and expanded. The main level of the casino was extended along the north and west sides, increasing the structure by approximately 68,300 square feet. The spa was also remodeled to increase the number of available treatment rooms, locker rooms, and lounge spaces, and the pool area was expanded. The parking expansion accommodated approximately 1,930 new spaces, located in new parking structures to the north and west of existing structures. In addition, approximately 30,000 square feet of administrative office and storage space were constructed; refer to Figures 1-15A and 1-15B, Surrounding Land Uses and to Figure 1-16, Offsite Views. With the recently completed expansion, the casino, hotel, and theater now encompass approximately 187,300 square feet.

In the area directly surrounding the site, there are 141 lots on approximately 1.3 acres. An 8-acre mobile home park is north of SR 76, west of Portillo Road, and supports between 20 and 30 homes. Just north of SR 76 and south of Pala Mission Road, single-family residential development is present with approximately 50 lots estimated at 8,000 square feet (varied). Another cluster of units is present to the north of SR 76 along Robles Way with approximately 26 lots estimated to be between 9,000 and 12,000 square feet. Another planned area is further north along Pala Temecula Road, off of Magee Lane, with approximately 22 lots estimated to range 8,000 square feet to 13,000 square feet in size (varied). Just to the northeast across Pala Temecula Road is another development with approximately 30 lots estimated to be between 11,500 square feet to 22,000 square feet. Further to the north along Sycamore Lane, additional development of 13 residential lots estimated to range from 12,000 square feet to 14,000 square feet is present. Additional single-family development on individual lots of similar sizes and larger-acre parcels is interspersed throughout the areas to the north and east of the Reservation.

The Pala Wastewater Treatment Plant is located on approximately 1.8 acres east of the Project site. Plans to rehabilitate the treatment plant have been proposed to allow for the construction of 9,630 additional feet of sewer line and a single lift station. The plant currently serves approximately 160 of the 425 homes located on the nearby reservation land. The

rehabilitation project would allow connection to approximately 50 additional residents that are currently served by underground septic systems.

The Pala Raceway is planned approximately 1.5 miles east of the Project site and would operate as a 240-acre Mega Motocross Raceway. The project would result in construction of 12 professionally designed tracks, 300 campsites, a clubhouse, a restaurant, a three-acre fishing pond, a BMX track, and a bike wash for all park visitors.

#### Land Uses in the Unincorporated Area

The Pala Shooting Range, operated by the North County Shootist Association (NCSA), is located off of SR 76, approximately five miles east of I-15. The shooting range offers a variety of shooting venues limited to club members and invited guests. The facility allows for shooting practice and recreational shooting, with shooting matches scheduled on the weekends. Other planned developments within the Project area include the Gregory Canyon Landfill, San Diego Gas & Electric's (SDG&E's) substation expansion, Rosemary's Quarry, and offsite road improvements along SR 76, in association with the planned expansion of the Pala Casino. The proposed Gregory Canyon Landfill is to be located on Highway 76, approximately three miles east of I-15 and two miles southwest of the Pala community. The Landfill site is located adjacent to the San Luis Rey River, along the western slope of Gregory Mountain. The Gregory Canyon Landfill encompasses approximately 1,770 acres, of which approximately 308 acres are to be used to support overall landfill activities, which would include stockpile areas, ancillary facilities, access roads, and refuse disposal. The project would be permitted as a Class III landfill.

#### Visual Quality Definitions

Visual quality is affected by the aesthetic characteristics of a particular area. Such aesthetic elements may include physical characteristics, as well as the perception of the viewer. Physical characteristics influencing the visual quality of an area may include such features as topography, landform, natural vegetation, water bodies, visual diversity, and visible coloring. Viewer perception is generally influenced by vividness, intactness, harmony, visual integrity, adjacent scenery, and/or visual unity. These elements all influence the overall evaluation of the quality of a particular view.

Areas with high visual quality may offer physical characteristics such as varying vertical relief; established natural vegetation with visually pleasing form, color, texture or pattern; water features; or, other elements that create a visually unified landscape. Particular views with high visual quality may include those with distinct focal points or patterns; enhanced or existing natural scenery; compatibility with the character of the surrounding landscape; and/or, a unique visual setting within the surrounding area.

Moderate visual quality is generally considered to be represented by views that are interesting, but not visually exceptional with regard to landforms or other physical characteristics. Such views may consist of dominant types of vegetation; water features; colors within the landscape; or, other elements that visually unify a particular view or landscape. Contributing factors may include a varied composition that includes visual patterns created by landscape elements; enhancement of views from adjacent scenery; and/or, a visual setting that is distinguishable from, as well as visually similar to, views within the surrounding area.

Low visual quality may be represented by areas with limited or no existing landforms or changes in topography; sparse or indiscernible vegetation types, due to density; absence of water features; monotonous color palettes; or, limited visual elements of varying visual interest. Visual quality may be considered to be low if views are varied, but visually disconnected; lack perceivable visual patterns; are adjacent to views that devalue the existing scenic quality; or, do not generally represent a visual setting that is common and/or valued within the surrounding area.

#### Baseline Visual Environment

The parcels comprising the Project site are located within the community of Pala along the valley floor, wherein development is largely concentrated along the SR 76 corridor. The valley is defined by a series of mountains at varying distances from the Project site, allowing for a range of views to the valley floor below. The Project site is defined by hillsides to the west, north, and east, and SR 76 to the south.

# 1.3.2 PROJECT VIEWSHED

The viewshed is generally the area that is visible from an observer's viewpoint and includes the screening effects of intervening vegetation and/or physical structures. Viewsheds may occur from designated scenic viewpoints or from singular vantage points where an unobstructed view of visual components within the landscape exists. The viewshed is composed of such elements as topography and natural land features (i.e., hillsides, mountains) and other physical features within the landscape, such as buildings, vegetation, water features. Potential visual impacts within the viewshed may be affected by distance of the viewer from a site, the frequency and length of views, the personal perception of the viewer, and physical and/or atmospheric conditions at the time viewing occurs.

The Project site is located along the valley floor which is visible from varied vantage points that occur from the valley and the surrounding mountains. As such, the viewshed is generally defined by the surrounding mountainous topography which encircles the valley floor and through which the SR 76 corridor traverses. Although this area is expansive, consideration of

this viewshed provides the most comprehensive (largest) and conservative (worst-case) estimate of the area that could potentially be affected by the proposed Project. Refer to Figure 1-18, Key Views/Landscape Units, which shows the viewshed in the area surrounding the Project.

Within the viewshed, varied views of the valley largely occur from vehicles as they travel along SR 76, which winds along the valley floor and is the main transportation corridor through the Pala community. Other intermittent views to the Project site may occur from vehicles traveling along other area roadways within the valley; from mountains to the north/northwest, southeast/south/southwest, and west; and, from public trails or other recreational facilities in surrounding public parks (Wilderness Gardens Park to the southeast). The viewshed includes the developed areas of Pala and surrounding, low-density development and undeveloped lands within the valley, generally bounded by the mountains rising from the valley floor. Due to the generally flat topography of the valley floor and varied hillsides, combined with established vegetation, views are somewhat restricted across the expansive valley from surrounding vantage points within the viewshed. Distance from the object being viewed and intervening geological features have the potential to reduce or restrict views.

Figure 1-18, Key Views/Landscape Units, shows the general limits of the viewshed and the landscape units considered within the viewshed as part of this analysis. To characterize the visual pattern elements that occur within the Project viewshed, three key view locations were identified by the County of San Diego Department of Planning and Development Services and were analyzed herein to determine the Project's potential impacts on the existing visual setting. Key vantage points within the viewshed offering views to the site occur from eastbound and westbound SR 76 and from the Pala Casino parking garage. Representative photos were taken from these key viewpoint locations; refer to Figure 1-18, Key Views/Landscape Units, and are shown in Figures 1-19 through 1-21. Key views are described in detail in Section 1.1.3, Principal Viewpoints to be Considered.

## 1.3.3 LANDSCAPE UNITS

A landscape unit is an area that can generally be defined by visual and physical characteristics and may be composed of a limited area (i.e., meadow) or a larger area (i.e., portion of a mountain range). The overall boundaries of a landscape unit may generally be defined by topography, natural vegetation, architectural design, landforms, or similar types of land uses. Each landscape unit can be described individually and as varying from other adjacent landscape units. Each landscape unit is a portion of the regional landscape that often corresponds to a place or district that is commonly known among local viewers.

As the Project would have the potential to affect views to the site from a number of surrounding properties within the valley, several landscape units that may potentially be affected by construction of the proposed development were identified. Landscape units are shown in Figure 1-18, Key Views/Landscape Units, and described below.

## Landscape Unit #1

Landscape Unit #1 consists of the area within the Pala community along SR 76 where commercial uses are concentrated, generally centered around the intersection of SR 76 and Pala Mission Road. This area supports the Pala Casino Resort and Spa, associated parking garages, a gas station and convenience store, a bus staging area, and various small-scale retail uses. A number of single-family residential uses are also present. This landscape unit supports limited native vegetation, with exception of street trees and ornamental landscaping associated with the Pala Casino Resort and Spa, as well as significant areas of paved surfaces. Building heights range from single-story structures (retail, residential) to the multistoried Pala Casino Resort and Spa. This landscape unit is generally bounded by the small-scale retail uses on the north, the Pala Spa to the east, the Pala Casino Resort and Spa to the south, and the existing ridge located along the easterly Project boundary to the west. As much of the vegetation and topography are similar throughout this area, landscape components do not generally offer strong, visually distinctive patterns to viewers, particularly when viewed at a distance.

# Landscape Unit #2

Landscape Unit #2 consists of the developed area to the east of the Project site. This area supports largely single-family residential uses, with interspersed small-scale commercial and institutional uses, on the Pala Band of Mission Indians Reservation. Development generally consists of one- to two-story structures with intervening native and ornamental vegetation. This Landscape Unit is generally bounded to the north by hillsides, to the east by agricultural lands, to the south by SR 76, and to the west by the Project site. As much of the vegetation and topography are similar throughout this area, and no visually significant structures or features are evident, landscape components do not generally offer strong, visually distinctive patterns to viewers, particularly when viewed at a distance; refer also to Figure 1-13, Onsite Views, and Figure 1-16, Offsite Views.

# Landscape Unit #3

Landscape Unit #3 consists of lands further to the east of the Project site, on the Pala Band of Mission Indians Reservation. Such lands are generally large-acre ownerships or those supporting low-density, single-family development or agricultural operations. Topography is

typically flat and vegetation is generally low-lying scrub vegetation, with few significant stands of natural vegetation, or agricultural crops. This landscape unit is generally bound to the west/northwest by Henderson Road; to the north by hillsides; to the east by a sewer treatment plant; and, to the south by SR 76. This landscape unit largely supports agricultural uses which offer little visual diversity, but that visually contrast both in color and pattern with land uses to adjacent to the west and east, which include low-density residential and commercial development.

# Landscape Unit #4

Landscape Unit #4 consists of those supporting low-density, single-family development and/or agricultural operations to the south/ southeast of the Project site, across SR 76. These lands include Indian Reservation lands as well as several parcels under private ownership. Topography is generally flat and vegetation is generally low-lying scrub vegetation, with few significant stands of natural vegetation. This landscape unit is generally bounded by the San Luis Rey River, which flows east-west through the northern portion of the Landscape Unit, and SR 76 to the north; sloping hillsides and Lilac Road to the east and south; and, sloping hillsides to the southwest. As much of the topography is flat and unvaried and limited vegetation is present, this landscape unit does not support components that combine in visually unique patterns, but offers some visual diversity and contrasts with adjacent lands composed of the mountains and areas supporting much denser vegetation.

# Landscape Unit #5

Landscape Unit #5 consists of the sloping hillsides to the west, north, and east of the Project site and beyond. These mountains are topographically varied and offer a series of sloping hillsides and distinct ridgelines. This landscape unit supports limited development, although a few residential uses and a utility easement corridor are visible along the slopes and the ridgelines. Vegetation is largely native and consists of a variety of trees and low brush, interspersed with intermittent rock outcroppings. The limits of this unit are generally defined by the ridgelines to the north, east, and west of the Project site, and the low lying portions of the Project site to the south.

Although vegetation is visually similar to other lands within the surrounding area, this landscape unit offers a visual topographical contrast with adjacent flatter lands located along the valley floor and helps to define a visual corridor along the nearby reach of SR 76.

# Other Landscape Units

Other visible and locally recognized landscape units occur at a greater distance from the Project site and include the Wilderness Garden Park to the southeast, and the mountainous area to the south/southeast; however, due to area topography, intervening development and vegetation within the landscape, or distance, the Project site would not be highly visible from these locations. As such, although such landscape units are recognized as contributing to the overall character of the community, they were not analyzed further herein for their potential to be affected by the proposed Project.

# 1.4 EXISTING VISUAL RESOURCES AND VIEWER RESPONSE

## 1.4.1 Existing Visual Resources

The lands affected by the Project support a number of visual resources. The Project site offers diverse topography ranging from gentle to steep slope terrain. As stated earlier, onsite elevations range from approximately 350 feet amsl to approximately 1,000 feet amsl. The northern portion of the site generally supports moderate to steep slopes, while the south-central areas consist of mostly level terrain with gently rolling hills. Steep slopes, defined by the County of San Diego's RPO as slopes having a natural gradient of 25 percent or greater and minimum rise of 50 feet, occur largely in the northerly and easterly portions of the property. Approximately 87 percent of all RPO steep slopes onsite are designated as Open Space in the County's General Plan. These areas currently support existing structures, orchards, an unnamed intermittent stream, and a network of unimproved roadways.

The undeveloped areas are located in the northern and eastern portions of the site. Areas supporting agricultural uses and ranch facilities are more centrally located in the southern portion of the property. Existing development onsite includes the "Warner Ranch" Quarter Horses equestrian facility and associated support buildings such as an office, stables, and arena, equipment and feed garages, and irrigation equipment/storage.

The agricultural areas onsite include two avocado orchards located to the west, two citrus orchards located in the south central portion of the site, and pastures for livestock keeping.

The San Luis Rey River, Pala Creek, and Gomez Canyon Creek are the main water bodies in the area of the Project site. Gomez Creek flows vertically along the western side of the Project site and converges with the San Luis Rey River further to the south. In addition, Pala Creek traverses the northeastern corner of the property.

The Project site contains sensitive lands which are an integral part of several designated regional open space and wildlife corridors. The property is located within the boundaries of the County of San Diego's Draft NCMSCP and is designated as a Proposed PAMA. PAMA's are areas identified by the Wildlife Agencies as having high biological value and therefore, conservation efforts are strongly encouraged.

## Visual Character and Quality

#### <u>Landscape Unit #1</u>

Landscape Unit #1 consists of the area of the Pala community along SR 76 where commercial uses are concentrated, generally centered around the intersection of SR 76 and Pala Mission Road. The visual character of this landscape unit offers highly varied pattern elements, ranging from the large-scale, multi-storied Pala Casino Resort and Spa (600 guest rooms) with two associated multi-level parking structures and surface parking, to small-scale, single-story retail commercial retail uses to the north and west of the Casino. These uses contrast in terms of scale and bulk, as well as in the materials, colors, and textures, and therefore, a distinct visual pattern or sense of visual intactness or unity is not achieved. The Pala Casino Resort and Spa and associated structures represent highly dominant features within the landscape, exceeding the scale of all other structures within the landscape unit. The varied mixture of uses creates a highly diverse visual setting, with little visual continuity, although the SR 76 which runs down the center of this landscape unit creates a sort of visual corridor along which these uses are centered. Little vegetation is visible within the area, with exception of ornamental landscaping associated with the Pala Casino.

This landscape unit offers a high degree of vividness and memorability of the landscape, largely due to the contrast and lack of a sense of visual coherence or unity between the visually dominating larger-scale structural elements and the small-scale uses. In addition, the SR 76 corridor presents a visual division between the Casino facilities and the smaller retail and residential uses to the north.

#### Landscape Unit #2

Landscape Unit #2 consists of the developed area to the east of the Project site. This area supports largely single-family residential uses, with interspersed small-scale commercial and institutional uses. Development generally consists of one- to two-story structures with intervening native and ornamental vegetation. This Landscape Unit is located within the Pala Band Indian Casino Reservation, and as no standardized design guidelines apply, overall character of the area is diverse, with little visual cohesiveness or continuity. The overall visual appearance, scale, mass, and size of the structural elements within the landscape unit are not notable, as compared to the adjacent landscape unit supporting the Pala Casino Resort and Spa and associated facilities, as no elements are visually significant. As such, landscape components offer a limited visual impression or sense of vividness; however, as many of the elements are similar in nature with regard to size, materials used, and land use, a general sense of visual unity is achieved within the landscape unit, creating a somewhat unified and coherent visual pattern, but with little visual significance.

#### Landscape Unit #3

Landscape Unit #3 consists of lands further to the east of the Project site, on the Pala Band of Mission Indians Reservation. Such lands are generally large-acre ownerships or those supporting low-density, single-family development or agricultural operations. Topography is generally flat and vegetation is low-lying scrub vegetation, with few significant stands of natural vegetation, or agricultural crops.

This landscape unit supports limited structural elements within the landscape consisting largely of single-family residential uses and facilities supporting agricultural operations. Structures are generally one to two stories and do not represent visual bulk or mass or features of notable scale within the visual landscape. The active agricultural crops generally present a similar visual pattern and likeness in color; however, such colors can be varied, based on viewing distance to the forms, sunlight and time of day, and texture of the surfaces. These lands are interspersed with contrasting fallow lands of brownish reds and tan hues and topography of little variation.

#### Landscape Unit #4

Landscape Unit #4 consists of undeveloped lands or those supporting low-density, single-family development or agricultural operations to the south/southeast of the Project site, across SR 76. These lands include Indian Reservation lands and several private ownerships. The San Luis Rey River flows east-west through the Landscape Unit. Topography is generally flat and vegetation is low-lying vegetation, with few significant stands of natural vegetation. Topography within this landscape unit is visually flat, due to its use for agricultural production, creating a pattern with limited variation. Limited elements of visual bulk, dominance, or scale occur within this landscape. Lands within this unit are generally similar with regard to color, due to the vegetation they support.

The components within this Landscape Unit do not offer a high degree of visual contrast, due to the nature of the agricultural and undeveloped lands, and therefore, do not combine to create distinctive visual patterns. The landscape has a moderate degree of intactness, as it is generally free from competing visual elements. In addition, a sense of visual unity is evident, as the landscape components join together to generally form a coherent visual pattern.

#### <u>Landscape Unit #5</u>

Landscape Unit #5 consists of the sloping hillsides to the west, north, and east of the Project site and beyond. These mountains are topographically varied and offer a series of sloping hillsides and distinct ridgelines. This landscape unit supports limited development, although several residential uses and a utility easement corridor are visible along the slopes and the ridgelines. Colors generally range from a variety of greens to tans and browns. As the hillsides are largely undeveloped, no notable features of significant mass, bulk, or scale occur

within the visual landscape; however, the scale of the mountains is evident as compared to the relative flatness of the valley floor.

This landscape unit offers a sense of vividness and creates a memorable visual impression through varied geologic forms, particularly when influenced by sunlight. The mountains offer a unified and generally coherent visual pattern with few encroaching elements as they rise from the valley below.

## 1.4.2 VIEWER RESPONSE

Viewer response is based on both viewer sensitivity and viewer exposure. These elements influence how a viewer may potentially respond to a change in the visual landscape, particularly with regard to development of a site from a generally undeveloped condition. Viewer response varies based upon the type of viewer and the characteristics of the visual environment that would ultimately be affected (i.e., urban versus rural environment, established large-scale commercial area versus low density residential uses, etc.). Viewer response is largely influenced by viewer sensitivity and viewer exposure, as described in greater detail below.

## Viewer Sensitivity

Viewer sensitivity to a change in the visual environment can be influenced by a number of factors, including the awareness of the viewer, personal interest in a particular visual resource, and/or viewer activity during the time that views of a resource occur (i.e., vehicle driver versus passenger, active versus passive viewing). In addition, the particular goals or values of a community can influence the sensitivity of viewers to a particular site, land area, or viewshed. Viewer sensitivity may vary between those with a vested interest in a community (i.e., residents) versus those traveling through an area with little or no knowledge of the community or existing visual landscape. Based on these conditions, viewer sensitivity can be assigned a value of low, medium, or high.

It is likely that community members would be more sensitive to the Project than would those who experienced Pala as a tourist or visitor. The Pala Casino Resort and Spa draws a large number of visitors to the area on a daily basis, as compared to the relatively small number of permanent local residents in the Pala community. In addition, viewer sensitivity may be higher among those who would experience views of the site more frequently, such as area residents or employees of the Pala Casino or other local establishments who would travel along SR 76 on a daily basis. As views of the Project components would also vary due to distance from the site, as well as travel speed and the degree to which one chooses to make an effort to view the site (e.g. turning of one's head), viewer sensitivity would further be influenced.

## Viewer Groups

Viewer groups would mainly consist of those individuals traveling east/west along SR 76 and other area roadways within the valley to the southwest/southeast of the Project site. Additional viewer groups from public vantage points may occur along Lilac Road to the southeast of the Project; however, due to distance from the site (approximately two miles) and intervening topography, views of the proposed development would be greatly diminished. Views of the western boundary of the Project site would also occur to travelers along Pala Temecula Road; however, due to the existing ridgeline and the Project design, views of the proposed development areas from this roadway would be limited to only a few homes in the southeastern portion of the site.

Additional viewer groups may include residents and/or occupants viewing the Project site from surrounding residential uses to the north/northwest, south, southwest/southeast. In addition, limited views from the Pala Casino Resort and Spa property may occur intermittently, depending on the viewing location; however, such views of the Project site from these vantage points would generally occur from privately-owned properties and are not considered as public viewpoints. Views from these private ownerships would occur at a distance from the Project and would be decreased due to distance, topographical differences, and intervening vegetation and development.

## Viewer Exposure

Views into the Project site from vehicles traveling along SR 76 would vary, but would be limited and brief, due to travel speeds and the angle of the view with respect to the viewer (i.e., forward-looking versus turning one's head and looking back towards the subject property). In addition, views would be reduced by existing and/or proposed screening vegetation along the Project frontage. Views of the site from other public roads at greater distances may also occur. Viewer exposure from these roadways would vary, due to distance from the site, intervening topography and vegetation, and length of time the Project site is actually visible from a particular location along the roadway.

In determining the exposure of each viewer group, several factors are considered. These include the number of viewers experiencing visual changes to the resource as the result of the proposed development, how long views would last, the anticipated speed at which viewers would be traveling, and the relation and distance of the viewer to the particular site.

Table 1-5, Viewer Groups and Anticipated Exposure, summarizes the anticipated viewer groups and the potential viewing experience of each.

TABLE 1-5 VIEWER GROUPS AND ANTICIPATED EXPOSURE

Anticipated Viewer Group	Number of Anticipated Viewers	Key Views	Distance to the Project Site	Anticipated Views with Project Implementation	Sensitivity	Duration of View
Drivers along SR 76	Estimated 10,000 people per day <sup>1</sup>	#1 and #2	Close Distance / Adjacent to Project Site	Intermittent views of Project site	Medium	Estimated 10-20 seconds
Occupants of Pala Casino Resort and Spa	Varied	#3	Close Distance / Approximately 0.15 mile	Limited views of Project site	Low	Average of 10 hours per day
Drivers along Pala Temecula Road	Estimated 8,300 average daily vehicle trips		Medium Distance Approximately 0.0 to 0.65 mile	Limited views of Project site	Low	Varied / Estimated 0-20 seconds
Private residences in surrounding area	Varied / Not Public Views		Varied	Limited views of Project site	Low	Average of 10 hours per day

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Traffic Analysis prepared by KOA. Corporation, May 2013. Average daily traffic (ADT) along SR 76 from I-15 eastward to the Project site (Pankey Road) ranges from 11,031 to 8,821 ADT.

#### Viewer Awareness

Viewer response is affected by the degree to which a viewer is receptive to visual details, character and quality of the surrounding landscape. A viewer's perception is affected by his/her activity and the degree to which he/she actively participates in noticing a change in the visual environment.

Viewer awareness to potential visual changes in the setting that may occur with the Project would be varied. A viewer would first need to be in a location within the surrounding area where the Project site was visible (e.g. from a higher elevation), then actively notice that a change in the visual landscape has occurred. Viewer awareness would also vary between local residents and those who are experiencing the area as a tourist, wherein the local residents would likely be more aware of a change in the visual environment. In addition, viewer awareness would also vary due to distance from the proposed facilities, as views occurring at a greater distance would diminish the visibility of the Project components within the landscape.

# 1.5 VISUAL IMPACT – GUIDELINES FOR DETERMINING SIGNIFICANCE

The California Environmental Quality Act Guidelines define "environment" to include "objects of...aesthetic significance (Section 15360)." As such, the County of San Diego has identified thresholds of significance to assess potential impacts resulting from proposed development.

The following significance guidelines are intended to provide guidance in the evaluation of whether a significant impact to visual resources would occur as a result of project implementation. A project will generally be considered to have a significant effect if it proposes any of the following:

- Entroduction of features that would detract from or contrast with the existing visual character and/or quality of a neighborhood, community, or localized area by conflicting with important visual elements or the quality of the area (such as theme, style, setbacks, density, size, massing, coverage, scale, color, architecture, building materials, etc.) or by being inconsistent with applicable design guidelines;
- Removal or substantial adverse change of one or more features that contribute to the valued visual character or image of the neighborhood, community, or localized area, including but not limited to landmarks (designated), historic resources, trees, and rock outcroppings;
- Substantially obstruct, interrupt, or detract from a valued focal and/or panoramic vista from a public road, a trail within an adopted County or State trail system, a scenic vista or highway, or a recreational area; or,
- The project would not comply with applicable goals, policies or requirements of an applicable County Community Plan, Subregional Plan, or Historic District's zoning.

## 1.5.1 KEY VIEWS

Several key views of the Project site from surrounding public vantage points were identified for the Project; refer to Figure 1-18, Key Views/Landscape Units, and Figures 1-19 through 1-21, which illustrate existing views of lands affected by the Project. As described below, views of the Project from these vantage points would be limited by distance from the site, travel speeds, angle of the view (i.e., looking directly to the site or turning one's head to look back to the site), topography, and intervening natural vegetation and/or land uses.

## Key View #1 – SR 76 Traveling East

Key View #1 is the view looking northeast along eastbound SR 76 to the Project site; refer to Figure 1-19, Key View #1, which shows existing views from this vantage point. Viewers from this location would mainly be passengers in vehicles traveling along SR 76. As indicated in Table 1-5, drivers along SR 76 would experience varied and intermittent views of the site from Key View #1 for an estimated 10 to 20 seconds; however, due to proposed landscaping, Project design, and site topography, views of the site from this vantage point would be varied and intermittent.

From this vantage point, views of the Project site are brief and intermittent, due to established natural vegetation along the roadway, site topography, and travel speeds. Views largely consist of low-lying natural vegetation and stands of trees with relatively level topography in the foreground, and mountains of varying elevation in the background. The existing visual landscape offers somewhat memorable landscape components and distinctive visual patterns, and therefore, visual quality and character are considered to be medium. Glimpses of the proposed uses would be visible from this location in areas where vegetation along the frontage is less dense.

As shown in Figure 1-19, intermittent views of the Project from this location would be of the limited residential uses in the southwestern portion of the site; views of the fire station would not occur, as they would be blocked by the residential uses. Other similar residential and commercial uses are also visible within the existing landscape to eastbound travelers along SR 76. Project design would include landscaping along the Project frontage to further blend the Project into the surrounding setting. The Project does not propose elements of significant height or scale, and has been designed to distance the higher density residential uses from the roadway. Although views to the site would change as one travels along the roadway and views of the development from Key View #1 would be limited, viewer response to the visual change in the landscape is anticipated to be medium as many travelers along this roadway would be residents of the community, in addition to those traveling to the Pala Casino Resort and Spa and other uses within the Pala Village. As such, due to sensitive Project design and the viewing conditions described above, it is not anticipated that the development would introduce elements that would significantly detract from or contrast with the existing visual character and/or quality of the community.

# Key View #2 – SR 76 Traveling West

Key View #2 is the view looking northwest along westbound SR 76 to the Project site; refer to Figure 1-20, Key View #2, which shows existing views from this vantage point. Viewers from this location would mainly be passengers in vehicles traveling along SR 76. As indicated in Table 1-5, drivers along SR 76 would experience varied and intermittent views

of the site from Key View #2 for an estimated 10 to 20 seconds; however, due to proposed landscaping, Project design, and site topography, views of the site from this vantage point would be varied and intermittent.

Similar to those views of the site for eastbound travelers, views of the site from this vantage point would be brief and intermittent, due to established natural vegetation along the roadway, site topography, and travel speeds. At vantage points along the easterly Project frontage, brief views into the southerly portion of the site are afforded from the roadway; refer to Figure 1-20, Key View #2. Views largely consist of low-lying natural vegetation and stands of trees with relatively level topography in the foreground, and mountains of varying elevation in the background. The existing visual landscape offers somewhat memorable landscape components and distinctive visual patterns, and therefore, visual quality and character are considered to be medium.

Intermittent views into the Project from this location would be of the residential uses in the southeastern portion of the site, although the slope in the southeastern portion of the site adjacent to the road would block views as one approached the property. As one traveled along SR 76, views of the detention basin, public park and fire station would occur intermittently; however, similar residential and commercial uses are also visible within the landscape to westbound travelers along SR 76. As stated above, Project design includes landscaping along the SR 76 frontage to blend the Project into the surrounding setting and limit views to the interior. The Project does not propose elements of significant height or scale, and has been designed to distance the higher density residential uses from the roadway. Although views to the site would change as one travels along the roadway and views of the development from Key View #2 would be limited, viewer response to the visual change in the landscape is anticipated to be medium as many travelers along this roadway would be residents of the community, in addition to those traveling from the Pala Casino Resort and Spa and other uses within the Pala Village. Due to sensitive Project design and the viewing conditions described above, it is not anticipated that the development would introduce elements that would significantly detract from or contrast with the existing visual character and/or quality of the community.

## Key View #3 – Pala Casino Resort and Spa

Key View #3 is the view of the Project site looking northwest to the site from the existing Pala Casino Resort and Spa; refer to Figure 1-21, Key View #3, which shows existing views from the second floor of the easterly parking garage. Viewers from this location would be patrons and employees arriving at or departing from the Pala Resort complex. Although views from this vantage point would occur on private property and not public viewing locations, views from this location were evaluated herein per request of County DPLU.

From this vantage point, views of the Project site are limited due to intervening topography, distance from the site, and natural onsite vegetation. Views generally consist of the large ridge in the southeastern portion of the site, along with the lower-lying lands and gently sloping mounds within the southern portion of the property. Views of the established onsite natural vegetation and existing citrus/avocado groves are also visible, with limited visibility of several existing onsite structures. Expansive surface parking associated with the Pala Resort complex is highly visible in the foreground, along with the convenience store and gas station. Views of the mountains of varying elevation occur in the background. The existing visual landscape does not offer highly memorable landscape components, although somewhat distinctive visual patterns are formed by the contrast between the flatter portions of the site and the mountains of varied topographical characteristics in the background, changing with the angle of sunlight and time of day. With consideration for the parking and commercial uses seen in the foreground, visual quality and character are considered to be medium.

Views of the Project from this vantage point would include the limited views of the residential uses located in the southern portion of the site; however, onsite topography and proposed landscaping along the frontage along SR 76 would substantially reduce such views into the interior; refer to Figures 1-19 through 1-21. Additionally, the Project does not propose elements of significant height or scale, and has been designed to distance the higher-density residential uses from the roadway. As the majority of views from this location would generally be from employees or patrons of the Pala Resort complex who would not be highly invested in any visible change in the existing landscape, viewer response to the visual change is anticipated to be intermediate. Due to sensitive Project design and the viewing conditions described above, it is not anticipated that the development would introduce elements that would significantly detract from or contrast with the existing visual character and/or quality of the community.

# 1.5.2 ASSESSMENT OF VISUAL CHARACTER AND VISUAL QUALITY

#### Assessment of Visual Character

Natural landforms, natural vegetation, and a mixture of agricultural, educational, industrial, small-scale commercial, and single-family residential uses, as well as large parcels of undeveloped land exist in the area surrounding the Project site; however, such visual components would generally not be adversely affected by the proposed development. The Project has been designed to preserve approximately 359 acres, or 70 percent, of the site as

permanent open space, allowing existing vegetation and topography in this area to remain in its natural state, and avoiding changes to the natural topography or setting.

During the construction phase, the visual character would be changed from its existing condition to disturbed, and would offer views of construction activities, exposed surfaces, and building of housing and supporting roadways, utilities and services, and recreational facilities; however, such activities would be phased and short-term. Due to onsite topography and Project design, a large portion of the grading and constriction would be hidden from view from the majority of offsite vantage points. As such, viewer response is considered to be low.

The Project would permanently change the composition of the visual pattern in the existing onsite setting. The onsite physical character (i.e. presence of native vegetation, colors, visual diversity) would be altered with installation of the residential units and supporting uses; however, with consideration of varied views to the site from offsite properties and travelers along nearby public roadways, the visual changes resulting from the Project would not dominate or substantially change the existing visual pattern of the area, nor would the Project incorporate elements that would substantially obstruct or diminish existing views; refer to Figures 1-19 and 1-20 which illustrate views of the Project site from surrounding public vantage points.

Similar residential and small-scale uses are present in the area to the east of the Project site, in addition to the large-scale commercial complex represented by the Pala Casino Resort and Spa. The Pala Band of Mission Indians has been funding and building homes exclusively for tribal members located within the Reservation. Since 2004, the Pala Housing Authority has since been designing new home plans, ranging from 3-bedroom to 5-bedroom homes and measuring approximately 3,000 square feet in size. A number of new homes have been completed since 2004. In addition, the Pala Housing Authority has begun the planning and building of small master-planned communities in an attempt to ultimately ensure housing for every Tribal member. The Pala community also includes schools, commercial uses, and facilities and services that are open to the public such as the convenience store and gas station, the Pala Learning Center, Cupa Cultural Center, and Pala Casino Resort and Spa. As such, the elements proposed with the Project do not differ greatly in visual character as compared to existing land uses in the surrounding community. As visibility of the Project components would be reduced as a result of concentrating the majority of development within the interior, lower portions of the site, combined with site topography and the landscaping proposed along the SR 76, an adverse change to the overall character of the existing visual pattern through the introduction of elements that would create visual dominance or scale is not anticipated with Project implementation. The proposed development would not represent a new visual feature that would appear substantially different from the character existing elements in the surrounding community; refer also to

Chapter 2.0, Community Character Analysis, which further evaluates Project impacts on the existing character of the community.

## Assessment of Visual Quality

The visual quality of a view is partially influenced by the viewing location from which public views occur. The viewing location can allow for views that are generally either expansive in nature or focused on a specific view of a site or particular feature within the landscape. In addition, visual quality is influenced by the particular characteristics of the viewing corridor within which a view occurs. Visual quality is also affected by the quality of the overall viewshed area being viewed. Areas identified as having high visual quality are those which are identified as being sub-regionally important and possessing high scenic value.

Views of the site from SR 76 are limited, as previously described, due to travel speed, existing vegetation, and site topography. Views from public vantage points in the surrounding community vary, but are generally intermittent, and reduced through distance from the site, intervening development, topography, and existing onsite vegetation. The site presents a landscape that is generally visually intact, and due to the nature of the onsite vegetation and the visual character of adjoining lands, is generally considered to have a visual harmony with adjacent lands, particularly with lands to the west and north/northeast. Visual diversity onsite is of medium value, with varied topographical elements or features, including the flatter portions of the site where ranching activities are present, rolling hills that support the citrus groves, and steeper hillsides supporting avocado groves or that are undeveloped and remain in their natural state. No visual features are present that are considered to disrupt or dominate the visual landscape. As such, the affected lands are generally considered to have a medium visual quality; however, the site is not considered to be subregionally important in a visual sense, or possessing a high scenic value.

The visual quality of Project lands would be potentially affected during the construction phase. Views of the site would include grading and construction activities, presence of construction vehicles and workers, and storage of building materials. Existing vegetation would provide some visual screening of the site; however, construction impacts on visual quality would be temporary and short-term, and would ultimately cease when construction is complete. Once construction is completed, no other changes to the visual landscape would occur, with the exception of proposed landscaping that would mature over time.

Views of the site would be permanently changed once the Project was constructed. The Project would allow approximately 70 percent of the site to be preserved as biological open space and remain in its natural state. This would allow the majority of onsite steep slopes and sensitive biological areas to protected, allowing such resources to continue to contribute to the visual quality of the site and to avoid disturbance of landscape components that

contribute to the intactness and coherence of the natural setting. Additionally, the Project has been designed to locate much of the development within the interior of the site, away from SR 76 to further reduce effects on the visual quality of the property. In addition to those measures identified in the Specific Plan, the Project proposes design measures intended to ensure that the proposed development is respective of the surrounding community character and contributes to the visual quality of development within the viewshed; refer to Table 1-11, Mitigation Measures. The Project would be constructed to achieve a visual coherence amongst the proposed elements through implementation of design measures aimed at colors, materials, architectural design, walls/fences, signage, and other elements. In addition, landscaping is proposed to reflect the natural setting, thereby adding to the visual unity of the site with consideration for the surrounding setting. As such, the Project is not anticipated to significantly affect or alter the visual quality of the site within the viewshed, and would not significantly disrupt the intactness of the natural elements onsite.

## 1.5.3 ASSESSMENT OF VIEWER RESPONSE

Viewer response to visual changes on the Project site with development of the proposed facilities is anticipated to be varied, depending upon the portion of the Project being viewed and the location of the public vantage point. Viewer response during the construction phase may be greater because grading activities, construction equipment, and varying stages of roadway and building pad construction may be visible from offsite public roads and other public vantage points within the Project vicinity. Viewers would likely be most sensitive to views of construction equipment entering and leaving the site from SR 76, as well as exposed onsite surfaces resulting from Project grading. Some cut or fill slopes may be visible from offsite locations; however, due to site topography and the sensitive siting of the proposed elements within the landscape, it is anticipated that such views would be limited and further reduced by distance from offsite viewing locations.

Although the Project would be phased, once construction is completed, no other changes to the visual landscape would occur, as no other development or improvements are proposed. Proposed landscaping would continue to mature over time, thereby visually enhancing the property and further blending the site into its surroundings. Additionally, as the greatest number of viewers would be those traveling along SR 76 and would consist of members of the community, visitors (largely to the Pala Casino), and others traveling through the community, viewer response is considered to be medium as a limited number of viewers would have a significant interest in changes to the existing visual setting. Additionally, travel speed, site topography, and distance from the development would also reduce viewer sensitivity to a change in conditions on the site. Furthermore, once developed, a sense of familiarity with onsite conditions resulting with the Project would occur, and the development would not represent a "new" visual condition over time.

Viewer response from other public vantage points within the valley or from public roadways located at a distance is anticipated to be low. Views of the proposed development from locations within the community would generally be reduced or blocked due to intervening development and vegetation, differences in elevation, site topography, and Project design. Viewer response from more distant locations would be low, as the Project would not represent a significant visual feature within the landscape due to distance and existing and proposed vegetation, as well as placement of the majority of the development largely along the lower, flatter portions of the site where it would be less visible than if placed along the slopes or ridgelines.

## 1.5.4 DETERMINATION OF SIGNIFICANCE

 Introduction of features that would detract from or contrast with the existing visual character and/or quality of a neighborhood, community, or localized area by conflicting with important visual elements or the quality of the area (such as theme, style, setbacks, density, size, massing, coverage, scale, color, architecture, building materials, etc.) or by being inconsistent with applicable design guidelines.

## Historic Development Patterns

The proposed Project would result in future development of the Project site, thereby changing the land use on a portion of the property from the existing ranching operations to residential, recreational, and civic (fire station) uses; however, as designed, the Project would concentrate development into the southern portion of the property, allowing the majority of the property to remain as undeveloped open space. The Project design concentrates development adjacent to the SR 76 corridor, where developed lands are already present and support a mixture of land uses, and adjacent to the Pala Indian Reservation which supports higher-intensity uses including the Pala Resort Casino and Spa, a school, a wastewater treatment plant, a shooting range, a motocross raceway, and other facilities and services that are open to the public, such as a convenience store, gas station, Pala Learning Center, and Cupa Cultural Center. A mixture of single-family and mobile home residential uses is also present on Tribal Lands and/or County lands adjacent to the proposed development area; refer to Figures 1-15A and 1-15B, Surrounding Land Uses, and Figure 1-17, Community Context Map. Other development within the Project area includes the Pala Raceway, Gregory Canyon Landfill, SDG&E's Substation expansion, Rosemary's Quarry, and road improvements along SR 76.

Although the Project would change the character of (a portion of) the existing onsite land use, a similar change has continued to occur over the past several decades in the Pala community as undeveloped, rural lands become developed lands. An evaluation of the

historic development patterns and change in land uses over past decades on and around the Pala Indian Reservation is provided in Chapter 2.0, Community Character Analysis, of this document (see Section 2.4.3). In support of this evaluation, a series of historical aerial photographs was prepared, and the establishment and expansion of land uses within the area documented over time; refer to Figures 2-1A to 2-1K. This discussion is briefly summarized herein to avoid repetition; refer to Chapter 2.0 for additional discussion and for the supporting exhibits.

In the early part of the 21st century, lands within the Pala community were largely undeveloped. Development was generally focused in the area where present-day Pala Temecula Road and SR 76 intersect. A number of outlying structures were scattered along the flatter portions of the valley floor, particularly to the east and south just north of presentday Lilac Road, and generally distanced from one another. Over subsequent decades, the establishment of varying civic, commercial, and institutional uses occurred, still largely centered around the SR 76/Pala Temecula Road intersection. As years passed and population within the community continued to grow, a number of higher-density residential uses were established on smaller-acres parcels closer to the central "core," with larger-acre ownerships developed with more rural-residential type uses. By 2005, construction of the Pala Casino Resort and Spa and the associated parking garages occurred, with the Pala Reservation Shooting Range, hazardous waste collection center (south of SR 76), Oceanview Mine, Pala community park/civic center, the Pala wastewater treatment plant, Pala Fire Station, and additional residential development subsequently taking place. Development over the past several years has slowed somewhat, and has generally consisted of single-family residential uses in areas where similar development is already present with some infill uses around the central "core" occurring.

As illustrated in Figures 2-1A to 2-1K, development within the Pala community has significantly increased over the past several decades and ranges from a mixture of higher-density land uses including civic (post office, fire station, several community parks, etc.), commercial (small-scale retail to large-scale hotel/casino/spa, gas station/convenience mart), and residential uses, largely concentrated along Pala Temecula Road, Pala Mission Road, and SR 76, with lower-density residential uses occurring on the outlying lands. Residential development within the Pala community has historically been focused around the intersections of SR 76/Pala Temecula Road and Pala Mission Road/Pala Temecula Road, extending northward along Pala Temecula Road, with lower-density residential uses occurring at a distance to the south of SR 76, where agricultural uses are also present.

Furthermore, Figure 2-2, Surrounding Land Uses, illustrates existing land uses within the Pala community. It should be noted that development on the Pala Indian Reservation is not subject to County of San Diego regulations and is otherwise overseen by the Federal Bureau of Indian Affairs (BIA) and the Pala Housing Authority. Therefore, as the County's General

Plan land use categories do not apply to lands on the Pala Indian Reservation, Figure 2-2 generally categorizes the Reservation lands to show existing land uses on the ground (e.g. commercial, residential, institutional, etc.) as determined through in-person land surveys, available land use data from the San Diego Association of Governments (SANDAG), and review of aerial photography databases. As shown in Figure 2-2 and as described above, civic use-types are generally concentrated around the Pala Temecula Road/Pala Mission Road, and SR 76, including a post office, a school, a community park/civic center, the Pala Fire Station, and the Mission San Antonio de Pala.

The proposed Warner Ranch Project acknowledges this established development pattern by concentrating development in the central and southeastern portions of the subject property, within proximity of SR 76 and the more developed areas of the Pala community. This design approach would allow the portions of the Project site that are further away from the higher-intensity uses of the community (e.g. the northern and western portions) to remain undeveloped, in particular where lands with a County General Plan land use designation of SR 10 (Semi-Rural Residential), RL 20, or RL 40 occur to the northwest/west of the site; refer also to Chapter 2.0, Community Character Analysis, which provides an in-depth explanation of the proposed General Plan Amendment required to allow for the density proposed with the Project and how the proposed development is consistent, based on technical studies prepared to evaluate development appropriate within the Warner Ranch SSA.

## Surrounding Average Parcel Size

Section 2.4.3, Consistency with Visual Character, in Chapter 2.0, Community Character Analysis, provides an in-depth discussion of the historic development patterns and land uses occurring on and around the Pala Indian Reservation over the past several decades that contribute to the existing character of the Pala community. A series of historical aerial photographs was prepared to illustrate such development patterns and to document the establishment and expansion of land uses within the area over time; refer to Figures 2-1A to 2-1K in Chapter 2.0, Community Character Analysis. Section 2.4.3 also provides an evaluation of the average parcel size within the area surrounding the Project site. This discussion is intended to provide the reader with an understanding of how development has historically progressed within the community and describe the character of the layout/land use patterns that has resulted. As this discussion is considered relevant to the analysis of how Project design is consistent with surrounding historic development/layout patterns and community character, the analysis and supporting exhibits are not repeated herein for the Visual Resources Analysis. Refer to Section 2.4.3 for additional discussion.

#### Location / Lot Size

An in-depth analysis of lot size and residential density patterns with regard to the Pala community is provided in Section 2.4.3, Consistency with Visual Character, of Chapter 2.0, Community Character Analysis, of this document. As such, the discussion provided below summarizes that analysis. However, to avoid duplication, the exhibits supporting the evaluation are not repeated herein; refer to Chapter 2.0 of this document.

The proposed Project area is located in the community of Pala in unincorporated San Diego County. Surrounding land uses in the Project vicinity vary and include single-family residential uses, commercial and recreational uses, sand mining operations, agricultural uses, and undeveloped lands. Adjacent to the north, west, and south are larger-acre lands (within San Diego County) that have a General Plan land use designation of RL 40 (Rural Lands – 1 DU/40 acres). Further to west (approximately 0.5 mile) are smaller parcels with a land use designation of RL-20 (Rural Lands – 1 DU/20 acres). Agricultural uses are present to the south and southeast, across SR 76.

The Pala Band of Mission Indians Reservation lies directly to the northeast, east, and southeast of the Project site. Higher densities consisting largely of commercial and civic uses on are concentrated within the Pala Village. This area also supports a school, a wastewater treatment plant, a shooting range, a motocross raceway, and other facilities and services that are open to the public, Pala Learning Center, Cupa Cultural Center, Pala Town Center, Pala Fire Station, and the Pala Casino Resort and Spa and associated parking garages and gas station/convenience store located just west of the Casino. Residential uses include mobile/manufactured homes and single-family homes. Housing types range in square footage and density from visibly planned "clusters" of higher density to individual structures on larger-size lots or on lots where agricultural uses are also present.

The Pala Casino Resort and Spa, which includes a hotel, casino, and parking, supports a number of amenities such as retail stores, a spa, golf, dining and entertainment venues, and a small commercial center. The resort includes roughly 600 guest rooms ranging from approximately 500 to 1,000 square feet in size. Two multi-level parking structures provide parking for the complex. The Casino's facilities and parking areas have recently been renovated and expanded. The main level of the casino was extended along the north and west sides, increasing the structure by approximately 68,300 square feet. The spa was also remodeled to increase the number of available treatment rooms, locker rooms, and lounge spaces, and the pool area was expanded. The parking expansion accommodated approximately 1,930 new spaces, located in new parking structures to the north and west of existing structures. In addition, approximately 30,000 square feet of administrative office and storage space were constructed. With the recently completed expansion, the casino, hotel, and theater now encompass approximately 187,300 square feet.

The Pala Band of Mission Indians has been funding and building homes exclusively for tribal members located within the Reservation. The Pala Housing Authority (PHA) was formed in order to provide continued housing and assisted loan programs. That same year, the Pala Housing Authority began designing new home plans, ranging from three-bedroom to five-bedroom homes and measuring approximately 3,000 square feet in size. A number of new homes have been completed since then. In addition, the Pala Housing Authority has begun the planning and building of small master-planned communities in an attempt to ultimately ensure housing for every Tribe member.

The Project would result in the construction of additional housing that would be available to current residents of Pala, employees of the Pala Casino Resort and Spa and other casinos in the area, and other age groups, family sizes, and income ranges currently residing in other communities in San Diego County or elsewhere. Other Project components proposed, such as the fire station and public park, would be available to serve the population of the Pala community and/or available for use by visitors to the area.

The Project proposes a revision to the existing General Plan land use designation and zoning classifications that apply to the property to allow for preparation of a Specific Plan that would identify specific design requirements to ensure a quality development consistent with land uses intended by the County and the community, and that would respect the existing character of the Pala community. A Plan Authorization Amendment (PAA) was approved for Warner Ranch on October 5, 2005, allowing a density of 2.33/DUs per acre (a maximum of 1,196 DU's without consideration for other physical constraints. The existing and proposed General Plan land use designations for the Project site are shown on Figure 1-8. The existing underlying General Plan land use designation is (19) Rural Lands (RL-40, or one dwelling unit per 40 acres). The gross acreage of the Project site is approximately 513 acres, which would theoretically allow for 13 residential dwelling units without consideration for other physical constraints As designed, the Project concentrates development within the southern portion of the property, thereby preserving the majority of the site as undeveloped and protected open space, allowing such lands to remain in their present natural state.

The development pattern within the Pala community varies, with a higher density of uses and smaller parcel sizes generally located around the vicinity of the Pala Casino Resort and Spa, SR 76, Pala Temecula Road, and Pala Mission Road, with parcel size generally increasing and density decreasing as one moves away from the center of the community. This development pattern is typical of similar communities of comparable size within the County, where commercial, industrial, and civic use types, as well as higher-density residential uses, are generally concentrated adjacent to a central "core." Refer also to Figures 2-1 (A through K) to 2-4 of Chapter 2.0, Community Character Analysis, for exhibits that illustrate this development pattern.

Per the request of County staff, a comparative analysis between existing residential lot size and density on lands on the Pala Indian Reservation and on the proposed Project site was conducted. The study area was determined through input from County staff, review of residential development patterns within the area using aerial photography, windshield surveys of the Reservation lands, available land use data from the San Diego Association of Governments (SANDAG), and consideration for distance to existing residential uses from the Project site. A 0.75-mile radius from the Project boundary was selected to ensure that the majority of lands on the Pala Indian Reservation where existing residential development is located were considered; refer to Figures 2-5A and 2-5B of Chapter 2.0, Community Character Analysis.

Development on the Pala Indian Reservation is not subject to County of San Diego regulations, and development is otherwise overseen by the United States Federal Bureau of Indian Affairs (BIA) and the Pala Housing Authority. As such, land uses on the Pala Indian Reservation are not subject to use regulations given in the County of San Diego General Plan, and specific land use designations (e.g. residential, commercial, industrial) are not assigned to such properties by the County. Lands within the boundary of the Reservation are identified as Tribal Lands on the County's General Plan Land Use Map. Therefore, the most up-to-date land use data available from SANDAG was reviewed to determine where existing residential development occurs on the Reservation lands in the vicinity of the Project site. According to available SANDAG data, no multi-family residential land uses occur within a 0.75-mile radius of the Project site on the Reservation; all residential land uses within the study boundary are identified as Single-Family Detached or Spaced Rural Residential uses, and were therefore the only such lands considered for the residential lot size and density analysis; refer to Figures 2-5A and 2-5B of Chapter 2.0, Community Character Analysis. As stated above, to the extent feasible, such land uses identified by SANDAG were verified through available aerial photography (including street views where available) and groundchecked through a visual (windshield) survey of lands within the Reservation boundary.

Additionally, new residential development has occurred on the Reservation since the time that such land uses were originally mapped by SANDAG, and was therefore not originally identified by the SANDAG data utilized for the lot size and density analysis. As such, these areas have been identified and included in the lot size and density analysis, and are shown as Areas 1A, 2A, and 3A (New Residential) on Figure 2-5A of Chapter 2.0, Community Character Analysis.

As can be seen on Figure 2-5A and Figure 2-5B, various land uses may occur within the boundaries of a single parcel (e.g. parcel ID #29 on Figure 2-5A supports Spaced Rural Residential, Single-Family Detached, Undeveloped, and Extensive Agriculture, as mapped according to SANDAG data). Additionally, individual parcels may be comprised of a number of independent, physically separated portions of land. For example, on Figure 2-5A, parcel

ID #23 is composed of a number of individual land acreages with other intervening parcels identified (e.g. parcel ID #'s 1 through 8), according to available SANDAG data. Similarly, parcel ID #28 appears as three separate parcels with individual parcel boundaries, but is identified with one assessor parcel number in the SANDAG database.

Table 1-6, shows a breakdown of the total acreage for each individual parcel (outlined in green on Figure 2-5A) identified by SANDAG as having all or a portion identified as residential use (Spaced Rural Residential or Single-Family Detached), and the number of existing residential units on each parcel. From this, the average density of residential units was calculated to be range from approximately one dwelling unit/0.16 AC (DU/AC) to 3.0 DU/AC (total acres divided by number of dwelling units). Additionally, taking the overall total acreage of lands within the 0.75-mile study area (890.75 acres) divided by the total number of residential units within the area (281 units) yields an estimated overall average density of 0.32 DU/AC.

TABLE 1-6 RESIDENTIAL DENSITY (WITHIN 0.75 MILE)

Parcel Number	Acreage	Number of Residential Units	Average Residential Density (DU/AC)	
1	0.16	1	1 DU/0.16 AC	
2	0.16	1	1 DU/0.16 AC	
3	0.16	1	1 DU/0.16 AC	
4	0.17	1	1 DU/0.17 AC	
5	0.17	1	1 DU/0.17 AC	
6	0.18	1	1 DU/0.18 AC	
7	0.18	1	1 DU/0.18 AC	
8	0.18	1	1 DU/0.18 AC	
9	0.23	1	1 DU/0.23 AC	
10	0.37	1	1 DU/0.37 AC	
11	0.72	1	1 DU/0.72 AC	
12	0.87	1	1 DU/0.87 AC	
13	1.85	2	1.08 DU/AC	
14	2.92	1	1 DU/2.92 AC	
15	3.02	2	0.66 DU/AC	
16	4.17	1	1 DU/4.2 AC	
17	5.37	13	2.42 DU/AC	
18	5.41	1	1 DU/5.41 AC	
19	5.69	1	1 DU/5.69 AC	
20	5.8	3	0.52 DU/AC	

TABLE 1-6, CONTINUED

Parcel Number	Acreage	Number of Residential Units	Average Residential Density (DU/AC)	
21	6.42	15	2.34 DU/AC	
22	6.52	16	2.45 DU/AC	
23	8.63	26	3.0 DU/AC	
24	8.66	10	1.15 DU/AC	
25	11.96	6	0.5 DU/AC	
26	36.52	12	0.33 DU/AC	
27	103.54	31	0.30 DU/AC	
28	117.49	4	0.03 DU/AC	
29	138.06	80	0.58 DU/AC	
30	413.66	24	0.06 DU/AC	
31	1.51	4	2.64 DU/AC	
32	7.41	13	1.75 DU/AC	
Total:	890.75	281	0.32 DU/AC	

Residential uses on the Pala Indian Reservation vary from large-acre parcels (outlying lands) with lower densities to small-acre parcels (within the higher-density area to the east/southeast of the Project site). As seen from Table 1-6, a range of residential densities occurs on the Reservation lands. Consistent with parcel size shown in Figures 2-3A and 2-3B, a number of parcels less than one acre in size are present within the 0.75-mile study area, and therefore, residential densities are higher on these parcels. These higher density residential uses are largely concentrated along Pala Mission Road, Pala Temecula Road, and SR 76. Additionally, a number of higher-density uses, as shown in Figure 2-4A, occur north of SR 76 and east/west of Pala Temecula Road. It should be noted that for a number of the residential areas shown on Figure 2-4A, residential uses appear to cross parcel boundaries (e.g. see Areas (4), (5), and (6)). Therefore, although such uses appear from an aerial view to form a sort of higher-density residential "subdivision," in order to calculate density as shown in Table 1-6, the residential units were counted as they occur within each parcel boundary, thereby reducing the apparent density of units as compared to if density were instead calculated on the underlying land area affected by the "subdivision."

Overall lot size within the 0.75-mile study area are varied, and as shown in Figure 2-5A and stated above, many parcels within the study area are identified as having multiple land uses occurring on the same parcel, with no visible boundaries or individual lot lines that distinguish a boundary between the uses, or allow for an accurate calculation of lot size. For example, on parcel #29, available SANDAG data indicates Single-Family Detached, Spaced Rural Residential, Extensive Agriculture, and Undeveloped lands as occurring on portions of

the parcel. Parcels within the study area that support a single residential unit would be considered as one lot, and therefore, the lot acreage would be that shown in Table 1-6. Several of the areas where higher-density residential uses are present within the study area appear as supporting individual lots of varying sizes. An approximately 3.4-acre mobile home park is located just north of SR 76, west of Portillo Road, and supports an estimated 20 homes; refer to Figure 2-4A, Residential Housing Units, which identifies the location of the mobile home park as Area (1). As stated above, the Pala Housing Authority has constructed a number of small master-planned communities within the community. Clusters of singlefamily residential development are mainly visible along SR 76, Pala Mission Road, and Pala Temecula Road. Just north of SR 76 and south of Pala Mission Road, single-family residential development is present with approximately 50 lots of an estimated 8,000 square feet (varied); shown on Figure 2-4A as Area (2). Another cluster of units is present to the north of SR 76 along Remijio Street with approximately 26 lots of an estimated 9,000 to 12,000 square feet; shown on Figure 2-4A as Area (3). Another planned area is visible further to the north along Pala Temecula Road, off of Nejo Road, with approximately 20 units with lots of an estimated 8,000 square feet to 13,000 square feet in size (varied); shown on Figure 2-4A as Area (4). Just to the east, across Pala Temecula Road along Trujillo Road, is another development with approximately 29 homes on lots of an estimated 12,500 to 14,500 square feet in size; shown on Figure 2-4A as Area (5). Just to the north of this residential development along Moro Road is another development with approximately 30 homes on lots of an estimated 11,500 square feet to 22,000 square feet in size; shown on Figure 2-4A as Area (6). Further to the north along Pala Temecula Road along Sycamore Lane, development of 13 residential homes on lots of an estimated 12,000 square feet to 14,000 square feet is present; shown on Figure 2-4A as Area (7). Additional single-family development on individual lots of similar sizes and larger-acre parcels is interspersed throughout the areas to the north and east of Pala Village. To the north, west, and south of the Project site, lands are County lands designated as RL 40 and RL 20, with several parcels designated as SR 10 (Semi-Rural Residential – 1 DU/10 acres). Adjacent to the Project to the north, west, and south, parcels (within San Diego County) have a General Plan land use designation of RL 40 (Rural Lands – 1 DU/40 acres). These parcels vary in size, with the majority around 40 acres within the RL 40 designated lands; however, many of these parcels are much smaller in size. Further to west (approximately 0.5 mile) are smaller parcels with a land use designation of RL 20 (Rural Lands – 1 DU/20 acres). Parcels of a smaller size are generally present in the area designated as RL 20. Limited single-family residential development is present on a number of parcels within these areas.

To the south/southeast of the Project site, Reservation lands generally support agricultural and low-density residential uses. Parcels vary from large-acre to smaller-acre parcels with a majority averaging approximately 1.75 acres in size, creating a more concentrated

development pattern within the landscape as compared to surrounding parcels supporting agricultural uses. Limited single-family residential development is present on these lands and occurs at a low density, due to the size of the parcels and their potential to support combined agricultural uses. Limited single-family, low-density residential development is evident on other larger-acre parcels in the area.

Lot sizes proposed for the Project range from approximately 3,000 square feet to 8,000 square feet in size, with the larger lots proposed to support the multi-family units; refer to Figure 2-4B, Site Plan – Proposed Multi-Family Units. The range of lot sizes is intended to allow for the provision of a variety of housing types to meet housing demands of various potential buyers. Similarly, the residential units are proposed in a range of sizes. Homes proposed with the Project would range from approximately 2,012 square feet to 3,809 square feet for the single-family units; 1,933 to 1,863 square feet for the multi-family duplex units; and, 1,996 to 2,027 square feet for the multi-family six-plex units; refer to Table 1-7, Proposed Structural/Lot Design Characteristics.

Although the Project proposes a change to the existing General Plan land use and zoning, the intent of doing so is to allow for the application of appropriate design measures that would result in a development respective of the surrounding community character, focusing development within a portion of the site and allowing the majority to remain as undisturbed open space. As stated above, a Plan Amendment Authorization was authorized on October 5, 2005 for the Project site to allow for 2.33 dwelling units per acre. This density allows for the proposed residential units and supporting facilities (e.g. public park and fire station), concentrating development within the southern portion of the property, with the remainder of the site as open space, thereby allowing such lands to remain largely in their present natural state. Therefore, views of the majority of the site would not be changed with Project implementation. As described in Chapter 2.0, Community Character Analysis, the Project has been designed to acknowledge existing development patterns in the surrounding community and is designed to accommodate residential development at a higher density, allowing the majority of the site to be preserved in open space for the long-term. Additional design measures, including landscaping, onsite open space, and park lands, as well as natural site topography and layout of the residential units within the property as proposed, would further reduce the visibility of the Project components within the landscape.

The Project site is located adjacent to the Pala Village where the highest density and greatest variety of land uses occurs within the community. Table 1-7, Proposed Structural/Lot Design Characteristics, on the next page provides a summary of design characteristics for each of the housing types and supporting facilities proposed with the Project. In proposing a variety of lot sizes and residential housing sizes, the Project reflects the existing varied visual character and pattern exhibited by residential lot and housing sizes found in the surrounding Pala community; refer also to Chapter 2.0, Community Character Analysis, for additional

discussion on the Project's potential effect on the existing character of the Pala community, and with particular regard for the proposed General Plan Amendment relative to the SSA to allow for the Project design as proposed. The Project would provide additional housing opportunities for current residents, employees of the Pala Casino Resort and Spa and other casinos in the area, and other age groups, family sizes, and income ranges currently residing in other communities in San Diego and elsewhere. Other Project components that are proposed, such as the fire station and public park, would be available to serve the local community and/or available for use by visitors to the area.

TABLE 1-7 PROPOSED STRUCTURAL/LOT DESIGN CHARACTERISTICS

Use	Lot Numbers	Lot Size (Typical) in Square Feet	Structure Size in Square Feet	Height <sup>1</sup>
Single-Family Residential	1-133; 319-333	3,000	2,012	23'5"
Single-Family Residential	134-260; 478-592	4,000	2,324	23'9"
Single-Family Residential	334-418	5,000	2,583	23'-11"
Single-Family Residential	419-423; 439-477	6,000	2,731	23'-11"
Single-Family Residential	424-438	8,000	3,809	24'-2''
Multi-Family Duplex	289-318	Varies	1,933/1,863	20'-7''
Multi-Family Six- Plex	261-288; 593-600	Varies	1,996, 2,011, 2,027	30'-0''
Clubhouse	601	4.1	9,346	24'-2"
Fire Station	652	1.2	10,000 (Approx.)	28'-0" (Estimated)
Guard House	634		525 (Approx.)	28'-5"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Feet = '; Inches = "

# Architectural Design

The Pala/Pauma Subregional Plan Area does not implement any formally-adopted design guidelines. Architectural design of structures within the study area (approximately a 0.75-mile radius from the Project boundary) surrounding the Project is varied, due to a mixture of use types. Residential uses in the Pala area typically exhibit ranch-style features with wooden exteriors and roofing, and generally non-decorative elements. Other visible residential uses are constructed in the Spanish style, with stucco exteriors, tile roofing, and arched features. Surrounding commercial, institutional, and industrial uses generally exhibit more utilitarian

features with limited architectural design or ornate style. Refer also to Figures 1-14, Photo Location Map – Offsite Views; Figures 1-15A to 1-15B, Surrounding Land Uses; and, Figure 1-16, Offsite Views.

In contrast, the Pala Casino Resort and Spa exhibits a distinct architectural character within the landscape. The multi-storied buildings are of significant scale, bulk and mass, as compared to other surrounding commercial and other land uses within the community. The buildings are generally constructed of red and tan brick, with architectural details and other adornment visible on the exterior. The two multi-level parking structures are generally unadorned and utilitarian in nature, and are constructed of concrete of a grayish tone.

The Specific Plan prepared for the proposed Project outlines goals to preserve the existing character of the area through the use of open space throughout the development, including public and private parks. Smaller, multi-family housing has been designed to result in the appearance of freestanding homes with inconspicuously shared walls within the central portion of the property. On the more visible perimeter portion of the development, single-family homes on larger lots, ranging between 3,000 to 8,000 square feet, are proposed to reflect a lower-density character.

The architectural character of each housing type is intended to be simple with an emphasis on the authenticity of form and materials; refer to Figures 1-4A to 1-4C for representative illustrations of the Single-Family Units, Duplexes, and Six-Plexes. Building materials, colors, and detailing would be similar amongst the housing types to achieve a visually cohesive product.

As described in detail in the Specific Plan, the architectural design of proposed non-residential land uses, such as the Neighborhood Clubhouse and fire station, would be designed to integrate with the surrounding setting. Materials and colors for such buildings, accessory structures, walls, and fences would be selected to minimize their visual impact and to reflect the color and texture of the natural environs to the extent possible. A mixture of stone veneer, plank siding, stucco, and composite shingles would be used. As stated previously, the Project would be subject to the County's design review process for consistency with the Warner Ranch Specific Plan and implementation of the "D" Special Area designator, as proposed with the rezone for the subject property.

Particular attention would be paid to roof designs and materials where such roofs could potentially be viewed from vantage points located at higher elevations (e.g. homes in the eastern portion of the site). The visible surface area of onsite structures would be minimized through grading and landscaping techniques, and consideration of building massing, use of earthen berms, and/or use of plant materials to minimize the overall visual mass or bulk of such structures; refer to Figure 1-5A, Clubhouse – Elevation, and Figure 1-5B, Conceptual Design – Fire Station.

Additionally, the proposed public and private parks are envisioned to be memorable places that would encourage social gathering. The proposed parks are intended to reinforce a sense of community, connect a variety of public spaces, and facilitate and encourage pedestrian use and movement. The proposed parks would include active recreational uses, such as basketball and/or tennis courts, as well as open areas for passive recreation and relaxation.

Architectural styles for the proposed land uses would be designed consistent with the design guidelines identified in the Specific Plan to ensure that the intended character of the development is achieved and to minimize potential conflicts with the existing character of the Pala community. Through compliance with the Specific Plan, the architectural design of the Project would not introduce physical elements within the visual landscape that would significantly differ in architectural style or create a dominant new visual feature within the existing landscape that would adversely affect or significantly contrast with the existing character of other uses found in the surrounding area.

## Height / Square Footage

Surrounding residential, commercial, and industrial uses generally range from one to two stories in height and are therefore low-lying within the landscape; refer to Figures 1-13, 1-15A to 1-15B, and 1-16, which show various uses within the Pala community. In contrast, various structures associated with the Pala Casino Resort and Spa are multi-storied (up to 11 stories) with several parking structures (four levels) and are visually dominant within the landscape as a result; refer to Figure 1-13, Onsite Views, and Figure 1-16, Offsite Views. The Pala Casino Resort and Spa is classified as a high-rise per the California Building Code (Chapter 4, Section 403.1.1 – Definitions).

Residential uses within the surrounding community are generally one to two stories in height (average of 15-30 feet). The proposed residential units would be similar in height to such uses. Table 1-6 identifies the anticipated height of the proposed onsite structures. All residential units would be a maximum of two stories in height. Single-family units would range from approximately 23'-5" to 24'-2" in height. The multi-family units would range from approximately 20'-7" to 30'-0" in height. Therefore, the proposed heights of the residential units would be consistent with typical heights of similar residential structures within the surrounding Pala community. In addition, the height of other proposed structures, such as the clubhouse (24'-2") and guard house (28'-5"), would be consistent with similar one- to two-story recreational and commercial-type uses found within the adjacent Pala community; refer also to Figures 1-15A to 1-15B and 1-16. The majority of the existing Pala Fire Station is an estimated 30-35 feet in height (generally two stories) with a four-story

Training Tower with live fire burn rooms; refer to Figure 1-15A. The proposed fire station would reach a height of approximately 37'-0" in height. As such, the proposed uses would reflect the standard height of other similar residential, commercial, and institutional uses within the community.

Square footage of buildings in the area surrounding the Project site varies widely, due to the type of use, with residential uses generally of smaller size and commercial, institutional, and industrial uses supporting structures of greater square footage; refer also to the above discussion (and in Chapter 2.0, Section 2.4.3 of this document) on parcel sizes within the Pala community, which can influence (or limit) the overall square footage of various uses. The Indian Reservation to the north, east, and southeast of the site supports a school, a wastewater treatment plant, a shooting range, a motocross raceway, and other facilities and services that are open to the public, the Pala Learning Center, the Cupa Cultural Center, and the Pala Casino Resort and Spa, associated parking garages, and gas station/convenience store located just west of the Casino; refer to Figure 1-17, Community Context Map. Residential uses include mobile/manufactured homes and single-family homes. Housing types range in square footage and density from visibly planned "clusters" of higher density to individual structures on larger-size lots or on lots where agricultural uses are also present; refer also to Chapter 2.0, Section 2.4.3 of this document for additional discussion.

Since 2004, the PHA has been designing new home plans, ranging from three-bedroom to five-bedroom homes and measuring approximately 3,000 to 6,000 square feet in size. Other small-scale retail and commercial uses in the area typically range from approximately 2,000 to 5,000 square feet in size.

The Pala Casino Resort and Spa is located southeast of the Project site and contains onsite facilities for amenities such as shopping, a day spa, golfing, dining, entertainment, a resort hotel, and a small commercial center. The Pala Resort also includes roughly 600 guest rooms ranging from approximately 500 to 1,000 square feet in size. The main level of the casino was recently extended along the north and west sides, increasing the structure by approximately 68,300 square feet. The spa was also remodeled to increase the number of available treatment rooms, locker rooms, and lounge spaces, and the pool area was expanded. The parking area was expanded to accommodate approximately 1,930 new spaces, located in new parking structures to the north and west of existing structures. In addition, approximately 30,000 square feet of administrative office and storage space were constructed. With the recently completed expansion, the casino, hotel, and theater now encompass approximately 187,300 square feet.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Pala Mission Band of Indians – Pala Fire Department. URL online: http://www.palatribe.com/programs/pala-fire-department-1. Accessed May 2013.

As stated above, the Project is intended to provide of a variety of housing types to meet the housing demands of various potential buyers. As shown in Table 1-7, the proposed single-family units would range in size from approximately 2,012 to 3,809 square feet in size; the multi-family units would range from approximately 1,863 to 2,027 square feet in size. These structure sizes would be consistent with other similar residential uses found in the Pala community; refer also to Figure 1-15B and 1-16. Additionally, the clubhouse would be approximately 9,346 square feet in size to accommodate recreational activities, locker rooms, and social activity areas. The guard house would be of limited size (approximately 525 square feet) and would contain an office to support onsite security operations. Refer also to the Warner Ranch Specific Plan which provides an in-depth discussion of the specific design details proposed for each proposed use type.

The existing Pala Fire Station is approximately 23,000 square feet in size (includes a two-story building housing administration, sleeping quarters, six bay garages, a training classroom that can be utilized as an Emergency Operation Center during an unexpected event, and a four-story Training Tower with live fire burn rooms); refer to Figure 1-15A.<sup>2</sup> The proposed fire station is anticipated to be approximately 10,000 square feet and reach a height of 37 feet, and would therefore be much smaller in size than the existing Pala Fire Station; however, final design would be dependent upon requirements of the NCFPD; refer to Figure 1-5B.

Therefore, the structures proposed with the Project would be respective of the structural height and size of similar corresponding uses within the surrounding Pala community. In addition, as stated previously, onsite grading, berming, and/or landscaping techniques would be applied to reduce the visibility of building surfaces within the landscape. The Project has also been designed to locate the higher-density multi-family units and the Neighborhood Clubhouse in the central portion of the site in order to distance the larger proposed structures from areas where public views may occur (e.g. SR 76). Refer also to the Warner Ranch Specific Plan (available under separate cover) for an in-depth discussion of the specific design details proposed for each use type.

#### Bulk and Scale

An evaluation of bulk and scale includes an analysis of the visual appearance of structures, relative to other existing development in the surrounding area. Visual bulk and scale of surrounding structures varies depending on the type of use.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Pala Mission Band of Indians – Pala Fire Department. URL online: http://www.palatribe.com/programs/pala-fire-department-1. Accessed May 2013.

As discussed above, residential, agricultural, and commercial uses in the Pala community tend to be of smaller scale (generally one to two stories in height) and visually horizontal in nature, with exception of the facilities associated with the Pala Casino Resort and Spa which are of much larger scale than surrounding land uses. Small-scale commercial retail and restaurant uses, a charter school, shooting range, gas station/convenience store, and other single-family residential, industrial, and recreational uses within the Pala community to the east, as well as single-family residential uses to the southeast/south/southwest, tend to be of smaller scale, low-lying, of lesser square footage, and one to two stories in height with limited visual bulk within the landscape; refer also to Chapter 2.0, Section 2.4.3 of this document which evaluates residential uses and lot sizes found within the Pala community that contribute to the overall character of the area. As illustrated in Figures 1-13, 1-15A to 1-15B, and 1-16, such uses are generally functional and do not represent elements that visually dominate the landscape with regard to bulk or scale. Such land uses generally blend into the existing visual setting and established development pattern without substantially disrupting the viewshed; refer to Figures 1-13 and 1-16.

In contrast, the structures associated with the Pala Casino Resort and Spa are of significant bulk and scale, and contrast with surrounding elements supporting various uses within the visual landscape; refer to Figure 1-13, Onsite Views, and Figure 1-16, Offsite Views. Due to their height and scale, combined with the overall square footage of the various uses, the hotel, casino, spa, conference facilities, and parking structures visually dominate the landscape within the Pala community, as compared to other surrounding uses. These structural components within the landscape generally restrict views to the southeast/southwest from vantage points along SR 76 and from lands adjacent to the development on all sides.

The apparent visual bulk and scale of the proposed Project facilities would be consistent with that of surrounding uses, due to proposed Project design requirements given in the Specific Plan and as shown on the Site Plan; refer to Figures 1-4A to 1-4C, which provide elevations of the proposed housing types, and Figures 1-5A and 1-5B, which show elevations of the clubhouse and fire station. As shown in Table 1-6, all proposed residential units would be limited to two stories in height. The housing types would reflect typical single-family homes (ranging from approximately 1,900 square feet to 3,800 square feet in size) on a range of lot sizes, and would not represent elements of significant bulk or scale within the landscape. Integrated landscaping along the perimeter and within the interior of the site would further contribute to a reduction in the visual bulk and scale of the proposed structural elements; refer also to Figures 1-15A and 1-15B, Surrounding Land Uses, and Figure 1-16, Offsite Views, which illustrate existing residential uses within the Project area.

The proposed multi-family units, which would by nature be of larger bulk and scale than a single-family residence, would be distanced from SR 76 (and offsite properties) within the

interior of the property and surrounded by the single-family units of lesser scale and bulk. As identified in the Specific Plan, the multi-family units would integrate design and layout measures, such as inconspicuously shared walls and varied facades and rooflines, to facilitate the appearance of freestanding units and reduce visual bulk of the structures. Integrated landscaping throughout the proposed development area (and on individual residential lots) would also reduce visual bulk and scale of the proposed structural elements onsite by providing screening and blending the structures into the surrounding landscape; refer to Figure 1-6B, Landscape Plan.

Additionally, the proposed fire station would be approximately 37 feet in height (two stories) and 10,000 square feet in size. The station would be limited to the size necessary to accommodate emergency vehicles and personnel, and would be consistent with standard design requirements of the NCFPD. As noted above, the fire station would be of lesser square footage than the existing Pala Fire Station (approximately 23,000 square feet). Due to its limited height and size, the proposed fire station would not represent an element of significant bulk or scale within the landscape; refer to Figure 1-5B. Of similar size, the Neighborhood Clubhouse would also be limited in height to two stories and would be located in the northern part of the proposed development footprint, away from SR 76, and shielded from view from offsite public vantage points by surrounding residential development and proposed landscaping; refer to Figure 1-5A. Similarly, the guard house would be of the size appropriate to accommodate Project security operations and would be approximately two stories in height and 525 square feet in size. As the guard house would be located north of the main entry from SR 76 a distance into the site along the main Project entrance road, views of the guard house would not be experienced by passengers traveling in vehicles along SR 76, and therefore, would not contribute to a substantial change in existing views from the roadway.

The proposed Project design is not anticipated to introduce visual elements of significant bulk or scale that would be inconsistent with surrounding land uses or community character. The design measures included in the Specific Plan are intended to ensure that the Project does not result in visual elements of significant bulk or scale, and the Project has been designed to locate those structures of greater bulk/scale within the interior of the site, away from public views. Further, a large portion of the site would remain as open space, with some agricultural lands to reduce effects of the proposed development on existing views and to reduce the potential for development to adversely affect a viewer's experience when viewing the site. Further, the structural elements proposed are of significantly lesser bulk and scale as compared to other existing elements within the surrounding landscape (Pala Resort and Casino, etc.). As described above, the proposed components would not represent elements that would substantially dominate or differ in size from similar land uses within the Pala community.

## **Building Coverage**

Building coverage is generally expressed as a percentage and represents the area of land covered by the footprint of a building. Building coverage is calculated as the building area divided by total lot area. The building footprint does not include paved areas, such as driveways or parking areas or walkways around structures, as defined by Section 1110 of the County Zoning Ordinance.

Undeveloped lands are present in the area surrounding the Project site, and therefore, do not support buildings; refer to Figure 1-2, Aerial Photograph. The majority of surrounding lands are large-acre parcels that are either undeveloped or developed with structures of varied square footage, depending on the use (i.e., single-family residential, commercial, agricultural). As lot sizes generally decrease to the east and southeast of the Project site within the study area and development becomes denser, building coverage increases.

Building coverage proposed with the Project is summarized in Table 1-8, Proposed Building Coverage, below. Building coverage as proposed with the Project varies for each proposed land use type and ranges overall from approximately 5 to 67 percent. Additionally, it should be noted that the Project as designed allows approximately 359 acres to remain as dedicated biological open space that would not support any structures, thereby protecting existing views of these areas. The Project also proposes a total of approximately 26 acres of recreational/aesthetic open space onsite, including a private park and clubhouse, a public park, private landscaping lots, and other onsite open space within residential lots.

TABLE 1-8 PROPOSED BUILDING COVERAGE

Housing Type	Lot Numbers	Lot Size (Typical) in Square Feet	Structure Size in Square Feet	Building Coverage (percentage)
Single-Family	1-133; 319-333	3,000	2,012	67 percent
Single-Family	134-260; 478-592	4,000	2,324	58 percent
Single-Family	334-418	5,000	2,583	51 percent
Single-Family	419-423; 439-477	6,000	2,731	46 percent
Single-Family	424-438	8,000	3,809	48 percent
Multi-Family Duplex	289-318	Varies	1,933/1,863	
Multi-Family Six- Plex	261-288; 593-600	Varies	1,996/2,011/2,027	
Clubhouse	601	178,596 (4.1 acres)	9,346	5.2 percent
Fire Station	652	52,272 (1.2 acres)	10,000 (Approx.)	19 percent
Guard House	634		525 (Approx.)	

The Project design concentrates the proposed residential development within the southern portion of the site, rather than proposing larger-acre lots throughout the entire property, thereby allowing the majority of the property to remain undeveloped as protected open space. As shown in the table, the Project design would allow for housing that, even at the highest percentage of building coverage proposed (67 percent) would still allow more than 30 percent of the lot (proposed single-family residential homes on the 3,000 square foot lots) to remain undeveloped (with structures). Although a number of large-acre parcels surrounding the Project site to the west, north, and south support rural single-family uses wherein building coverage would be low, the building coverage proposed with the Project generally reflects the higher-density uses adjacent to the east and southeast within the Pala community.

Additionally, a Specific Plan has been prepared to guide future development of the Project site and provides the intended design measures for the Project. The Specific Plan design guidelines will be adopted with County approval of the Project, in combination with Conditions of Approval for the Site Plan, Landscape Plan, Grading Plan, and other discretionary approvals, to guide the character of future development on the Project site. As the Project would be required to conform to the Conditions of Approval, measures given in the Specific Plan are considered to be design measures and not mitigation measures.

Table 1-11 provides specific design measures that will help to reduce potential visual effects of the proposed development and to ensure that future development respects the existing character of the area. Discussion is provided in Table 1-11 to indicate how each of the proposed design measures would reduce potential effects of the Project. The design measures identified (as well as other design features given in the Specific Plan) would be implemented through Project conformance with the "D" Special Area designator requirements. The proposed Project would be subject to design review by the County of San Diego and would be required to demonstrate compliance with the design standards identified in the Warner Ranch Specific Plan with implementation of the "D" Special Area designator proposed as part of the Project zoning. On an overall Project level, the design review process would ensure that the Site Plan, access and circulation, lighting, landscape design, grading (e.g. manufactured slopes), public utilities, and architectural design, among other Project elements, are consistent with the character of the surrounding Pala community, natural features, and site topography, and as approved with County adoption of the Specific Plan.

The appearance of the above-described Project elements within the landscape is not anticipated to significantly detract from or contrast with the existing visual character and/or quality of the surrounding neighborhood, community, or localized area. The location, size, design, and operating characteristics of the proposed uses would be compatible with adjacent uses, residents, buildings, and structures with consideration given to harmony in size, location, scale, bulk, and coverage. Additionally, the proposed Project would not conflict with any existing design guidelines, as no such guidelines have been adopted for the

Pala/Pauma Subregional Plan Area; however, Project construction would be required to occur consistent with the design measures identified in the Warner Ranch Specific Plan. Impacts would be less than significant, and no mitigation is required.

It should be noted that, as discussed in Chapter 2.0, Community Character Analysis, the findings of the technical studies prepared for the Project (relative to the SSA) are provided in supporting the County in making a determination of whether the proposed Project meets all of the components of General Plan Policy LU-1.4, although Pala Reservation is not designated as a "Village" on the Regional Categories Map and may not resemble a typical Village found within the County; however, the Subregional Plan implies that further examination of potential housing opportunities on the subject site (i.e. the SSA) to accommodate existing and future employees based upon the economic needs of the employees and its proximity to nearby employment centers was required. This is consistent with the goal of the community development model to locate housing closer to retail, services, and jobs on smaller lots in order to reduce required infrastructure and the length of automobile trips while increasing community livability and preserving open space by compact development. The proposed Project would assist in satisfying demand for housing created by large employment centers (i.e. Pala Casino) located outside of its jurisdiction, yet which may create impacts within County lands. Such conditions allow the County to plan for growth in a manner that would be consistent with the community character, scale, and demands of contiguous areas (i.e. Pala Casino and the Project site). Refer to Chapter 2.0 for additional discussion pertaining to the Project's consistency with the existing community character and the design of the Project elements as proposed.

2) Removal or substantial adverse change of one or more features that contribute to the valued visual character or image of the neighborhood, community, or localized area, including but not limited to landmarks (designated), historic resources, trees, and rock outcroppings.

No designated landmarks occur onsite. The Project has been designed to locate the development along the lower elevations of the site. The site currently supports several areas with citrus and avocado groves, a portion of which will remain on the upper hillsides following Project implementation. Rock outcroppings are visible in certain areas onsite, particularly in the northeastern portion along the hillsides. The Project would preserve the majority of the steep slopes occurring onsite, and would permanently dedicate approximately 359 acres, or 70 percent, of the overall property as natural biological open space, allowing these areas to remain undisturbed.

**Impact** (VR-1) The Project site supports geographical features typical of the Pala area, which includes the ridgelines, steep slopes, and rock outcroppings of the surrounding mountains. Such resources generally add visual variety within the surrounding region, contributing to the unique character of this part of the County. While the majority of these

features would be preserved in onsite open space, the Project design would require the integration of manufactured cut and/or fill slopes within the development area that of varying heights. The majority of these manufactured slopes would be of height that would be obscured from view from SR 76 and other public locations within the surrounding community, due to the proposed residential units, existing site topography, and/or existing and proposed vegetation, and further influenced by elevational differences between the slopes and the location of the vantage point (e.g. from SR 76 or areas to the south within the valley); refer to Figures 1-19 to 1-21. However, a number of manufactured cut/fill slopes of substantial height (greater than 30 feet) are required to allow for development of the property as proposed; refer to Figure 1-6A, Manufactured Slopes/Retaining Walls, which identifies the specific location of where such slopes are proposed on the property. If left untreated and/or exposed, these manufactured slopes would have the potential to adversely change the existing visual character of the hillsides and image of the Project site. This would be considered a significant impact, and mitigation measures would be required. As shown on the preliminary grading plans prepared for the Project, manufactured cut and fill slopes reaching heights of 30 feet or more would generally be constructed along portions of the northern and eastern, and southeastern perimeters of the development area, as well as several areas within the interior of the development. Manufactured slopes of height greater than 30 feet would be required on the following lots: 254-255; 258-260; 401-406; 409-416; 425-430; 435-444; 548-550; 601; 603; and, 618. Refer to Figure 1-6A. Such slopes could potentially result in a change in the natural landscape that would adversely affect existing views to the site from offsite public vantage points. Due to topography of the site, and distance from both SR 76 and offsite public vantage points, particularly from across the valley, views of many of these larger slopes would be reduced or obscured by onsite development, existing intervening topography, and proposed landscaping; refer to Figures 1-19 to 1-21, which show the Project as constructed, including the proposed grading. .

A number of cut slopes (1:1.5 ratio) located in the eastern and northeastern portions of the site are proposed along existing hillsides that face inward to the site on the downslopes (Lots 425-430) and/or would be hidden by onsite topography [e.g. by the large hill in the southeastern portion of the site (Lots 401-406 and 409-416)]. These slopes would reach estimated maximum heights as follows: Lots 425-430 (115 feet); Lots 401-406 (130 feet); and, Lots 409-416 (55 feet). However, these cut slopes would occur below the ridgeline would therefore be obscured from view from offsite lands to the northeast/east/southeast, as well as from SR 76; refer to Figure 1-6A, and Figures 1-20 and 1-21. A large fill slope (2:1 ratio) is also proposed in the northeastern portion of the site (Lots 435-444); refer to Figure 1-6A. The estimated maximum height of the fill slope would be 50 feet. This fill slope would occur adjacent to proposed onsite open space areas to the northwest/west and maybe partially visible from the Indian Reservation lands to the west that are located at a higher elevation;

however, these lands are undeveloped. Views from the north of these fill slopes would be obscured due to site topography and elevational differences between the slope and the viewing angle; however, lands to the north would remain as undeveloped open space.

Additionally, several manufactured cut slopes (1.5:1 ratio) would also be required in the northwestern portion of the site (Lots 254-255; 257-260; 601; and, 603). The majority of these slopes would range from 50 to 65 feet; however, one large cut slope reaching an approximate height of 150 feet would be required on Lot 603. These slopes would be obscured from view to westbound travelers and generally to eastbound travelers along SR 76 due to topography of the site and the proposed development layout; refer also to Figures 1-19 and 1-20 which demonstrate that these slopes would not be visible. However, limited views of these slopes may be intermittently visible from public vantage points within the river valley to the south and southeast of the site. Views of these slopes from these locations would occur at a distance of greater than 0.5 mile from the site and would be restricted due to existing development and existing and proposed vegetation within the visual landscape.

The proposed manufactured cut and fill slopes would have the potential to result in a significant impact on visual resources as they may result in the removal or substantial adverse change of the site's features that contribute to the valued visual character or image of the neighborhood, community, or localized area. If such slopes are left unvegetated or sparsely vegetated, the slopes could potentially disrupt the composition of the existing visual pattern or visual continuity of the surrounding landscape which presently consists of the hillsides, native vegetation, and rock outcroppings.

Further, the manufactured slopes in the southeastern portion of the site would be constructed where underlying rocky soils or rock outcroppings may occur. Due to such conditions, the replanting of these manufactured slopes consisting of cut native rock is not proposed, and a rock catchment fence would be installed. As shown on Figure 1-6A, these slopes would face inward to the Project site and would be obscured from view from offsite public viewing locations (e.g. from the Pala Indian Reservation and SR 76); however, mitigation is proposed to ensure that such exposed slopes do not adversely affect the existing visual character of the site.

To reduce the potential for Project grading and the required manufactured cut and fill slopes to cause a substantial adverse change in the visual features or character of the site, mitigation is proposed. Measures such as limiting the slope ratio, treatment of exposed rock faces, and/or slope landscaping are proposed to reduce the visibility of Project grading and manufactured slopes and to blend these features into the surrounding natural landscape; refer to Table 1-10, Mitigation Measures.

To further reduce the visibility of the manufactured slopes from offsite public vantage points, the applicant would be required by the County to prepare a Landscape Plan indicating

specific plant types, height, density, and planting locations to ensure that all manufactured slopes onsite are replanted as appropriate to reduce visibility of such slopes from offsite public vantage points and to ensure long-term soil stability. As a Condition of Approval, and prior to the issuance of a grading permit or improvement plans in lieu of a grading permit, the applicant shall submit to the satisfaction of the County Director of Planning and Development Services a Landscape Plan consistent with Figure 1-6B, Landscape Plan, showing vegetative cover on manufactured slopes. The Landscape Plan shall identify the individual lots on which manufactured slopes would be constructed (consistent with the Grading Plan) and where landscaping would be required. Planting of landscaping materials shall occur consistent with the County's Landscape Water Conservation Design Manual. Additionally, prior to the issuance of a grading permit, the applicant shall be required to submit grading plans to the satisfaction of the Director of Planning and Development Services that are in substantial conformance with the contoured grading shown on the conceptual Landscape Plan. Additionally, minor grading for purposes of construction and maintenance is proposed to an existing dirt access road leading northward from the residential development area to the proposed water tank location; refer to Figure 1-3A, Specific Plan Map. The existing road is largely obscured from view by established vegetation (tree canopy); however, limited portions of the road may be visible from vehicles traveling along SR 76. Further, potential views to the road from SR 76 would be across the proposed developed portion of the site and would be reduced by distance, site topography, and existing and proposed landscaping. As only minor grading improvements are proposed for the roadway, no significant changes to the existing visual setting of the road would result. Therefore, such improvements would not result in a substantial adverse change in the visual features or character of the site, and impacts would be less than significant.

(Impact VR-2) One water tank is proposed to be located in the northwestern portion of the Project site along the hillside. An existing water line located within Jeremy Way that terminates just north the Project's northwestern boundary would be extended to connect to the onsite water tank. The tank would have an estimated capacity of four million gallons. The tank would be approximately 135 feet in diameter and would be approximately 42 feet in height above finished grade, once installed. The location of the proposed tank would be approximately one mile north of SR 76 at its closest point. Therefore, due to the height of the tank on the proposed building pad and distance that views from the nearest roadway would occur, the tank would generally not be visible from SR 76, and any views from SR 76 would be substantially limited and intermittent due to intervening vegetation and site topography. Similar water tanks are presently found along the hillsides within the Pala community, and therefore, the proposed water tank would not result in a new visual element within the landscape; refer to Figure 1-13 which shows the location of several of these water tanks.

Although the proposed tank may be visible from certain offsite vantage points to the south/southeast across the valley, the limited height of the tank (as measured from the proposed building pad) and the distance from which views to the site would occur would reduce visibility of the tank (or obscure it from view) within the visual landscape; no landscape screening is proposed. However, to ensure that construction of the water tank does not contribute to a substantial adverse change to the visual character of the localized area, thereby resulting in a significant impact, mitigation in the form of surface treatment (painting of the tank in an earth-toned color) is proposed to reduce potential impacts to less than significant.

One historic building is located onsite. Project mitigation measures require a qualified historical archaeologist to monitor demolition of the historical building P-37-027238. Retention and protection of the 1870's era adobe interior wall of the historical building, as well as all building components including the concrete slab foundation, shall be retained and utilized as a part of the proposed public park area. The interior wall and other building components are not be visible from offsite properties or SR 76, and therefore, removal of such elements would not cause an adverse effect on or change of one or more features that contribute to the valued visual character or image of the community or localized area. Any recovered materials shall be cataloged and analyzed and appropriate special studies conducted. A data recovery report addressing research questions shall be prepared and submitted to the County Department of Planning and Development Services for approval. With such measures, impacts would be reduced to less than significant.

As such, the proposed Project would potentially result in the introduction of features that could significantly detract from or contrast with the existing visual character and/or quality of a neighborhood, community, or localized area by conflicting with important visual elements or the quality of the area. Mitigation measures are proposed to reduce such impacts to a less than significant level.

3) Substantially obstruct, interrupt, or detract from a valued focal and/or panoramic vista from a public road, a trail within an adopted County or State trail system, a scenic vista or highway, or a recreational area.

The Project site is not located near and is not visible from any designated scenic vistas or State Scenic Highways. Therefore, the Project would not change the visual composition of an existing scenic resource within a State Scenic Highway.

The Pala-Pauma Community Planning Group has proposed the designation of SR 76 from I-15 to SR-79 as a State Scenic Highway, and the California Department of Transportation (Caltrans) has determined that the roadway is eligible for such as designation; however, it is unknown as to when any official designation would be made by Caltrans, should the application for designation be approved, and therefore, designation as such is considered to

be speculative at this time.3 Future construction of the proposed Project would not cause the roadway to become ineligible for designation as a State Scenic Highway. Development is planned or is present adjacent to I-15 (e.g. Meadowood, Campus Park, Campus Park West) and/or along SR 76 (Gregory Canyon Landfill, Orange Grove Power Plant) and may affect its future eligibility; refer to Figure 1-17, Community Context Map, which shows the location of these projects relative to SR 76. The proposed Gregory Canyon Landfill is to be located on Highway 76, approximately three miles east of I-15 and two miles southwest of the Pala community. The Landfill site is located adjacent to the San Luis Rey River, along the western slope of Gregory Mountain. The Gregory Canyon Landfill encompasses approximately 1,770 acres, of which approximately 308 acres are to be used to support overall landfill activities, which would include stockpile areas, ancillary facilities, access roads, and refuse disposal. The project would be permitted as a Class III landfill. The Orange Grove Power Plant is located along SR 76 to the west of the Project site. The project consists of a 96 megawatt (MW) simple-cycle electric generating plant and ancillary facilities. The plant is designed as a peaking facility to serve loads during peak demand and to increase reliability for San Diego Gas & Electric (SDG&E). The project is located on SDG&E-owned land and is located approximately five miles east of the City of Fallbrook and approximately two miles west of the community of Pala. As such, such development would contribute to the visual setting along the roadway; refer also to Section 1.5.5, Cumulative Impacts.

Views of the Project site along the Project frontage would represent only a small percentage of the overall views experienced by travelers along the SR 76 corridor from I-15 to SR 79, as the Project would only be visible for a short duration of the total travel time along this segment and would not represent a dominant feature within the viewshed. As described above, due to the site topography, in addition to proposed Project design which distances the development from SR 76 and provides a landscaped buffer, as well as the public park and detention basins, near the roadway, limited views into the site would occur from SR 76 and would largely be limited to those occurring along the Project frontage. Further, Tribal Lands, which would include the Pala and Pauma Indian Reservations along the segment proposed for designation, are not subject to scenic highway designations and/or regulations. Therefore, views from the east of the site where the roadway crosses through the Pala Reservation, would not be considered impacted under this CEQA threshold. For the reasons above, the proposed Project is not anticipated to affect the eligibility of SR 76 for designation as a State Scenic Highway.

The proposed Project would be constructed on developed and undeveloped lands adjacent to SR 76. SR 76 is designated as a County Scenic Highway from Interstate 15 east to its

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> California Department of Transportation. California Scenic Highway Mapping System. URL online: <a href="http://www.dot.ca.gov/hg/LandArch/scenic highways/">http://www.dot.ca.gov/hg/LandArch/scenic highways/</a>. Accessed May 2013.

intersection with SR 79 to the east of the Project site. The proposed Project would construct an all-way traffic signal at the intersection of the main entry along SR 76. The Project also proposes frontage improvements to the existing 120-foot wide Pala Road/SR 76 right-of-way easement that would include widening the existing 24-foot wide pavement to 52 feet, two 12-foot wide drive lanes, a 12-foot wide painted center median, and 8-foot wide shoulders that also include a painted bike lane in each direction. Additionally, a 350-foot long and 12-foot wide acceleration/deceleration lane is proposed adjacent to the Project's main entry.

Mitigation has been identified to reduce direct Project impacts on SR 76 to less than significant, as identified in the Traffic Impact Analysis prepared by KOA Corporation in May 2013; available under separate cover. Cumulative impacts on SR 76 from west of E. Vista Way to S. Mission Road, and at the intersections of SR 76 / E. Vista Way, SR 76 / N. River Road, and SR 76 / Camino del Rey will be reduced to less than significant through participation in the County's Transportation Impact Fee (TIF) program. Cumulative impacts from S. Mission Road to the northbound I-5 ramp, and at the intersections of SR 76 / S. Mission Road, SR 76 / Gird Road, SR 76 / Old Highway 395, SR 76 / southbound ramps, and SR 76 / northbound ramps would be mitigated to less than significant with the SR 76 East Project, which would widen SR 76 and reconfigure the interchange. The Project applicant would make its fair-share contribution to the interchange reconfiguration.

Additionally, east of I-15, SR 76 would be impacted between Horse Ranch Creek Road and Couser Canyon Road, and at the intersections of SR 76 / Rice Canyon Road and SR 76 / Couser Canyon Road. The Project applicant will participate in an update to the TIF program and pay any new fees to ultimately improve this portion of SR 76 to a four-lane major roadway, which will also reconfigure the intersections. Accomplishment of this would result in less than significant impacts to SR 76 and the intersections; however, given the physical and environmental constraints of the area, expansion of the roadway to four lanes may not be feasible mitigation. As such, this would remain a significant unmitigated traffic impact.

The easternmost portion of SR 76 impacted by the Project is located between Couser Canyon Road and Cole Grade Road. This portion includes the impacted intersections of SR 76 / E. Pala Mission Road, SR 76 / Lilac Road, and SR 76 / Cole Grade Road. The Project design would provide abutting improvements at the SR 76 frontage; however, this would not fully mitigate the contribution to cumulative impacts. To fully alleviate the impacts, SR 76 would need to be widened with two additional lanes for a length of about 23 miles. Neither Caltrans, nor Pala Reservation has a funded program in place for adding additional lanes to SR 76 in this segment. Even if there were a program, this mitigation is a regional facility improvement that is beyond the ability of an individual applicant to complete. The deficiencies on the road are largely existing and a mitigation measure must be roughly proportional to the impact caused by the Project pursuant to CEQA Guidelines, Section 15126.4(a)(4)(B). Given the percentage of traffic that the Project would contribute, a

mitigation measure requiring the Project to construct required roadway improvements would not be roughly proportional to the impact.

The Project Applicant would initiate and contribute to a Project Study Report/Project Design Study with Caltrans. This is the required initial step in developing an approach to mitigation for cumulative traffic impacts on SR 76. Offsite improvements would be made or contributed to at two intersections to mitigate Project traffic impacts, as described below. Precise improvements are currently being developed with Caltrans and may include additional turn lanes, traffic signals, and/or roundabouts.

- Intersection of SR76/East Pala Mission Road: This 4-way signalized intersection would be constructed once the Project has been issued 600 building permits. Proposed improvements may include a traffic signal, power pole relocation, road widening for additional turn lanes, striping, signage, and traffic control.
- Intersection of SR76/Lilac Road: This 3-stop intersection would be improved when the Project reaches 400 building permits. Proposed improvements may include road widening for additional turn lanes, striping and new signage, drainage improvements, and traffic control.

These improvements and the improvements proposed along the Project frontage would improve traffic flow and safety on this portion of SR 76; however, even with these mitigation measures, on this portion of SR 76 and its intersections, with or without the Project, cumulative traffic impacts would remain significant and unmitigated.

As such, the proposed Project would result in an increase in the number of vehicle trips along SR 76 which could result in a change in the existing community character. The General Plan contains a number of goals and policies that pertain to reducing potential effects of a development on the County's roadway system. For example, Policy LU-2.9 Maintaining Rural Character, of the General Plan Land Use Element states the requirement to "Consider level of service criteria, in accordance with Policy M-2.1, to determine whether adding lanes to a Mobility Element road would adversely impact the rural character of a community or cause significant environmental impacts. In those instances, consider other options to mitigate LOS where appropriate." Additionally, Goal M-2, Responding to Physical Constraints and Preservation Goals, of the Mobility Element identifies the goal of achieving "A road network that provides adequate capacity to reasonably accommodate both planned land uses and regional traffic patterns, while supporting other General Plan goals such as providing environmental protections and enhancing community character." Policy M-2.1, Level of Service Criteria, identifies the need to "Require development projects to provide associated road improvements necessary to achieve a level of service of "D" or higher on all Mobility Element roads except for those where a failing level of service has been accepted by the County pursuant to the criteria specifically identified in the accompanying text box (Criteria for Accepting a Road Classification with Level of Service E/F). When development is proposed on roads where a failing level of service has been accepted, require feasible mitigation in the form of road improvements or a fair share contribution to a road improvement program, consistent with the Mobility Element road network."

With approval of the County General Plan in August 2011, SR 76 was downgraded from a planned four-lane road to a two-lane 2.1D Community Collector. Based on buildout of the County's General Plan land use map, traffic modeling indicated that the segment of SR 76 from Pala del Norte to 6th Street would operate at a Level of Service (LOS) "F" as a two-lane road. Although the General Plan's road network is intended to eliminate deficiencies by upgrading roadways to achieve LOS D or better, the Mobility Element identifies certain situations where the addition of travel lanes to accommodate traffic levels is not justified, as such construction would result in potentially adverse impacts. With regard to improving SR 76, the County Board of Supervisors (BOS) instead classified SR 76 as a two-lane road, as it was determined that widening the road to four lanes would result in adverse environmental impacts and degradation of the physical environment.

SR 76 is classified as a two-lane Mobility Element road and has been accepted as a LOS E/F in the County's Mobility Element from Pala del Norte Road to 6th Street (includes the segment affected by Warner Ranch) to protect the existing character along the roadway. Implementation of the Warner Ranch Project would result in cumulative and Year 2030/Buildout (Plan-to-Plan) impacts on the segment of SR 76 extending west to Horse Ranch Creek Road and east to Cole Grade Road. The proposed Project would increase the stretch of SR 76 at LOS E/F from the currently approved 2.3 miles to 8.2 miles, and would therefore have to amend the Mobility Element. As such, the Project would not be in conformance with the Mobility Element (Policy M.2.1, Level of Service Criteria), due to the increased distance of LOS E/F on SR 76. The Project would therefore require an amendment to the Mobility Element to allow the Project to be in conformance with the General Plan with regard to this issue. The amendment would amend the Mobility Element road classification of SR 76 to LOS E/F for a 5.9-mile stretch between Pala del Norte and a point just east of Pankey Road, bring the total length of the roadway where LOS would be affected to 8.2 miles. The amendment would also include amending Table M-4 of the Mobility Element to add the additional stretch of roadway affected by the proposed Project. The Project Applicant also continues to work with both the County Department of Public Works and Caltrans to develop appropriate measures that would contribute to the mitigation of cumulative traffic impacts on SR 76; refer also to Chapter 2.0, Community Character Analysis, which provides discussion of the proposed General Plan Amendment and Project consistency with the SSA designation with regard to scale, community character, and growth of the surrounding area, including the Pala Reservation.

In addition, the proposed Project would result in construction of additional housing in the area near several large employers (e.g. the Pala Casino Resort and Spa and Casino Pauma), thereby improving the job/housing balance within the community and potentially reducing vehicles miles traveled for those electing to live and work in the Pala/Pauma area. The Project also proposes construction of necessary frontage improvements along SR 76 to increase safety and allow for efficient ingress/egress off/onto SR 76 (e.g. signalized intersection, turn lanes, etc.). Other elements of the proposed Project are aimed at contributing to reducing potential effects on the existing character as experienced by those utilizing SR 76, such as placing the majority of the site in undeveloped open space, thereby allowing such lands to remain in their natural state as viewed from the roadway. Other measures, such as distancing the majority of the proposed development away from SR 76 and installation of landscape screening along the SR 76 frontage, would further diminish the potential visibility of, and therefore reduce viewer exposure to, the proposed Project for those vehicle passengers traveling in either direction along this roadway. As shown on Figure 1-6B, Landscape Plan, a variety of landscaping is proposed along the Project frontage on SR 76 to buffer views into the site. Additionally, the public park and the onsite detention basins would integrate perimeter landscaping to further enhance the visual appearance of these areas, and distance the proposed development from the roadway. Additionally, landscaping is proposed along the southern side of the proposed manufactured slopes in the southeastern portion of the property to blend the slopes into the natural landscaping and provide a natural transition between the Project site and adjacent offsite properties; however, although views of the proposed Project elements would be limited and/or reduced through Project design and siting of structures, the Project would have the potential to introduce structural elements and changes to the visual landscape that could detract from a valued focal and/or panoramic vista from a public road or scenic highway (i.e. SR 76). As such, impacts would be considered significant (Impact VR-3), and mitigation and design measures are required to ensure that impacts are reduced to a level of less than significant. The following is a discussion of views that would occur from the identified key vantage points in the surrounding area, including views from SR 76. Viewpoint locations are identified on Figure 1-18, Key Views/Landscape Units.

## View #1: SR 76 Traveling East

SR 76 is a two-lane, paved public roadway, running east-west adjacent to the south of the Project site. Viewers traveling easterly along SR 76 would have brief and intermittent views into the Project site, due to established natural vegetation along the roadway, site topography, and travel speeds; refer to Figure 1-19, Key View #1. As requested by the County, the visual simulation prepared from this location is shown without the proposed landscaping that would be planted along the Project perimeter and within the interior of the property to provide

screening of structures and/or walls and further blend the development into the visual setting. Therefore, the view shown in Figure 1-19 indicates a worst-case scenario of views of the Project experienced by drivers traveling east along SR 76.

The improvements proposed to SR 76 would be visible to those traveling east along the roadway past the Project frontage. As described above, the Project would widen the existing pavement to 52 feet and add an acceleration/deceleration lane, among other improvements. Such changes would be most noticeable to those familiar with the existing roadway; however, the construction of these improvements is not anticipated to adversely affect views experienced by passengers in vehicles traveling along the roadway, or to significantly alter views of the roadway when viewed from offsite public vantage points within the valley, as such views would occur from a distance or would be minimized or obscured due to the level viewing plane of the valley floor wherein intervening development or vegetation would restrict views of development at similar elevations. Those views experienced of the improvements would be reduced as one approaches the site from the west due to curvature of the existing road alignment, and further reduced by intervening landforms (varied area topography), existing natural vegetation and landscaping, and/or existing development along the corridor. Further, as the road currently carries large traffic volumes, combined with high travel speeds that reduce the potential length of time that views of the improved portions of the street would be experienced as one travels through the valley, viewer response to the improvements proposed with the Project is anticipated to be low once constructed; refer to Figure 1-19 for potential views experienced.

Views from this location would be of the proposed residential units in the southwestern portion of the site. As shown in Figure 1-19, a number of homes would be visible from this vantage point along the perimeter of the proposed development footprint; however, these residences would be distanced from the roadway. Further, views into the site would be buffered by existing and proposed landscaping, as shown on Figure 1-6B, Landscape Plan, thereby reducing the visibility of the onsite structures. Additionally, the proposed fire station would not be visible to travelers along the road until within close proximity, as the proposed residences would block such views; refer also to Figure 1-3A, Specific Plan Map.

A 6-foot high perimeter wall is proposed along the outer perimeter (rear boundary) of the residential lots in the southern portion of the site. Limited portions of the wall would reach 7-9 feet in height where required in order to reduce potential noise levels resulting from traffic along SR 76; refer to Figure 1-6C, Fence and Wall Plan. At the nearest point, the wall would be located approximately 75 feet from SR 76 (edge of pavement), thereby reducing the appearance of the height of the walls from vantage points along the roadway due to distance. Further, the varied height of these walls would create visual interest and reduce visual dominance; however, the proposed walls would have the potential to substantially interrupt or detract from views from SR 76, thus resulting in a significant impact. To reduce the

visibility of the proposed walls, mitigation is proposed in the form of surface treatments (earthtoned in color) to further blend these elements into the surrounding landscape. Furthermore, landscape screening would be installed along SR 76 and adjacent to the proposed perimeter and sound walls, consistent with the Landscape Plan prepared for the Project, to screen views of the development from the roadway.

One water tank is proposed to be located in the northwestern portion of the Project site along the hillside. The tank would be approximately 135 feet in diameter and would be approximately 42 feet in height above finished grade, slightly taller than a typical two-story single-family home. Therefore, tank would not represent an element of significant height within the visual landscape. No landscape screening of the tank is proposed. The location of the proposed tank would be located approximately one mile north of SR 76 at its closest point. Due to the height of the tank as measured from the proposed pad elevation and distance at which views would occur from the nearest roadway, combined with intervening topography and landscaping, the tank and the associated service road would generally not be visible from SR 76; however, any views of the tank that do occur from the road would be intermittent and limited. Refer also to Figure 1-19, which shows the view looking into the site from this vantage point along SR 76. Additionally, although the tank may be visible from certain offsite vantage points to the south/southeast across the valley, the limited height of the tank and viewing distance would reduce visibility of the tank within the visual landscape. Furthermore, a number of similar water tanks are presently visible along the hillsides to the south/southeast of the Project site, as identified in Figure 1-13, Onsite Views, and therefore, the water tank would not represent a new visual element within the surrounding viewshed. However, to ensure that the water tank does not substantially detract from views from SR 76 or other surrounding public roadways, thereby resulting in a significant visual impact, mitigation in the form of surface treatment (painting of the tank with earthtoned color) is proposed (see Impact VR-2) to reduce potential impacts to less than significant.

Minor grading for purposes of construction and maintenance is proposed to an existing dirt access road leading northward from the residential development area to the proposed water tank location; refer to Figure 1-3A, Specific Plan Map. The existing road is largely obscured from view by established vegetation (tree canopy); however, limited portions of the road are visible from vehicles traveling along SR 76. As only minor grading improvements are proposed for the roadway, no significant changes to the existing visual setting of the roadway would result with the Project. Further, any potential views to the road from SR 76 would be across the proposed developed portion of the site, and would be reduced by distance, site topography, and intervening vegetation. Therefore, proposed improvements to this existing roadway would not be considered to substantially interrupt or detract from views from a public road or highway. Impacts would be less than significant, and no mitigation is required.

Furthermore, as described previously, the Project does not propose elements of significant height or scale and has been designed to distance the higher-density, multi-family residential uses from SR 76 and to locate the single-family residential uses along the outer perimeter of the development. In addition, other residential and commercial uses are presently visible on developed lands to those traveling east along SR 76, and the Project would therefore not introduce a new type of land use into the existing visual setting. Project design, travel speed, viewing angle, and other viewing conditions as described above would reduce the visibility of the proposed Project within the landscape; however, mitigation measures and design measures are proposed to reduce the potential for the proposed development to introduce new elements that would substantially obstruct, interrupt, or detract from views experienced while traveling eastward along SR 76 within the Project vicinity; refer to Table 1-10, Mitigation Measures, and Table 1-11, Design Measures. With implementation of the proposed mitigation and design measures, impacts would be reduced to less than significant.

## Key View #2 – SR 76 Traveling West

Views looking northwest into the Project site would also occur intermittently along westbound SR 76; refer to Figure 1-20, Key View #2, which shows existing views from this vantage point. Viewers from this location would mainly be passengers in vehicles traveling along SR 76. Similar to those views of the site for eastbound travelers, views of the site from this vantage point would be brief and intermittent, due to established natural vegetation along the roadway, site topography, and travel speeds. At vantage points along the southeasterly Project frontage on SR 76, brief views into the southerly portion of the site would be afforded from the roadway; refer to Figure 1-20, Key View #2.

As requested by the County, the visual simulation prepared for the proposed Project is shown without the proposed landscaping that would be planted along the Project perimeter and within the interior of the property to provide screening of walls and other structures. Therefore, the view shown in Figure 1-20 indicates a worst-case scenario of views experienced by drivers traveling west along SR 76.

Similar to views experienced when traveling east along SR 76 within the Project vicinity, improvements proposed to SR 76 would be visible to those traveling west along the roadway past the Project frontage. As described above, the Project would widen the existing pavement to 52 feet and add an acceleration/deceleration lane, among other improvements. Such changes would be most noticeable to those familiar with the existing roadway; however, the construction of these improvements is not anticipated to adversely affect views experienced by passengers in vehicles traveling along the roadway, or to significantly alter views of the roadway when viewed from offsite public vantage points within the valley, as such views would occur from a distance or would be minimized or obscured due to the level viewing

plane of the valley floor, curvature of the road alignment, and/or intervening landforms, vegetation, and/or existing development. As the road currently carries large traffic volumes, combined with high travel speeds that reduce the potential length of time that views of the improved portions of the street would be experienced as one travels through the valley, viewer response to the improvements proposed with the Project is anticipated to be low once constructed. Additionally, Project improvements would be limited to the vicinity of the Project site, allowing the remainder of the travel corridor to remain in its existing visual state.

Intermittent views into the Project from this location would be of the residential uses in the southeastern portion of the site, although the slope in the southeastern portion of the site adjacent to the road would partially block views of the units as one approached the site. As one travels along westward SR 76, views of the public park and fire station would occur intermittently; however, existing residential and commercial uses are also visible within the landscape to westbound travelers along SR 76.

As stated previously, the Project design includes a variety of landscaping along the SR 76 frontage to blend the Project into the surrounding natural setting and reduce views into the interior of the property from the roadway; refer to Figure 1-6B, Landscape Plan. Additionally, the public park and the onsite detention basins would integrate perimeter landscaping to further enhance the visual appearance of the site from this viewing angle, while distancing development areas from the roadway. As stated above, landscaping is also proposed along the southern side of the proposed manufactured slopes in the southeastern portion of the property to blend the slopes into the natural landscaping and provide a natural transition between the Project site and adjacent offsite properties to the southeast/east.

As discussed above, the proposed water tank would be distanced approximately one mile from SR 76 at the closest point along the Project frontage. Views of the tank and the associated service road from this vantage point would largely be blocked along this roadway by the existing hill in the southeastern portion of the site and the ridge occurring along the southeastern/eastern boundary; refer to Figure 1-20. Further, due to these topographic features, in combination with viewing distance, the water tank (or grading for the tank or associated service road) would not be visible from lands within the Pala Indian Reservation or from Pala Temecula Road. Intermittent views of the tank may occur as one travels further to the west along SR 76; however, such views would be brief and substantially limited due to travel speeds, intervening topography and vegetation, and distance. As described above under Key View #1, the water tank would not exhibit development characteristics that would significantly change or conflict with the existing visual setting from this vantage point. However, to ensure that the water tank does not substantially detract from views from SR 76 or other surrounding public roadways, thereby resulting in a significant visual impact, mitigation in the form of surface treatment (painting of the tank with earthtoned color) is proposed (see Impact VR-2) to reduce potential impacts to less than significant.

Furthermore, as described previously, the Project does not propose elements of significant height or scale and has been designed to distance the higher-density, multi-family residential uses from SR 76, and locates the single-family residential uses along the perimeter of the development. In addition, other residential and commercial uses are presently visible on developed lands to those traveling west along SR 76, and the Project would therefore not introduce a new type of land use into the existing visual setting. Project design, travel speed, viewing angle, and other viewing conditions as described above would reduce the visibility of the proposed Project within the landscape; however, mitigation measures and design measures are proposed to reduce the potential for the proposed development to introduce new elements that would substantially obstruct, interrupt, or detract from views experienced while traveling eastward along SR 76 within the Project vicinity; refer to Table 1-10, Mitigation Measures, and Table 1-11, Design Measures. With implementation of the proposed mitigation and design measures, impacts would be reduced to less than significant.

## Key View #3 – Pala Casino Resort and Spa

Views of the Project site looking northwest from the existing Pala Casino Resort and Spa would be limited; refer to Figure 1-21, Key View #3, which shows existing views from the second floor of the easterly parking garage. As stated earlier, viewers from this location would be patrons and employees arriving at or departing from the Pala Resort complex. Although views from this vantage point would occur on private property and not public viewing locations, views from this location were evaluated herein.

From this vantage point, views of the Project site are limited due to intervening topography, distance from the site, and natural onsite vegetation. Views generally consist of the large ridge in the southeastern portion of the site, along with the lower-lying lands and gently sloping mounds within the southern portion of the property.

Views of the Project from this vantage point would include the limited views of the residential uses located in the southern portion of the site; however, onsite topography and proposed landscaping along the frontage along SR 76 would substantially reduce such views into the interior; refer to Figures 1-19 through 1-21. Additionally, the Project does not propose elements of significant height or scale, and has been designed to distance the higher-density residential uses from the roadway. As the majority of views from this location would generally be from employees or patrons of the Pala Resort complex who would not be highly invested in any visible change in the existing landscape, viewer response to the visual change is anticipated to be intermediate. Due to sensitive Project design and the viewing conditions described above, it is not anticipated that the development would introduce elements that would significantly detract from or contrast with the existing visual character and/or quality of the community. Additionally, the mitigation measures and design measures proposed to

reduce impacts with regard to other key views to the site, combined with Project landscaping and Project conformance with the Specific Plan design guidelines, would further reduce the visual change in views of the site from this location. Impacts are considered to be less than significant, and no mitigation measures are required.

### Other Views

Other views may occur from surrounding public vantage points, such as hiking trails within the Wilderness Gardens County Park, located approximately three miles to the southeast. Views to the site may occur from higher elevations within the Park; however, views of the site from this distance the large hill in the southeastern portion of the Project site, combined with topography of the Project, Project landscaping both within the site, and along the Project frontage, and Project design that would locate the residential development within the central portion of the property, allowing the public park and other improvements to be more visible. Similarly, although glimpses of the Project site may occur along Lilac Road, located approximately two miles to the southeast of the site, views to the Project would be limited by intervening development and vegetation, as well as distance from the site and site topography. Views from other surrounding residential, agricultural, and commercial uses on private lands along the valley floor would largely be obscured due to a relatively flat viewing plane, intervening vegetation and/or development, distance to the site, and/or physical topography. As the Project would not significantly change existing views from these locations, an in-depth analysis of the potential visual effects of the Project on these view locations was not performed herein.

The Project site may be visible from other public and private vantage points across the valley to the south and southeast/southwest from higher elevations along the hillsides; however, such views would be visually reduced due to distance from the site, vegetation, topography, and elevational differences; refer to Figure 1-18, Key Views/Landscape Units Map. Views to the site from public roadways to the east would largely be blocked by the existing ridgeline and further by Project design that would locate the proposed residential units below the top of slope, thereby placing them out of the line of sight.

Additionally, as described above, one water tank is proposed to be located approximately one mile north of SR 76 at its closest point. Although limited views may occur from varied vantage points looking to the site from surrounding public vantage points to the southwest/south/southeast, distance to the tank, intervening topography, and vegetation, combined with the proposed height of the tank (approximately 42 feet above finished grade), views of the tank would be obscured and/or greatly minimized within the landscape and would not substantially obstruct or detract from any surrounding public views.

Views from established public recreational areas in the Project area would not be obstructed or interrupted with development of the site as proposed; however, components of the Project

design would have the substantially obstruct, interrupt, or detract from a valued focal and/or panoramic vista from a public road or a scenic vista or highway (**Impact VR-3**). Mitigation measures and design measures are proposed to reduce such impacts to less than significant.

4) The project would not comply with applicable goals, policies or requirements of an applicable County Community Plan, Subregional Plan, or Historic District's zoning.

Portions of the County Zoning Ordinance that may affect the assessment of visual impacts include zoning overlay designators. As stated earlier, the "D" - Design Review Special Area designator applies to all seven of the parcels affected by the Project. The Project would require compliance with the design standards identified in the Specific Plan with implementation of the "D" Special Area designator proposed as part of the zoning. The Project is not within a Historic District, and is therefore, not affected by such a plan.

The Project proposes a change to the existing General Plan land use and zoning designations to allow for preparation of a Specific Plan that would guide development of the site in a manner consistent with intended growth patterns. By changing the land use and zoning designations, the overall proposed Project density would be 2.33 dwelling units per acre, thereby allowing development to be concentrated in the central, lower portions of the site and maintaining the majority of the site as dedicated biological open space for the long-term.

To allow for the Project as proposed, several components of the County's General Plan and/or Subregional Plan would require revision. As identified by the County's Project Planning and Advance Planning staff, the following changes (or amendments) would be required if the Project is to remain consistent with the Warner Ranch Project, if approved as proposed.

- 1. Amend the Regional Land Use Element Map to change the regional land use category from Rural Lands (RL 40) to Village Residential (VR 2.9);
- 2. Amend the General Plan Land Use Map of the Pala/Pauma Subregional Plan to change the existing land use designation from Rural Lands (RL 40) to Village Residential (VR 2.9) and revise the text of the Pala/Pauma Subregional Plan describing the Project; and,
- 3. Amend the General Plan Mobility Element road classification of SR 76 to LOS E/F for a 5.9 mile stretch between Pala Del Norte and a point just east of Pankey Road for an overall total of 8.2 miles. This would also include amending Table M-4 of the Mobility Element to add this stretch of SR76.

An amendment to the General Plan Mobility Element would be required with regard to Project impacts along SR 76. As part of the General Plan Update, decision makers downgraded SR 76 from a four-lane road to a 2.1D Community Collector and accepted the

segment from Pala del Norte Road to 6th Street as Level of Service (LOS) "F." The proposed Project would add traffic along SR 76, which would result in a failing level of service from Horse Ranch Creek Road to Cole Grade Road. Therefore, to accommodate the Warner Ranch Project, SR 76 would either need to be upgraded to a four-lane road, or a larger segment along SR 76 would have to be accepted at a failing LOS "F." As the County's General Plan previously accepted SR 76 as having a LOS "F" from Pala Temecula Road to 6th Street (in Pala), the Mobility Element would require an amendment to accept a LOS F for a larger portion of the road in order to allow the Project to be in conformance with the General Plan for this issue. The amendment would include adding this stretch of SR 76 to Table M-4 of the Mobility Element; refer to Section 2.4.4, Traffic Levels, below, for additional discussion.

The Project was also found to be inconsistent with one additional goal of the General Plan Conservation and Open Space Element:

#### **COS-10** Protection of Mineral Resources

The Conservation Element of the General Plan includes several policies related to the conservation of mineral resources in MRZ-2 classified lands. The Project site includes 60 acres of MRZ-2 classified lands. The proposed Project would result in these resources no longer being available for mineral resource extraction. The California Surface Mining and Reclamation Act (SMARA) Sections 2762 and 2763 of SMARA require that jurisdictions issue a Statement of Reasons (SOR) when projects would result in the elimination of the potential to extract minerals in areas containing regionally significant mineral resources. Approximately 40 acres of Mineral Resource Zone 2 (MRZ-2) are within the Project's footprint. The remaining onsite resources (approximately 18 acres) would be within the Project's biological open space. Approximately 49 acres of MRZ-2 resources are located south of SR 76, within the required 1,300-foot wide buffer between mining activities and residences.

Compliance with SMARA requires that the County of San Diego decision makers consider the loss of access to mineral resources on the project site and weigh the importance of the site's mineral resources to the region and balance these mineral values against the proposed land uses when making their land use decision. The SOR lists seven potential reasons to permit the Project and to eliminate access to important mineral resources that the decision maker may adopt or modify during their deliberations in accordance with SMARA Section 2763(a). The SOR will be submitted to the State Geologist and SMGB in conjunction with the environmental review of the Project for a period of 60 days.

Project conformance with the General Plan, Pala/Pauma Subregional Plan, and Zoning Ordinance is discussed in Section 1.2.4, above. Further discussion of the Project's consistency with the General Plan is provided in the GPAR prepared for the Project; available under separate cover. Refer also to Chapter 2, Community Character Analysis, for

additional discussion on Project conformance to applicable plans. Following County approval of the General Plan Amendment, Subregional Plan Amendment, and Rezone, the Project would not conflict with applicable goals, policies, or requirements of an applicable plan or zoning. As such, Project impacts would be less than significant, and no mitigation is required.

## 1.5.5 CUMULATIVE IMPACT ANALYSIS

Figure 1-22, Discretionary Projects, identifies the projects considered for the cumulative analysis and the surrounding limits of the viewshed. The study area selected for the Project generally includes those lands within proximity to the parcels affected by the Project and located within the surrounding viewshed that would have views to the site from public locations (e.g. public roadways). Topography within the Project area is highly varied and ranges from the flatter portions of the valley floor to the hillsides to the north and west of the Project site, as well as those located at a greater distance to the east and south/southeast. As such, views of the site on the downslopes of these hillsides (not facing the Project site) would be obscured, and therefore, such locations would be outside of the Project viewshed and would not contribute to a cumulative effect on visual resources when considered with the Project. Therefore, the study area boundary generally follows the ridgelines which form the limits of where views of the Project site would be experienced. A list of projects considered for the cumulative analysis is included in Table 1-9, Cumulative Projects, below.

Number Shown Type of **Discretionary Permit Project Name** on Figure 1-22 **Discretionary Permit** Number Administrative Permit 3000-09-59 (AD) Gregory Canyon Landfill Administrative Permit 3000-06-71 (AD) 2 Prominence at Pala 3100-5321 (TM) Tentative Map Vista Towers 3 Major Use Permit 3300-07-017 (MUP) (telecommunications facility) Pala Temecula Wireless 4 Major Use Permit 3300-08-040 (MUP) (telecommunications facility)

TABLE 1-9 CUMULATIVE PROJECTS

With regard to projects within the viewshed of the proposed Project, the Gregory Canyon Landfill project is located approximately 3.5 miles east of I-15 off of SR 76. The northern reaches of the site are approximately 0.65 miles to the southwest of the Project site. The landfill is designed as a Class III municipal solid waste (MSW) landfill which could accept municipal solid waste, inert waste, and dewatered sewage sludge. The project site covers approximately 1,770 acres adjacent to the San Luis Rey River. The landfill footprint is approximately 183 acres with a design capacity of approximately 46 million cubic yards (or

31 million tons) of waste and an expected service life of approximately 30 years.<sup>4</sup> The site is located along the south side of SR 76. To the west of the Warner Ranch site, SR 76 curves to the south, obscuring views from the landfill to the Project site due to intervening vegetation and development. Additionally, the main refuse disposal areas are generally located at a lower elevation than the Project site, and views looking down to the Project site from the landfill would therefore not occur. Several areas within the landfill site would reach approximately 600 feet amsl; however, due to the distance from the Project site and intervening development and vegetation along the valley floor, views to the Project site would be obscured. Additionally, due to the operating nature of a landfill, the site is not considered to have high scenic value that would contribute to the overall visual enhancement of the SR 76 corridor or the Pala community.

The Prominence at Pala site is located at Pala del Norte Road, approximately 0.33 mile north of SR 76 and approximately two miles west of the Pala Indian Reservation. The project would subdivide approximately 346 acres into 30 single-family residential lots and two open space lots, ranging from approximately four to 96 acres in size. Based on available environmental data,<sup>5</sup> the project was determined to have potentially significant impacts on aesthetic resources. The Prominence at Pala site is located to the southwest of the western Project boundary. Higher elevations within the Prominence at Pala site may afford views of the Project; however, such lands support County RPO steep slopes and therefore, any development proposed in this area would be greatly restricted.

Two other projects are located approximately 2.5 miles to the north of the Project site; however, these projects are telecommunications facilities. Due to intervening topography, these projects are located outside of the Project viewshed and would not be visible from the Project site. Therefore, they would not be considered to contribute to potential cumulative impacts on aesthetic resources in the area; refer to Figure 1-22, Discretionary Projects. Construction of currently approved and pending projects in the Project vicinity would permanently alter the nature and appearance of the area as future development occurs over upcoming years; refer to Figure 1-22, Discretionary Projects. Gradual buildout of the projects considered in the cumulative analysis would result in a change in the existing conditions over time; however, the change would not result in a significant impact as it would not substantially alter the overall visual landscape of the community.

It is anticipated that future construction activities within the cumulative study area would occur on various sites and at varied times, when an application for development is made.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> California Water Resources Control Board. http://www.swrcb.ca.gov/rwqcb9/water\_issues/programs/land\_discharge/gregory\_canyon\_landfill.shtml. Accessed February 2012.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Prominence at Pala Initial Study/Environmental Checklist. April 10, 2006. Data retrieved January 2012 from County of San Diego Department of Planning and Development Services. Accessed February 2012.

Such construction-related impacts would be short-term and would cease upon completion. In addition, all new development projects within the cumulative study area would be subject to additional environmental and design review on a site-specific, project-by-project basis to ensure visual aesthetic impacts are limited to the extent possible during the construction process. All future construction activities would be required to be consistent with the County's regulatory requirements and applicable conditions of approval to reduce potential cumulative effects of construction to less than significant.

In addition, future development of projects in the Project vicinity could permanently convert existing offsite open space or undeveloped lands to developed lands, potentially resulting in the incremental loss of visible open space within the Pala community. Such future development could also contribute to the alteration of views to designated visual resources. All future development within the Pala community would be subject to an evaluation of the significance of potential cumulative visual and aesthetic changes on a site-specific, project-by-project basis, with consideration for its scope and contribution to a change in the overall visual pattern or character within the Pala community.

The addition of the cumulative projects considered would not remove or create a substantial adverse change to the features that represent a valued visual resource in the area. The valley floor would still be visible from higher elevations and would still appear to have a scattered development pattern once the cumulative projects are constructed. Neither of the projects is anticipated to significantly alter the mountain views from the valley floor from places where they are currently observed within the Project viewshed. The cumulative projects would not remove or replace any local or State designated landmarks.

As previously described, the proposed Project would not substantially obstruct or detract from valued lookouts or panoramic views from public roads, scenic highways, or recreational areas. Ultimate buildout of the cumulative projects considered within the viewshed would not have an adverse effect on these public viewsheds because the projects would be anticipated to reflect the existing development pattern in the Pala community. Furthermore, all future development within the Pala community would be subject to an evaluation of the significance of potential cumulative visual and aesthetic changes on a site-specific, project-by-project basis, with consideration for its scope and contribution to a change in the overall visual pattern or character within the community. Adherence to applicable General Plan policies and goals and any appropriate County Design Standards would further reduce potential cumulative impacts relative to the long-term alteration of views to designated scenic resources.

In addition, all lighting proposed with future development within the cumulative study area, such as street lighting, security lighting, or exterior illumination, would potentially result in increased light and glare impacts within the Pala community. As stated previously, all

exterior lighting proposed with the Project would adhere to Division 9 of the County's Light Pollution Code, or "Dark Skies" Ordinance. The Dark Skies Ordinance is intended to reduce potential adverse lighting effects on astronomical research at the Mt. Palomar and Mt. Laguna observatories in San Diego County. The Dark Skies Ordinance identifies lands within 15 miles of either observatory as being within Zone A, and lands outside of the 15-mile radius, but within the unincorporated portion of the County of San Diego, as within Zone B. The closest observatory to the proposed Project site is the Mt. Palomar Observatory, located approximately 13 miles to the east; therefore, the Project site is located within Zone A. All future projects within the study area would be required to demonstrate consistency with the County's Dark Skies Ordinance for their applicable Zones.

Low-level lighting would be installed with the Project to allow for ongoing maintenance and purposes of public safety. All Project lighting types (e.g. landscaping, interior streets, private and public parks) and locations are shown on the Illustrative Street and Park Lighting Plan (as part of the Site Plan) prepared for the Project. Installation of Project lighting would be required to demonstrate consistency with the Site Plan as approved by the County to ensure that Project lighting would not result in adverse effects on adjacent lands or on the existing character of the Pala community.

Further, projects within the cumulative study area would be evaluated by the County and the Pala-Pauma Valley Community Sponsor Group on a project-by-project basis to determine the extent of such lighting necessary and any appropriate site-specific measures to reduce potential impacts on surrounding areas (i.e., shielding, use of low-level lighting, directing lighting away from adjacent properties and open space areas). As such, it is anticipated that the cumulative effects of increased lighting and/or glare associated with future development in the cumulative study area would be reduced to less than significant levels. As the Project would adhere to applicable County lighting requirements, and includes design measures to reduce the potential impact of lighting associated with the development (shielding, directed downward, etc.) and requires minimal lighting for the purposes of security and maintenance, the Project would not contribute to significant cumulative impacts relative to light and/or glare. Impacts in this regard would be less than significant.

As stated above, several development projects are proposed or have been approved by the County in the area just east of I-15; refer to Figure 1-17, Community Context Map. These projects include Campus Park, Meadowood, Campus Park West, and Lake Rancho Viejo. These projects represent varied land uses, but are largely composed of single-family and multi-family housing, mixed-use commercial, and recreational uses. These projects are located along the SR 76 corridor, similar to the proposed Project; however, due to their distance from the Project site (approximately 5.5 miles), these projects are well outside of the local viewshed of the Project. Therefore, direct views of these projects in combination with the proposed Project would not occur simultaneously.

(**Impact V-4**) Development projects located outside of the viewshed boundaries for the proposed Project are not considered herein for their potential to directly contribute to a potential cumulative effect on visual resources when considered with the Project site (as they would not be visible within the same viewshed, and therefore, would not be viewed in combination with the proposed Project; however, existing and future development along the SR 76 corridor, particularly with regard to several large planned or future projects adjacent to the I-15, may have the potential to influence the view experienced along SR 76.

However, the Campus Park, Meadowood, Campus Park West, and Lake Rancho Viejo projects are located adjacent to I-15 and when developed, would represent a large concentration of residential uses, in combination with other supporting uses, in one location. Campus Park, approved in 2011, would result in development of 751 single- and multifamily homes, a Town Center with village commercial and support facilities, neighborhood parks, an active sports park, office professional uses, an equestrian/trail staging area, infrastructure, and biological preservation. The Meadowood development would result in residential use including 355 single-family residences and 489 multi-family residences with densities from 3.5 to 19.9 DU/acre with designation of a site for a future elementary school (or up to 886 DUs without a school), six private parks, four miles of trails, community facilities and infrastructure, 125.3 acres of open space, and 57 acres of active agriculture (citrus groves, using groundwater). The Campus Park West project would divide five legal lots on 116 acres into 23 commercial and industrial lots for development of 283 multi-family dwelling units, 153,000 s.f. of commercial use, 120,000 s.f. of limited industrial use, and 31 acres of biological open space. The Lake Rancho Viejo offers a variety of higher-density residential units within the Fallbrook community and has been built out as approved by the County. As shown in Figure 1-17, Community Context Map, these projects are all located within proximity of one another and concentrated within proximity of the SR 76/I-15 intersection, as well as northward along the eastern side of the I-15.

As a result of these projects, as one travels in the vicinity of I-15 and SR 76, the existing landscape would be altered and would appear largely developed with the planned projects. The proximity of these four projects to one another would further increase the apparent visual density of the developed areas, versus if the projects were distanced from one another by undeveloped open space lands; refer to Figure 1-17.

The proposed Project would allow for future construction of 780 residential units. Therefore the Project would contribute to future development activity east of I-15 along SR 76. The Campus Park, Meadowood, Campus Park West, and Lake Rancho Viejo projects, in combination with the proposed Project, would have the potential to contribute to an overall visual change in views experienced by passengers traveling along the SR 76 corridor east of I-15; however, as stated above, these four projects (some with a mixed-use component) are not located within the same viewshed as the proposed Project, as identified in Figure 1-22,

Discretionary Projects, and would therefore not be visible in combination with the proposed development. Therefore, they would not be experienced as part of the potential visual change within the overall viewshed directly affected by the proposed Project.

Although Warner Ranch would reflect a similar type of residential development, the proposed Project would be separated from I-15 and the above-referenced projects by a distance of approximately 5.5 miles. As a viewer leaves the area near I-15/SR 76 where this concentration of residential and mixed-use development projects is planned and/or constructed and travels the 5.5 miles east to the Project site (estimated travel time of 12 minutes, or approximately one quarter of an hour, at an average of 60 miles per hour, without consideration of the road configuration which at times does not enable a travel speed of 60 mph to due curvature of the roadway), the viewer would experience views that would consist largely of single-family residential development, industrial-type uses (e.g. Gregory Canyon Landfill, Orange Grove Power Plant, SDG&E Substation, Rosemary's Quarry Mining Operations Facility, etc.), small-scale and large-scale agricultural uses, and undeveloped lands (in combination with established natural vegetation) along the corridor, thereby creating a substantial separation (both physical and as visually perceived) between those planned uses adjacent to I-15 and the Project site; however, the Project would still have the potential to contribute to a permanent change to the overall visual character of the views experienced along the SR 76 corridor, as lands are altered from undeveloped to developed over future years.

As described previously, the proposed Project is intended to consider the existing character of the Pala community and focuses development adjacent to the "core" of the Pala community, where higher-density uses are already present and where the majority of residential, commercial, recreational, and institutional uses are concentrated. Furthermore, the Project design locates development within the southern portion of the site, allowing the majority of the northern, mountainous portion of the site to remain as undeveloped open space, thereby providing a buffer to surrounding offsite lands and largely maintaining the existing natural setting of the hillsides and ridgelines which are in particular visible from SR 76, whereas lower portions of the site may be obstructed or screened from view due to existing vegetation and proposed landscaping, site topography (i.e. existing knolls), and/or viewing angle.

Additionally, the Project's proposed frontage improvements to SR 76, although distanced from the I-15 by approximately 5.5. miles, in combination with other future development projects along the SR 76 corridor, would have the potential to contribute to a cumulatively considerable impact with regard to a change in the overall character of the roadway from a rural nature to a more urban-type road design; however, the proposed road improvements would be limited to that along the Project frontage and are necessary to increase safety and allow for efficient ingress/egress off/onto SR 76 (e.g. signalized intersection, turn lanes, etc.).

As stated above, due to travel speeds at which any changes in the roadway would be experienced and length of roadway affected by the improvements as compared to the overall length of the segment between I-15 and SR 79, viewer response to such a change in the overall appearance of the road would be considered to be intermediate and would not substantially or adversely change the potential scenic value of the roadway.

As explained previously, SR 76 is classified as a two-lane Mobility Element road and has been accepted as a LOS E/F in the County's Mobility Element from Pala Del Norte Road to 6<sup>th</sup> Street. Implementation of the Warner Ranch Project would result in cumulative and Year 2030/Buildout (Plan-to-Plan) impacts on the segment of SR 76 extending west to Horse Ranch Creek Road and east to Cole Grade Road. The proposed Project would increase the stretch of SR 76 at LOS E/F from the currently approved 2.3 miles to 8.2 miles, and would therefore have to amend the Mobility Element. This is discussed in the GPAR prepared for the Warner Ranch Project; available under separate cover. Further, the Traffic Impact Analysis prepared by KOA Corporation in May 2013 for the proposed Project (available under separate cover)fully analyzes the Project's impact on SR 76 and includes a detailed discussion of the required mitigation to reduce the overall Project impacts on this roadway, as well as other County and State road segments and intersections. Furthermore, Chapter 2.0, Community Character Analysis, of this document also provides discussion of the change in LOS along SR 76 as the result of the Project with regard to community character.

As the Project would contribute to a change in the overall visual character of the area through development of the site as proposed, in combination with the proposed improvements to SR 76, the Project would have the potential to contribute to cumulative impacts with regard to visual resources, and mitigation measures are therefore required to reduce impacts to less than significant; however, the Project has been designed to reduce potential effects on the existing character of the area.

To reduce the visibility of the development experienced by those on surrounding public lands or those travelers along SR 76, the Project has been designed to maintain the majority of the site (approximately 385 acres) in undeveloped open space, thereby allowing such lands to remain in their natural state, contributing to the scenic value found along the SR 76 corridor. Additionally, the Project design as proposed would locate the majority of the proposed development area at a distance from SR 76 and buffer such improvements from view of the roadway with the proposed detention basins and public park along the frontage. Such an approach would allow the residential uses, and in particular, the higher-density residential uses, to be located away from SR 76 within the Project interior to minimize visibility of such development.

In addition to Project conformance to the Tentative Map, Site Plan, Grading Plan, and Landscape Plan (with adoption by the County), mitigation measures would be implemented

to reduce the visibility of the Project from SR 76, thereby reducing the Project's potential to contribute to the overall visual change in the roadway due to proposed and future development project occurring along the segment of roadway being considered for official designation as scenic (however, one should note that the roadway is not currently officially designated as a scenic roadway). The Project proposes installation of landscape screening, consistent with that shown on the Landscape Plan, along the SR 76 frontage and within the developed area, as well as along proposed perimeter walls, to further diminish the potential visibility of, and therefore reduce viewer exposure to, the Project for both vehicle passengers traveling in either direction along the SR 76 corridor and from other public vantage points within the community. Further, manufactured slopes would be treated to reduce their visibility and blend them into the surrounding visual landscape to respect the existing natural setting and minimize the potential for disruption of existing views of the property that would be experienced by viewers. Additionally, design guidelines given in the Specific Plan would ensure that the Project elements would remain of an appropriate height, bulk, and scale, as well as use of building materials, to avoid the introduction of inappropriate visual elements within the viewshed that would conflict with the existing community setting; refer also to Chapter 2.0, Community Character Analysis, which discusses potential impacts of the Project with regard to community character.

As such, although the Project would be designed to minimize the visibility of the proposed improvements to the extent feasible, the Project would have the potential to contribute to a change in the overall visual setting experienced along the roadway segment from I-15 to SR 79 when considered with other approved and future development projects within the corridor (although such development may occur outside of the boundaries of the viewshed within which views of the proposed Project would be experienced). Therefore, as such impacts would be considered cumulatively significant, mitigation measures, in combination with design measures, would be required to reduce the project's contribution to cumulative impacts along the roadway to a less than significant level' refer to Table 1-10, Mitigation Measures, and Table 1-11, Design Measures.

## 1.5.6 SUMMARY OF PROJECT IMPACTS AND SIGNIFICANCE AND CONCLUSIONS

The Visual Resources Analysis was prepared to provide an evaluation of potential Project impacts on existing visual resources in the surrounding community of Pala, California. Additionally, the Project site is located adjacent to SR 76, and therefore, views to the proposed development would be experienced intermittently along portions of the Project frontage on the roadway. The Visual Resources Analysis provides an evaluation of the Project's potential impacts to views from this public roadway; refer to Sections 1.5.4 and 1.5.5, above.

With regard to visual resources, the Project would not result in the introduction of features that would significantly detract from or contrast with the visual character of the surrounding community by conflicting with visual elements or quality of an existing area (i.e., through conflicting style, size, coverage, scale, building materials, etc.). The Project would however, have the potential to result in the removal of or substantial adverse change to one or more features that contribute to the valued visual character or image of the Project area, including but not limited to designated landmarks, historic resources, trees, or rock outcroppings, as the project would require construction of manufactured cut/fill slopes of substantial height (greater than 30 feet) that, if left unmitigated, could result in a significant impact. Furthermore, certain Project features could potentially obstruct, interrupt, or detract from a valued focal and/or panoramic vista from a public road, trails within an adopted County or State trail system, scenic vista or highway, or recreational area. Mitigation measures are proposed to reduce potential Project impacts to a less than significant level; refer to Section 1.6, below.

Although the Project proposes a change in the General Plan land use designations and zoning classifications, the Project as designed would not result in an inconsistency with any goals, standards, or policies specifically related to visual resources as given in the County General Plan, Pala/Pauma Subregional Plan, or other applicable regulations and ordinances; refer also to Chapter 2.0, Community Character Analysis, for discussion of the proposed Project with regard to the proposed General Plan Amendment and Subregional Plan Amendment to allow for development to occur at the proposed density. Discussion of the Project's conformance with the General Plan is also provided in the GPAR prepared for the Project; available under separate cover. County approval of the proposed General Plan Amendment, Subregional Plan Amendment, and Rezone, would result in Project consistency with such plans and regulations.

# 1.6 VISUAL MITIGATION MEASURES / DESIGN CONSIDERATIONS

Design measures (see Table 1-11, Design Measures) would be implemented to reduce the overall visibility of the Project facilities within the existing landscape. Such measures are described in detail in Section 1.2.2, Project Description; refer also to the Warner Ranch Specific Plan, available under separate cover, for additional discussion. The Specific Plan is intended to reinforce land use compatibility of the proposed Project with existing and planned residential communities and other uses through implementation of cohesive land use/open space planning, comprehensive site planning, and design guidelines.

The Project design would preserve approximately 359 acres of protected open space onsite, allowing the majority of steep slopes and natural features to remain in their current state. In

addition, development would be concentrated in the lower portions of the site, thereby reducing views into the site as compared to if the hillsides were developed. Measures for protecting existing trees, native vegetation, natural drainages, rock outcroppings, and other natural features are included on the Grading Plan and would be implemented during construction with County adoption of the Grading Plan. The Project has also been designed to distance the development areas away from the SR 76, placing the higher-density development within the interior portions of the property, away from direct public views. Additionally, the public park and detention basins would provide a visual buffer along SR 76, further distancing travelers along the roadway from the proposed residential development onsite.

The Warner Ranch Specific Plan identifies specific design guidelines that will be adhered to in Project construction to ensure that the development is respective of the existing community character; refer also to Chapter 2.0, Community Character, for additional discussion. Design measures are given in the Specific Plan to address such visual elements as grading, streetscape, entryways, roadway design, architecture, walls and fences, signage, lighting, and landscaping; refer also to Section 1.2.2 for additional discussion. Mitigation measures and design measures are also proposed with the Project to reduce potential visual effects on the existing visual setting and community character; refer to Table 1-0, Mitigation Measures, and Table 1-11, Design Measures. Implementation of such measures, along with overall Project layout within the property, would reduce the potential for the Project to significantly alter the existing landscape or degrade the existing visual character of the property or the surrounding community.

Implementation of the design measures given in the Warner Ranch Specific Plan would ensure that a development that could help to meet the housing needs of the Pala community is achieved, while respect for the existing setting is maintained. As stated, the Project has been designated as a Special Study Area which allows for focused evaluation of the proposed development and includes preparation of a Specific Plan for the development of the site. Specifically, Chapter 7, Community Design Guidelines, of the Specific Plan provides the intended design measures for the Project. The Specific Plan design guidelines will be adopted with County approval of the Project, in combination with Conditions of Approval for the Site Plan, Landscape Plan, Grading Plan, and other discretionary approvals, to guide the character of future development on the Project site and ensure that future development respects the existing character of the area. Although the Project would change the visual character of the affected parcels from largely undeveloped agricultural lands to developed land, the proposed uses would be consistent with development intended for the property, and would be visually compatible with other existing uses in the surrounding area which support structural elements or design characteristics (i.e. materials, colors, landscaping, signage, etc.) similar to that associated with the Project.

Through this Visual Resources Analysis, potential effects of the proposed Project were evaluated against the established thresholds of significance. The Project as designed is considered to be compatible with the existing character of the surrounding Pala community and would be consistent with applicable County and community land use regulations with regard to visual and aesthetic resources, although County approval of amendments to the General Plan, Subregional Plan, and a Rezone would be required to allow for development to occur as proposed; refer also to Chapter 2.0, Community Analysis.

Potentially significant impacts on visual/aesthetic resources were identified with regard to the proposed Project. As such, the following mitigation measures and design measures are proposed to be implemented in order to reduce potential direct and cumulative impacts relative to visual resources to less than significant.

**TABLE 1-10 MITIGATION MEASURES** 

Impact	Mitigation Measure	Level of Significance after Mitigation
Impact VR-1: The Project would result in visual impacts resulting from the construction of manufactured cut/fill slopes onsite that may potentially change the composition of the visual pattern in the visual environment, and the change would be incompatible with the existing visual character in terms of dominance, scale, diversity, or continuity.	<ul> <li>All Project grading shall be conducted consistent with the Grading Plan as approved by the County. All Project grading shall be designed to retain the natural landform and reflect the existing topographic features of the site to the extent feasible. The avoidance of continuous straight manufactured cut or fill slopes with hard edges and/or no transition areas at the top or toe of slope shall be avoided. Grading techniques, such as the blending of graded slope contours into the natural topography or use of varying slope gradients with smooth cuts, shall be utilized, as appropriate.</li> <li>Consistent with that shown on the Grading Plan, the maximum slope ratio allowed for manufactured fill slopes shall be 2:1; the maximum slope ratio allowed for</li> </ul>	Less than Significant
	manufactured cut slopes shall be 1.5:1. Slope ratios for all manufactured slopes shall be consistent with recommendations of the landscape architect and as identified by the geotechnical engineer in the Geotechnical Report prepared for the Project. All slope ratios shall also be subject to concurrence from the County of San Diego Department of Public Works.  • Where the construction of manufactured slopes requires cutting into native rock, the slope and texture of the cut face shall be varied. If rock catchment netting or fencing	

Impact	Mitigation Measure	Level of Significance after Mitigation
	is installed on manufactured slopes of greater than 30 feet in height, it shall be painted to reflect the color of the surrounding rock to reduce its visibility.	
	To maintain the natural setting of the site, grading shall be prohibited within designated open space lots, with the exception of minor grading required for trail improvements and/or for purposes of access to/maintenance of Project utilities.	
Impact VR-2: The Project would have the potential to result in removal or substantial adverse change of one or more features that contribute to the visual character of the area, including, but not limited to, designated landmarks, historic resources, trees, and rock outcroppings.	MM VR-2: Upon completion of construction of the onsite water tank, the exterior surface shall be painted in order to reduce visibility of the structure. The color shall be earthtoned in color (e.g. muted tan or green) in order to blend the structure into the surrounding natural setting.	Less than Significant
<b>Impact VR-3:</b> The Project would have the potential to result in impacts by substantially obstructing, interrupting, or detracting from a valued focal and/or panoramic vista from a public road or a scenic vista or highway.	MM VR-3a: Implement Mitigation Measures VR-1 to VR-2.	
	MM VR-3b: As part of the construction phase, all walls (including sound walls) shall be constructed consistent with the wall type and height shown in the Wall and Fence Plan (part of the Landscape Plan) as adopted by the County. All walls constructed along the development perimeter facing State Route 76 shall be earthtoned in color and textured to reduce their visual appearance.	Less than Significant

Impact	Mitigation Measure	Level of Significance after Mitigation
	Upon completion of their construction, landscape screening shall be provided along the exterior of the perimeter walls along the facade facing SR 76, consistent with that shown on the final Landscape Plan adopted by the County, to reduce their visibility and to create visual interest. A combination of shrubs, trees, and/or vines shall be utilized consistent with that shown on the Landscape Plan to ensure adequate screening is achieved, to enhance the visual setting, and to blend the walls into the existing visual environment.	
	All landscaping shall be installed consistent with County landscaping design and irrigation requirements. Maintenance of all Project landscaping shall be the responsibility of the Homeowners Association and maintained in perpetuity for the life of the Project.	
	As part of the construction phase, all sound walls shall be constructed of materials similar to that used for the perimeter wall proposed along the southern boundary of the development footprint, adjacent to State Route 76, to visually blend them into the adjoining perimeter wall. All sound walls shall be constructed consistent with that shown on the Wall and Fence Plan (part of the Landscape Plan) as adopted by the County.	
<b>Impact VR-4:</b> The Project would have the potential to contribute to cumulatively considerable visual impacts resulting from a change in the existing visual character.	MM VR-4: Implement Mitigation Measures VR-1 to VR-3.	Less than Significant

## **TABLE 1-11 DESIGN MEASURES**

Project Component	Design Measure
Community Entry and Signage	The main entrance would be secured and gated and would incorporate monument signage (described below) and landscaping materials consistent with the surrounding natural landscape character.
Community Entry – Elevation	One monument sign is proposed to identify the entrance to the project development. The sign is anticipated to be constructed of stone block, approximately six to eight feet in height, with the words "Warner Ranch" displayed along the monument wall; refer to Figure 1-7, Community Entry – Elevation. The sign would be integrated into the community entryway, which would be constructed of stone pilasters and would incorporate two wooden gates to allow for the passage of vehicles to and from the development area. Landscaping would also be provided to define the entry and to enhance its prominence. The gated entryway would be set back from the main entry off of SR 76 and would not be visible to those traveling along the roadway.
Streetscape	All onsite roads are proposed to be private roadways, designed consistent with the County's Private Road Standards and requirements of the Pala/Pauma Subregional Plan, NCFPD requirements, and design measures given in the Community Design Element of the Warner Ranch Specific Plan. Primary roads would integrate streetscape elements for vehicular circulation lanes, bike lanes, pedestrian walkways, parkway plantings, traffic control devices, and street safety lighting and signage design. Pedestrian amenities would also be provided in the form of shade tree canopies and appropriate street furnishings. Where walls are unavoidable, particular attention shall be given to a comfortable pedestrian scale and to the provision of pilasters, plan offsets, and landscaping to relieve visual monotony.
Signage	One monument sign is proposed to identify the entrance to the proposed Project. The monument sign would be constructed of stone block, approximately six to eight feet in height, with the words "Warner Ranch" displayed along the monument wall; refer to Figure 1-7. The sign would be integrated into the community entryway, which would be constructed of stone pilasters and would incorporate two wooden gates to allow for the passage of vehicles to and from the development area. Landscaping would also be provided to define the entry and to enhance its prominence. The entryway would be constructed within the roadway median and set back from the main entry off of SR 76, and would therefore not be visible to those traveling along SR 76. All Project signage would be consistent with County design standards for monument signs and other signage information.  Roof signs or any sign extending above the highest point of a building, pole signs, temporary advertising devices and displays, and rotating, revolving, flashing, or moving signs shall be prohibited.

Project Component	Design Measure
Landscaping	The Landscape Design Guidelines proposed with the Warner Ranch Specific Plan encourage an overall design concept that visually enhances and blends with the surrounding built and natural environments. The Warner Ranch Specific Plan provides guidance for street tree planting; Primary and Secondary Themed Roads; landscape edge zones along roads and trails and at entry points and monuments; fire suppression zones, transition areas (ornamental to native areas); plantings along slopes; revegetation; and, retention of native vegetation and vegetation removal. The Conceptual Landscape Plan is shown in Figure 1-6B.
	The overall theme for Project landscaping is intended to create a visually-unified community reflective of both native and local landscape tradition that are respective of the natural landscape found within the surrounding area. All proposed landscaping plantings would be consistent with the County's landscaping requirements and measures included in the Warner Ranch Specific Plan, as applicable. Drought-tolerant, deer-tolerant, and native species shall be used wherever possible to minimize water usage and maintain the visual and rural character of the natural environment. An informal tree theme is proposed through use of informal shrub massing. Stands of riparian tree species would be emphasized within the natural riparian areas.
	The Conceptual Landscape Plan prepared for the Project (refer to Figure 1-6B) includes a variety of trees and other plantings to provide screening of views from SR 76 and other offsite public vantage points. Landscaping for the proposed Project would be utilized to minimize views into the site and to blend the development into the surrounding natural environment. Landscaping would be provided along the Project frontage and elsewhere within the interior to enhance the entryway and provide Project screening from offsite locations, in addition to creating a natural landscape that visually blends the development into the existing setting. Landscaping would also be used around onsite structures to visually reduce the surface area of larger buildings and enhance their appearance within the setting. In addition, landscaping would be provided within the interior of the property, along the private roadways, and within recreational open space areas to enhance views of the development and to reflect existing vegetation types in the surrounding rural community. Landscaping is intended to reinforce the form of the land, employing mounding and rounded planting forms when appropriate. Vegetation of varying heights and textures would be placed along perimeter walls and fences to visually soften hard planes by creating interest and variety.
Access and Circulation	The County General Plan Mobility Element classifies SR 76 as a 2.1D Community Collector. Direct access to the site would be provided from SR 76 via a central entry road. An all-way traffic signal would

Project Component	Design Measure
	be installed at the intersection of the main entrance and SR 76, and the proposed Project would also construct frontage improvements within the existing 120-foot wide Pala Road/SR 76 right-of-way. Emergency access would be provided by two roads near the eastern and western property boundaries with connection to SR 76.
	All onsite roads are proposed to be private roadways, designed consistent with the County's Private Road Standards, and the Pala/Pauma Subregional Plan, as well as the Community Design Element of the Warner Ranch Specific Plan.
	A network of hiking and equestrian trails is proposed throughout the site within the open space areas. Additionally, adequate walkways would be provided to encourage pedestrian movement and connect planned neighborhoods within the development. Parking lots, walkways, and courtyards would be designed to promote pedestrian and bicycle movement.
Grading	Project engineering design for manufactured slopes would be required to meet the requirements of the County's Grading Ordinance.
	The visible surface area of onsite structures would be minimized through grading and landscaping techniques and consideration of building massing, use of earthen berms, and/or use of plant materials to minimize the overall visual mass or bulk of such structures.
	As such, the Project applicant shall be required to prepare a Landscape Plan indicating varying plant types, height, density, and planting locations to ensure that all manufactured slopes onsite are replanted as appropriate to reduce visibility of such slopes from offsite public vantage points and to ensure long-term soil stability.
	As a Condition of Approval of the Vesting Tentative Map, and prior to the issuance of a grading permit or improvement plans in lieu of a grading permit, the applicant shall submit a Landscape Plan consistent with Figure 1-6B, Landscape Plan, showing vegetative cover on manufactured slopes. The Landscape Plan shall identify the individual lots on which manufactured slopes will be constructed and where landscaping will be required.
	Prior to the issuance of a grading permit, the Project applicant shall be required to submit grading plans to the satisfaction of the Director of Planning and Land Use that are in substantial conformance with the contoured grading shown on the Conceptual Landscape Plan.
	Refer also to Mitigation Measure MM VR-1, above, which addresses manufactured slopes.

Project Component	Design Measure
Lighting	All exterior lighting proposed with the Project would adhere to Division 9 of the County's Light Pollution Code, or "Dark Skies" Ordinance, to reduce potential adverse lighting effects on the Mt. Palomar and Mt. Laguna observatories. The Project would comply with Zone A lighting design requirements.
	The proposed Project would be subject to County design review, prior to issuance of development permits, as part of the "D" Special Area designator. The Project would require compliance with lighting design standards identified in the Warner Ranch Specific Plan with implementation of the "D" Special Area designator proposed as part of the Project zoning to ensure that all outdoor lighting is consistent with the character of the surrounding Pala community.
	Low-level lighting would be installed with the Project to allow for ongoing maintenance and purposes of public safety. All Project lighting types (e.g. landscaping, interior streets, private and public parks) and locations are shown on the Illustrative Street and Park Lighting Plan (as part of the Site Plan). Installation of Project lighting would be required to be installed with that shown on the Site Plan approved by the County to ensure that it would not adversely affect adjacent lands or the existing character of the Pala community.
	The height, materials, colors, and configuration of proposed lighting fixtures would be designed to blend with the natural backdrop to the extent practical and to avoid potential lighting impacts on adjacent land uses. All outdoor lighting would be designed consistent with County outdoor lighting standards and would be energy-efficient, shielded, and screened to prevent direct rays from reaching adjacent properties.
	Unique lighting features may be used to accentuate architectural elements, landscaping, entrances, or pedestrian areas; however, if proposed within visually-sensitive areas or adjacent to onsite open space, such treatments would be minimized to the extent possible. All Project lighting would be shielded to minimize the potential for glare or spillover onto adjacent ownerships and/or designated open space lands. Uplighting may be proposed for selected trees and landscape feature; however, such features shall be softly uplit with light sources that produce less than 4,050 lumens in light fixtures that are carefully aimed and fitted with glare shields and louvers.



































